TE WHARE WĀNANGA O TE ŪPOKO O TE IKA A MĀUI

VICTORIA
UNIVERSITY OF WELLINGTON

Business Research Report:

Opportunity Assessment and Decision Making Processes Undertaken When Considering Offshore Vocational Education and Training

By Richard Wanhill (300275696)

Business research report submitted to Victoria University Wellington as partial fulfilment of the requirements for a Master of Business Administration (MBA).

Supervisor: Professor Siah Hwee Ang

Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge all of the people who provided me with support and inspired me to complete this research.

Firstly, I would like to thank Jacqui Gibson for her continued support and patience throughout my studies. Thank you for listening to my ideas, for challenging my thinking and inspiring me to stay on task.

Secondly, I would also like to thank all of the interviewees for agreeing to make time available in your busy schedules. Without your generosity of time, honesty and support the research couldn't have been completed.

Thirdly, I would like to thank my research supervisor Professor Siah Hwee Ang. Your knowledge, time and understanding has been crucial. Your advice on direction, structure, timing, planning and delivery was very much appreciated. I would also like to thank Dr David Stewart, course coordinator, for guiding the way.

Without the knowledge, assistance and guidance of the above people I would not have been able to complete this work.

Executive Summary:

Globally, as the number of students choosing international education continues to grow, we are also seeing the rise of a fast growing subsection of international education, referred to as Transnational Education. Transnational Education is a shift away from the traditional international education market of recruiting students from their home country to that of the education provider's country. With Transnational Education, the model is flipped, with learners studying in their home country, whilst being awarded a qualification from another country.

UNESCO describes Vocational Education and Training as "educational programmes that are designed for learners to acquire the knowledge, skills and competencies specific for a particular occupation or trade or class of occupations or trades" (UNESCO, 2011).

New Zealand has a Vocational Education and Training system that is world recognised, with the teaching experience, skills, knowledge, programmes and infrastructure that could be of value to other countries, in particular developing countries in Asia.

This qualitative research project looks at how New Zealand education providers, in particular Institutes of Technology and Polytechnics (ITPs), assess opportunities and make decision when considering offshore Vocational Education and Training in the TNE environment. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with senior employees of eight of New Zealand Institutes ITPs, representing 50% of the New Zealand sector. Two international competing countries are identified, to compare and contrast approaches to the opportunity assessment and decision-making processes for offshore delivery of Vocational Education and Training.

This research project finds that there is differences between the way New Zealand education providers assess opportunities and make decisions, compared to the competing countries. From the literature review it determines that both of the competing countries have widely available formalised templates, decision-making tools, checklists and matrix, that have been developed for the good of that country's providers, when considering whether to go/not go offshore.

This research then discusses a number of key themes that came through during the semi-structured interviews. The development and use of widely available templates, decision-making tools, checklist and matrix is something that the ITP sector in New Zealand believes would add value, reduce risk and improve quality. The ITP sector would like to work closer with government agencies, and for these agencies to remove barriers to success and work with the sector as enablers. The literature review and the views of most of the interviewees identified the opportunity for the development of a model that is focused on lower level trades training for developing countries. When this is linked to New Zealand's Free Trade Agreements with Asia, it becomes a region of focus. The final discussion point looks at the value of the New Zealand ITP sector working closely with a central government agency to develop a joined-up approach that helps New Zealand education providers standout in the global market.

Contents

Introduction:

The original idea for this research project was born during a discussion with an Indonesian education official in Jakarta back in 2013. He said to me, "We look at international education (the recruitment of students to foreign countries) they same way we look at mining. It is an extractive industry, taking the best out of the country, often never to return". As the conversation continued he asked 'Why don't international education providers come to our country and help us develop our lower skilled workers, so that we can develop our infrastructure and our economy, this would be good for us and provides you with opportunities'. This discussion really resonated with me and inspired my thinking while preparing for this research assignment.

The original idea and working title for this research project was 'A review of successful New Zealand business models for the delivery of Vocational Education and Training in developing Southeast Asian nations'. The goal was to find out what business models New Zealand education providers were using for the delivery of trade based training in Asian developing countries, what was working, what wasn't and why?

Following the literature review process, it was discovered that there wasn't the available information from New Zealand providers to review business models. Further to this, being an employee of education provider, asking other providers for this information could have been difficult as in the current competitive market place, my employer would most likely be viewed as a competitor. The literature review also identified that a number of New Zealand's competitor countries in Vocational Education and Training (VET) had developed and were using templates, checklists, decision-making tools and risk assessment matrix, yet none of these products seemed to be widely available to New Zealand providers.

Therefore the research idea morphed in to the following: Does having a formalised set of templates, checklists, decision-making tools, risk assessment matrix and formal processes influence the chance of successful outcomes when assessing opportunities and implementing the delivery of offshore VET? Further to this, the research looked at the appropriateness of developing a shared set of tools for the New Zealand ITP sector that enhance the sectors global competitiveness and the value of a joined up approach for the New Zealand ITP sector'.

Literature Review:

What Is Vocational Education And Training (VET)?

The United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) define Vocational Education and Training as:

"Educational programmes that are designed for learners to acquire the knowledge, skills and competencies specific for a particular occupation or trade or class of occupations or trades. Such programmes may have work-based components (e.g. apprenticeships). Successful completion of such programmes leads to labour-market relevant vocational qualifications which are acknowledged as occupationally oriented by the relevant national authorities and/or the labour market". (UNESCO, 2011).

Throughout the world, there are many variations to the names, descriptions, acronyms and definitions used to describe vocational education and training (Ministry of Education, 2008).

Common international alternatives or variations include 'technical and vocational education and training' (TVET), 'vocational and technical education and training' (VTET), 'technical and vocational education' (TVE), 'vocational and technical education' (VTE), and so on (National Center for Vocational Education and Training, 2011).

For the purposes of this research, the term VET will be the overarching term used in the essence of the UNESCO definition, it generally covers all of the international alternatives.

International Education:

The phenomenon of international education is not new by any means. In the 1980's and 1990's international education was identified as a significant emerging service sector industry (Mazzarol, 1998). Traditionally, the majority of the international education sector has always been focused on the recruitment of international students to the home country of the host education provider.

In the global context, as the overall number of students who choose an international education continues to grow, we are also seeing a distinct change in the modes of delivery and destinations these students can use to gain a qualification. The difference between educational sectors, style of education, institutions and the landscape of countries are becoming increasingly blurred, new alliances both international and national are being formed, private and corporate sectors are becoming increasingly active as providers (Beall, 2013, p3).

Further to this, there is a recognised and fast growing subsection of international education that is often referred to as either Transnational Education (TNE) or international branch campuses. Due to the inherent international nature of TNE, there are a number of varying

definitions to describe it. The Education New Zealand Trust, now Education New Zealand (ENZ), defined TNE as 'the delivery of New Zealand's formal educational qualifications by New Zealand providers outside New Zealand's shores.' (Education New Zealand, 2007). The key differentiation of TNE from the recruitment of international students to the home country, is that with TNE, learners are located in a different country from the awarding institution (Wilkins and Huisman 2012). This means that education providers and their programmes are now crossing international borders, not students (McNamara et al, 2013).

Whilst there is a lack of robust global data of the scale and growth potential of TNE, generally evidence suggests that TNE will continue to expand and evolve on a country-by-country basis (McNamara et al, 2013).

Evidence of the fast growth in the TNE sector is easily seen, with recent reports from the United Kingdom (UK) showing that more students are studying for UK degrees outside the UK than inside (UK Higher Education Statistic Agency, 2013).

According to the Cross-Border Education Research Team statistics, there are approximately 254 branch campuses worldwide (C-BERT, 2015). The most prominent host countries being the United Arab Emirates, China, Singapore and Qatar, and the largest source countries being the United States, the United Kingdom and our closest neighbour Australia (Becker,2009).

Generally, the internationalisation of education and the growth in transnational provision can be seen as institutions responding to globalisation (Maringe and Gibbs 2009). As the world becomes more and more connected and economies continue to develop we will continue to see TNE develop as the mobility of capital, the mobility of goods and services and the mobility of people increases (Loveder 2011).

Furthermore, in the context of globalisation, TNE often flows from highly developed countries to developing countries (Naidoo, 2009), thus offering opportunities for the VET providers of developed countries to deliver services into developing countries.

This literature review has identified from a number of sources, that a clear reason education providers are busy settling up international branch campuses is related to the lack of public funding in the home country, therefore its is becoming necessary for education providers to secure alternative revenue streams (Welch, 2009), (New Zealand Government, 2011), if they wish to continue to grow and or remain relevant.

New Zealand Context:

The 2014 -2019 Tertiary Education Strategy (TES) is a guiding document that sets the NZ Governments long-term goals and strategic direction for the sector (Ministry of Education & Ministry of Business Innovation and Employment, 2015).

Furthermore the TES identifies 6 key strategies for how the sector will enable tertiary education providers to achieve the outcomes required. Priority Six of the TES identifies that New Zealand tertiary education providers should increase the value of educational services and products delivered offshore, whilst looking for collaboration opportunities with others where appropriate (Ministry of Education & Ministry of Business Innovation and Employment, 2015). The strategic intent of priority six is identified through the 'indicators of success', which are focused on increasing economic value through offshore delivery, using research and partnerships to develop emerging markets and education and people mobility, especially in Asia (Ministry of Education & Ministry of Business Innovation and Employment, 2015).

Education New Zealand (ENZ) was established as a New Zealand government crown entity with a core purpose, take New Zealand education experiences to the world for enduring economic, social and cultural benefits. ENZ sees its primary role in student recruitment, as a marketer of New Zealand as an education destination to international students (ENZ, 2015). In collaboration with its industry partners, ENZ is tasked with growing the economic value of New Zealand's international education industry to achieve the Government's Business Growth Agenda (BGA) target of doubling its current value of NZD $2.5billion to $5billion by 2025 (ENZ, 2015).

Recent ENZ work includes the development of sector road maps that aim to guide New Zealand's international education industry towards future growth and success, and the BGA goals for 2025 (ENZ, 2015).

The Government's Leadership Statement for International Education identified that, for New Zealand to achieve the BGA, education providers need to increase annual revenues from offshore education services to at least $500 million (estimated 10,000 students) by 2025, from a base of $100 million (estimated 3,000 students) in 2011 (New Zealand Government, 2011).

It has been identified during this literature review the currently New Zealand ITP's and Industry Training Organisations (ITO's) don't appear to be exploiting the opportunities in front of them. Of the New Zealand ITP's and ITO's that are currently working offshore, publically available information on what they are doing and how they are doing is noticeably absent.

New Zealand has a fantastic, world recognised VET system (Education New Zealand, 2014). We have knowledge, skills, IP and infrastructure that could greatly assist developing nations with their infrastructure development as well as offering international trade opportunities for New Zealand VET providers.

VET Focus On Developing Countries, Especially Asia:

The shift of economic power from its traditional base in the west to the rapidly emerging east is well publicised and widely discussed and is a key reason why New Zealand VET providers should focus their efforts in the region.

ENZ's strategic road maps identified a number of global mega trends that further support the focus on Asia. Mega trends include; changing demographics (New Zealand's aging population, Asia's younger demographic), shifting global economic power, growing wealth, growing middle class, mobility not migration, access to technology, climate change and the battle for natural resources, automation and urbanization (ENZ, 2015).

All of these trends will have direct implications on the demand for VET. As Asian economies mature and become more middle class there will be a greater demand for skills development in those countries. Further to this, as the economies of countries develop and people gain more access to resources, parents will have higher expectations for their children's education (ENZ, 2015).

In the Government's NZ Inc *ASEAN strategy | One pathway to ten nations, New Zealand's ASEAN partnership*, Prime Minister John Key made the following statement "The rapidly-expanding middle classes in Asia present opportunities for New Zealand businesses producing high quality goods and services." (*PM John Key to the ASEAN NZ Combined*

Business Council) (New Zealand Government, 2013). The strategy document also identifies New Zealand's Free Trade Agreements in Asia as providing a strong platform for growth for exporters of good and services. The strategy also suggests that the value of educational services should be doubled in the region between 2013 – 2017 (New Zealand Government, 2013).

Furthermore, it is important to remember that Asia includes nine of the worlds 20 largest populations (World meter, 2015), with approximately half of the worlds total population found in the region. Population size and density provides NZ education providers opportunities to scale up offshore delivery, in ways that cannot be achieved in NZ, Australia and the Pacific (Wanhill, 2015).

Another great opportunity exists for the VET sector, as a fundamental dynamic of economic development lies in the development and improvement of infrastructure and infrastructure development requires trained and skilled trades people. Alam (2008) notes that investment in education and training produces benefits to the individual and society as a whole in the host country. The return on investment for society is a skilled workforce that enables global competitiveness and economic growth, and the return for the individual is a better career path, increased earning and better quality of life. While at the same time VET providers get the opportunity to secure alternative revenue streams.

Opportunities:

The New Zealand Government identified that there was strong interest internationally for professional and vocational qualifications and that there was scope for significant growth if providers are responsive to demand (New Zealand Government, 2011).

Moreover, A number of organisations have predicted ongoing growth in the international education market of 6% until 2020 for the USA, United Kingdom, Australia, Canada and New Zealand (New Zealand Government, 2011).

It was also identified in a report commissioned by the ENZ Trust (2007) that New Zealand was well behind in terms of development compared to a number of our international competitors, in particular, Australia, Canada, United States of America and the United Kingdom. New Zealand's lack of development allows New Zealand providers the opportunity to learn from other countries experiences and mistakes, thus accelerating the market development period (Education New Zealand, 2007).

Agriculture / Horticulture Opportunity:

A significant opportunity identified during this literature review is in the area of agriculture and horticulture VET in developing countries. New Zealand has core capabilities and competencies, as recognised world leaders in this area, our skills and experience would be hard to replicate, and therefore provide a significant competitive advantage.

Education is identified as critical area for developing countries (of which Asia has many) and has for some time been an area of focus for the development community (Tooley, 2005).

When you consider the composition of labour markets in developing countries, they have a smaller percentage of people working in offices and factories and a larger percentage working in agriculture (Fields, 2010). This presents a significant opportunity for New Zealand in terms of scalability when considering market potential and population size.

Moreover the opportunity doesn't just exist for New Zealand education providers, there is a very real opportunity for the host country as well. Nikiko (2001) summed up the situation, saying that by properly training framers, the production of cultivation in developing countries, such as Bangladesh, could be doubled, providing the country the opportunity to meet local demand whilst also increasing exports. By educating and creating skilled manpower in different sectors of agriculture there is the opportunity to secure proper utilisation of a huge labor force (Alam, 2008), which in-turn could deliver phenomenal economic benefits.

Finally, interesting data from a 2013 Australian Government report into offshore VET delivery by public providers, showed that of the 49,740 students enrolled in offshore VET programmes, no students were enrolled in agriculture, horticulture and or environmental related studies (Australian Government, 2013).

Issues And Risks.

There is growing competition for international students from other English speaking countries as they pursue the revenue and academic benefits associated in TNE, countries such as Singapore and Malaysia are now entering the market (New Zealand Government, 2011).

As noted earlier, the delivery of offshore education programmes by New Zealand institutions is currently at a very low level, especially when compared to Australia. (New Zealand Government, 2011). New Zealand has some work to do if we want to be comparable to other major players.

Figure 1. Internationalisation of New Zealand tertiary education relative to Australia

Measurement	Australia	New Zealand
International students as a share of all higher education students	28%	13%
Offshore enrolments	76,446	3,054

(Source: New Zealand Government, 2011)

At times during the literature review process, there has been a sense that the size and scale of the opportunities has led to a 'gold rush mentality', with many players in the international education market. Garrett, observed that in many TNE operations there is a mismatch between the large scale of provision and the small amount of attention paid strategic planning and governance (Garrett, 2004). This lack of appropriate strategic planning and governance has led to financial losses being suffered by a number of education providers. For example, after suffering many years of financial losses, Monash University changed the thinking around its South African campus from market enterprise to de-facto aid project (McBurnie 2007).

These kinds of situations have led the Australian government and education providers to develop a number of publically available tools and resources, in an effort to limit the exposure and risks associated with VET providers going offshore. The Good Practice Guide for Offshore VET Delivery, identifies that its development was driven by a want to reduce the risks providers were exposed to while pursuing offshore opportunities (Foster, Council et al. 2011). Quality assurance procedures to enhance VET delivery offshore, is another report that looked at existing quality assurance mechanisms in Australia, and whether it was practicable to extend them to offshore VET delivery, and then reviewed what adjustments were necessary to make this extension (Collings 2006). Further to this Challenger TAFE released the Toolkit

for the selection and approval of offshore VET projects. The toolkit provides guides, checklists and report templates that support the decision making process when selecting offshore partners (Dollery 2006). In an excellent literature review on strategic alliances in education, Bannerman *et al.* (2005, p.52) provides a list of considerations, when deciding on offshore partners.

Further to the Australian documents, the British Council developed an opportunities matrix that provides an analytical framework for identifying countries with the most favourable opportunities. This matrix assesses factors such as policy environment, market environment and mobility to give an overall opportunity score (McNamara et al, 2013).

New Zealand has developed some documents including offshore delivery rules, and offshore delivery guidelines, which outline the requirements and rules for New Zealand providers to be able to deliver New Zealand qualifications offshore (New Zealand Qualifications Authority, 2012).

This literature review determined that New Zealand's (ENZ, NZQA) have been focused on marketing New Zealand as an education destination and on the rules associated with offshore delivery, education reputation and quality controls, and hasn't yet developed any toolkits, resources or assessment matrix that support education providers decision-making process for assessing opportunity and risks.

Further Considerations When Assessing Opportunities and Risks:

The literature review process identified a number of further considerations that New Zealand VET education providers should consider before embarking on offshore delivery projects.

Marketing:

Mazzarol's 1998 paper, Critical success factors for international education marketing identified 4 factors that are important for international education marketing; image, resources, coalition and forward integration (Mazzarol, 1998). Interestingly, another piece of literature identified that education, like other professional service industries had in the past, tended to eschew marketing as part of the their initial thinking (Morgan, 1991).

Strategic Alliances:

A consistent theme throughout the literature review process is that of international strategic alliances and the competitive advantage that can be associated with them. Porter and Fuller (1986), note the importance of coalitions to international marketing. There are a number of potential risks associated with the formation of strategic alliances, therefore care needs to be taken during the selection phase so that the nature and intent of the alliance is clearly understood and performance benchmarks are established (Pekar and Allio, 1994), (Dollery, 2006), (Foster, Council et al. 2011).

Cultural Dimensions And People Qualities:

Richards and Darren's 3-part study into offshore teaching and learning identified the importance of culture in the international education environment (Richards and Darren 2004). They used Hofestede's cultural dimensions framework, to identify the gaps and links between

cultural dimensions and a teaching and enterprise framework (Richards and Darren 2004). This study demonstrates clearly that there isn't a one size fits all model with TNE.

Moreover, it is also identified that the types of skills and competencies required for employees working on offshore education projects are also a very important factor when considering risk and opportunities (Wanhill, 2015). According to the Harvard Business Review article '*Making it Overseas*'; international success requires a global mind-set, which has three main components; intellectual capital, psychological capital and social capital (Javidan et al 2010).

Costs / Economics Of VET:

As it has been identified in this literature review, there are a lot of opportunities associated with offshore VET delivery. Mun (1999) undertook research into the economic costs associated with VET. Using an economic framework, his work shows that training costs are influenced by such factors as the technology of training, teacher costs and their determinants, programme length, extent of wastage, extent of under-utilisation of training inputs and scale of operation. Interestingly, he determined that in general, VET is more costly than academic programmes and pre-employment vocational training is more expensive than in-service training (Mun, 1999).

Delivery Models:

It is identified in this literature review that there is some variation around the different delivery models for VET. As with the terminology variation around VET, so to is there a lot of terminology variation around delivery models. Differences often occurred depending on whether they were the sender or the host of TNE programmes, at times different terms are describing the same thing. For example, what's referred to as a 'franchise' arrangement by a

sending institution may be referred to as a 'top-up' arrangement by the host (McNamara et al, 2013).

The British Council's, Going Global document (2013), identified the following definitions, which can be widely accepted as covering most delivery models. They are; International branch campus, franchise / twinning programmes, articulation agreements, dual / double degree programmes, joint degree programmes and validation programmes

Critical reflection / Summary of Literature Review:

It is clear from the literature that has been reviewed, that the TNE market is going through a period of strong growth and this is predicated to continue, at least in the mid-term. Furthermore there are identified opportunities for offshore VET delivery, especially for and in developing nations. With growth also comes increased competition.

Moreover the literature identifies financial pressure on education providers from reduced home country funding as the stimulus for some to enter the TNE arena. In New Zealand ITP funding for the Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) has reduced since 2010 (TEC, 2015). Further to this, in the New Zealand context the government is also very clear about wanting providers to be more responsive to market opportunities, whilst having lofty expectations for growth in offshore delivery, from $100million to $500million.

It is my opinion that in the global context, the above-mentioned factors has lead to a 'gold rush mentality', with some providers rushing out to market, failing to consider the risks in a systematic manner. With the gold rush comes failures, which inturn has lead competitor

countries like Australia and the UK to develop toolkits, resources and decision making matrix's to assists their providers with the go / no go decision making process.

To date it appears that there hasn't been the development of similar resources for New Zealand providers entering TNE markets. ENZ appears to be primarily focused on bringing students to New Zealand. It was surprising to find almost no publicly available information on ITP's and or ITO's delivering VET offshore, especially when you consider the market size and opportunities in Asia.

This review also identified a potential opportunity in for VET with agriculture and horticulture. New Zealand has the knowledge, skills, IP and infrastructure and importantly core competencies and capabilities that provide a genuine competitive advantage. Finally, marketing, strategic alliances, cultural dimensions, people qualities, costs, economics and delivery models all need to be considered in the context of TNE.

Research Design:

Research Question:

As mentioned earlier, this research was designed to look into the question: Does having a formalised set of templates, checklists, decision-making tools, risk assessment matrix and formal processes influence the chance of successful outcomes when assessing opportunities and implementing the delivery of offshore VET? Further to this, the research looked at the appropriateness of developing a shared set of tools for the ITP sector that enhance the sectors

global competitiveness and the value of a joined up approach for the New Zealand ITP sector'.

Methodology:

The research methodology chosen for this research project is qualitative research, with a positivist epistemological position. A positivist perspective describes experiences through observations and measurement. Positivism is founded on cause and effect relationships and outcomes. Therefore it is key to maintain objectivity during data collection and analysis (Thomas, 2014).

Other key principles of positivism and qualitative research are; reliability, validity, generalizability, reproducibility, conformability, dependability, authenticity, transferability and auditability (Stewart, 2014).

It should be noted that positivism contains elements of both a deductive approach and an inductive strategy (Bryman & Bell, 2011). For the purposes of this research project the qualitative positivism research is inductive. That being, the research does not start with a hypothesis to test, its starts with a series of questions. The knowledge is then arrived at through the gathering of facts that provide the basis for laws, (the principle of inductivism) (Bryman & Bell, 2011).

Further to taking a qualitative, positivist, inductive approach, this research also takes a phenomenology approach. Phenomenology is a philosophy that is concerned with the question of how individuals make sense of the world around them and how, in particular, the philosopher should bracket out preconceptions in his or her grasp of that world (Bryman & Bell, 2011, p18).

This approach was taken because as a researcher I was interested in hearing the detailed thoughts, perspectives and views of the interviewees in order to determine knowledge based on their personal experiences. As opposed to bringing a hypothesis and then testing it.

Method:

The method used for this research was in the form of a semi-structured interview that was expected to take between 60 – 75 minutes. These interviews were conducted with recognised experts from the ITP sector who have experience with the delivery of VET offshore. Ten experts were selected based on two criteria, their personal experience, that being they have first hand experience in the international education market. The second criterion was, experience of their ITP in offshore markets.

In an effort to gain a broad range of views, experiences and opinions, a variety of ITP's were selected, some from New Zealand's larger metropolitan cities as well as some ITP's from regional areas. This selection gave the researcher access to ITP's with a geographical spread from Auckland to Invercargill and a variation of ITP size.

All of the interviews were semi-structured. An interview guide was developed, which included a collection of interview questions under four broad headings.

- Personal and specific ITP experience.

- Opportunity assessment and decision making processes (ITP specific).

- Commercial, Financial and business considerations (ITP specific).

- ITP sector / industry wide questions.

Sitting below the four broad headings there were a series of more specific questions (appendix 1). These questions were available to be used as reminders and prompts, if the interview required more structure. The purpose of a semi-structured interview is to allow the interviewee to share their experiences and understanding of the subject matter. As a researcher I was most interested in collecting and recording their personal insights and experiences.

A copy of the semi-structure interview guide was available in advance to each of the interviewees, should they wish to view it. Some of the interviewees chose to take up this offer, others didn't. For those who took up the offer, the preview of the questions allowed them to gain a broad understanding of the upcoming interview and allow them some time to consider the questions.

Data Collection And Analysis:

The data was collected using two methods. All of the interviews were recorded, using an audio recording device (an I-phone). Hand written notes were also taken during the interviews as well.

Shortly after each interview was completed, the hand written notes and audio recordings were summarised and prepared for analysis, full written transcripts of the interviews were not required. As per the researchers Human Ethics Committee application the audio recordings may be kept in a secure location for a period of up to 12 months, after which point they will be destroyed and or deleted.

As previously indicated, it was expected that the interviews will take between 60 - 75 minutes. The two longest interviews lasted 68 and 74 minutes, the shortest interview was completed in 40 minutes due to time constraints of the interviewee.

The relatively small scale of the research allowed the researcher to analyse the data without complex techniques. The data was codified (grouped) into the main themes, which then allowed further detailed analysis. Analysis included, Etic – imposed by literature review, and Emic – inductive, emerging from the data as the researcher analyzed and reviewd the interviews.

Access And Interview Numbers:

Access to the interviewees was through a number of channels. Some of the interviewees and the researcher have had some prior contact via our current employment situations. The researcher also has a working relationship with a number of the CEO's of New Zealand ITP's and so the researcher used these relationships to gain access to the appropriate people. Further to this, the researchers colleagues and Education New Zealand recommended and provided contact details for other suitable interviewees.

The initial plan was to undertake ten interviews. Ten was been determined as a good sample size by the researcher as it allowed for a broad representation of the New Zealand ITP sector, in terms of size of the ITP (5,000 students to 20,000 students) and also location of the ITP (Invercargill to Auckland). It should be noted that there are 18 ITP's in New Zealand, so the initial sample size equated to 55% of the sector.

Analytical Technique:

Grounded theory was the analytical technique used in this research. As mentioned previously, the research data was codified and then analysed using a phenomenologists

approach. Grounded theory is commonly described as theory derived from data (Bryman & Bell, 2011). The central idea in grounded theory is that the development of theory comes from the data and that the process is iterative (Bryman & Bell, 2011).

The phenomenologist views human behavior . . . as a product of how people interpret the world. . . . In order to grasp the meanings of a person's behavior, *the phenomenologist attempts to see things from that person's point of view'* (Bogdan and Taylor 1975: 13–14, emphasis in original) (Bryman & Bell, 2011, p19).

Limitations with this research sit predominately with the researcher, that being their potential biases and his/her potential to influence the interviews. To mitigate these limitations, the interviewer has clearly identified his biases and identified a series of interview techniques that limited the influence the interviewer has over the interviewee. Techniques include, not interjecting, silent probing, avoiding jargon and leading questions. As noted in the methodology section of this document, objectivity is crucial.

Credibility Of Research:

All of the interviewees were selected based on their personal experiences and all are recognised subject matter experts in New Zealand. Further to this, the ITP's in which the subject matter experts work, are also the recognised as industry leading. Finally, the researcher has consulted with Education New Zealand regarding the relevance of this research and the credibility of the interviewees.

Planning:

The resources required for this research were relatively straightforward.

The interviews required an appropriate venue / meeting space, where an in-depth interview can take place without interruption and a detailed conversation could take place. The interviews also required an audio recording device and pen and paper for the interviewer to take notes with. The interviewees were all required to sign and a consent form (appendix 2). Prior to the interview, the interviewees were spent a letter requesting an interview (appendix 3), this was sent via email. Finally the interview required and interviewer and interviewee.

In some instances the interviewer travelled to meet with the interviewees, in one instance the interview was arranged to fit in with the interviewees visit to Wellington, whilst two interviews were conducted at a conference the interviewer and interviewee were attending. Finally two interviews were conducted over the phone and one via skype.

Response Rates:

Initially the goal was to interview ten of New Zealand's 18 ITP's. From the initial list of ten ITP's, nine responded and made them selves available, with one ITP not being available due to their busy workload. The nine respondents represent 50% of the New Zealand ITP sector. Six of the interviews were conducted face to face, of the remaining three interviews two were conducted over the phone and one was conducted via skype. It should be noted that one of the interviews included three staff members from the one ITP. For clarity, this group of three people is referred to as a single response. All of the interviews were recorded and listened to multiple times in the process of codifying and grouping the answers together.

Summary Of Responses:

Question 1: Interviewees were asked specific information about their ITP and their experiences with offshore delivery, including which countries they are delivering in, if they are delivering in Asia, their delivery modes and models.

Of the nine respondents, eight are currently delivering some sort of VET offshore. The one respondent that isn't currently delivering offshore, has done so in the past and plans on doing more offshore delivery in the near future. Of the eight who are delivering, five are delivering in South Asia, East Asia or Southeast Asia. The remaining three are delivering in the pacific islands, with plans to enter into the Asian market. Delivery models included partnerships, twinning, split delivery, cross-crediting, supported delivery and train the trainer programmes. Of the five ITP's delivering in Asia, only one ITP was delivering a full programme offshore with the rest doing split delivery, twinning, cross-crediting and train the trainer, predominantly with fly in fly out teaching staff.

Question 2: The interviewees were then asked specific information about their ITP on the identification and assessment of opportunities and the decision-making processes to get to a go / no go decision. The questions asked if they follow a formal process with specific written policies and procedures. The roles and responsibilities regarding the go / no go decision-making process, cultural context and what were the organisational conditions needed to be to be successful.

All nine ITP's stated that the majority of international opportunities came to them via existing networks, relationships with agents, their international market managers and directly from international institutes.

"*We get opportunities through our existing networks, we also get quite a few direct approaches from international institutes*".

"*Most of our international opportunities come to us organically, we aren't actively out there searching for international partners, but we do have our eyes open and have a serious look at the opportunities when they come our way*".

All of the ITP's stated that they went through a process when identifying and assessing opportunities. The described processes varied, but there were a few consistent themes. Most started with reciprocal visits of each other's institute and then development of a more formal relationship.

"*We start off by looking at how the two organisations programmes match, and then we invest time into building the relationship. This then leads to more formal arrangements as we build successive levels of trust*".

"*Following the initial visits and face to face meeting, we usually progress to an MoU, which is reviewed by our academic committee. As the relationship develops we then move to an MoA with specific programmes details*".

All of the ITP's undertook some form of due diligence, academic assessment and business case development process. One ITP said that they were currently developing a formal process for assessing international opportunities that the organisation will follow.

Political and cultural contexts were considered as part of the broader opportunity assessment and decision-making process. Cultural context appears to be considered using the lens of risk assessment. None of the respondents referred to cultural dimensions in regards to teaching and learning. To be clear, this doesn't mean that the respondents don't view cultural dimensions in regards to teaching and learning, but no one mentioned it.

"We consider culture in terms of risk, for example getting paid, terrorism, political complications".
"Culture and politics is part of the mix when assessing opportunities and managing risks".

When discussing organisational conditions, all of the ITP's referred to the requirement of the leadership team buying into the international strategy (CEO, senior staff and Council) as being crucial to offshore success. Many referred to human resource challenges around international development and the requirement of having a team focused on international business development.

"HR is often an issue, we don't have not enough people with genuine transnational business and education experience".
"You don't want to spread yourself too thin at home when pursuing international opportunities, its important to stay focussed on where you are the masters of your own programmes".
"Never call on core staff to drive new business, it's the old story...existing staff by definition have a day job and the night job always comes after the day job, this inevitably leads to delays".
"We have an international team focussed on recruitment and an international team focussed on international business development".

"Its really important that any international work is appropriately resourced up front".

Question 3: The third key set of questions looked at the financial business considerations and models. Were international projects purely commercial (profit making), or were there other considerations such as pipeline opportunities and how did return on investment time factor in to their thinking?

The results to this set of questions were more varied than the previous questions. Three ITP's clearly identified a strong focus on increasing organisational profit margins through offshore VET. There was further variation in what these ITP's saw as appropriate profit margins.

"We won't do anything offshore for an EBITDA of under 30%".
"Every project is initiated with targeted returns within two years".

Of the remaining group, the ITP's were split between making small profits offshore and the pipeline opportunities that come from developing relationships that bring students to New Zealand.

"Slightly better than breakeven offshore, but when you consider the pipeline it gets a lot better".
"We are not focussed on making a profit margin offshore at this stage, our current focus is on pipelining students into New Zealand, that's where we make the profit".

All of the ITP's interviewed saw big opportunities in the development of pipelines for students to come to New Zealand.

All nine of the ITP's factored in lead times for international partnerships to develop and become successful, all felt is was unrealistic to expect an international project to return a profit within one year, this only happened in exceptional circumstances. All factored in lead times of between 12 months and 3 years.

"It must wash its own face within two years, preferable after 12 months".
"It needs to be breakeven at the end of year one, returning a profit by year three".
"Sometimes it takes two to three years before a project can stand on its own two feet".

Question 4: The final set of questions was focussed on the ITP sector as a whole. Looking at how New Zealand compared to our competitors, what were the differences and why? Was there a need to develop sector wide templates, tools and checklists for assessing opportunities and would they add value? How could the sector grow its market share and was there value in having a joined up (NZ Inc) approach?

All of the ITP's interviewed agreed that New Zealand was lagging behind in offshore VET when compared to competitor countries such as Australia and the United Kingdom. The perceived reasons behind the lag varied greatly, but there were some consistent themes that came out during this set of questions, variations included:

• New Zealand being a small and isolated player in a large international market.

• Lacking scale.

• New Zealand ITP's being conservative and risk adverse.

• Lack of focus on internationalisation until recently.

• Human resource constraints.

- Barriers and constraints from New Zealand government bodies such as New Zealand Qualifications Authority (NZQA).

- The domestic financial viability of individual institutes.

- Current domestic funding environment.

- The level of financial risk that individual institutes get exposed to going offshore.

- A fragmented ITP sector with high levels competition in New Zealand.

- Leadership who are lacking in international experience (organisational governance).

- No coherent joined up sector wide approach.

All of the ITP's were aware, to varying degrees, of the good practice guides, tool kits, templates and assessment matrixes available through organisations within competitor countries, such as National Centre for Vocational Education Research (NCVER) in Australia, TVET Australia, TVET UK and the British Council. All of the ITP's thought that the having similar tools, good practice guides and matrixes available to New Zealand providers would be of value to the sector as a whole.

"These types of tools would be very helpful".
"We could definitely do with tools like that, we could adapt stuff that is already out there, modify it to fit the New Zealand context".
"If they help us be more successful offshore, then they would be great, especially given the current state of government funding".

Regarding the question, what could the sector do to grow it's international market share, a couple of main themes appeared. One theme was about the development of a long-term sector vision in areas where New Zealand ITP's are genuinely world leading and where the

sector has real strengths and expertise, such as lower level trades training. Another theme to come from the interviews was around the development of a New Zealand methodology for offshore education, a 'New Zealand way of teaching'.

"We need to work in the areas where we have real strengths and expertise. We should focus on vocational trades. The degree and post graduate market is really crowded".

"If we developed and agreed on a New Zealand approach to experiential learning, with all ITP's undertaking professional development and delivering in the same style and to the same standard, we could make some real impact as part of NZ Inc".

"We need to present ourselves as a more unified front, as the Australian TAFE's have done".

"We need a common front as New Zealand ITP's offshore, focused on areas of true expertise".

Another main theme was around getting better support from government bodies such as New Zealand Qualifications Authority (NZQA) and Education New Zealand (ENZ).

"It would be helpful if NZQA could worker closer with ITP's so that they could become an enabler and support the international education strategy".

"ENZ could lead the ITP sector in the development of offshore VET delivery into specific markets or in specialist subject areas".

"Currently the government bodies like NZQA seem to be focussed only on the rules around offshore education and aren't looking at the opportunities to support New Zealand providers".

"It often feels like its easier for NZQA to say no than to work with us to get outcomes good for our organisation and for the country, they feel like a barrier not and enabler".

"Good strong government support for real market development, not just marketing. The likes of the British Council are working government to government, and we need to do that too".

"The British Council adds huge weight to UK providers going offshore".

The final discussion point was around the value of having a joined up sector wide approach, a 'NZ Inc' approach. All of the ITP's saw value in this approach. Many noted that it is very hard for a small country like New Zealand with relatively small institutes to stand out in a global context. All noted just how difficult it is to collaborate well.

" Collaboration is really hard".

"We are keen to collaborate, but there needs to be a really clear structure of how you are going to do it, collaborations can go bad really quickly".

"NZ Inc is a nice snappy one-liner, but it needs to be about results not descriptions. What are the steps that get us to the overall goals?"

All also noted, that there have been many attempts at collaborating in the past and that unfortunately none of them have had long term success yet. Polytechnics International New Zealand (PINZ) was the example of a model that almost all thought came the closest to getting it right.

"There have been some good models, but no one has really cracked it yet".

"PINZ was a good model, and probably before its time, but it morphed into a delivery agent and started to compete with its partners".

"PINZ did a great job opening up opportunities but it then began to compete with New Zealand ITP's".

"PINZ was a great idea, but after a while they started working independent from the ITP sector".

"PINZ almost worked, it grew really quickly with the Bahrain project, then it morphed into being more loyal to Bahrain than the New Zealand ITP sector".

Discussion:

The following discussion takes a broad view of the findings from the literature review, then compares and contrasts them with comments from the interviews to identify new insights.

The Use Of Templates, Decision-Making Tools, Checklists And Matrix:

As identified in the literature review, the TNE market is currently going through a huge a period of growth, which is predicated continue, at least in the mid term. Furthermore in the context of globalisation, TNE often flows from developed nations to developing nations (Naidoo, 2009).

This strong period of growth has lead to increasing competition in the market and, in my opinion, a 'gold rush mentality'. With this mentality come increased levels of risk as education provider's rush into the market to get their piece of the action. The increased levels of risk come from being ill prepared for the complexities of offshore delivery.

"Offshore delivery is incredibly complex and it's really easy to get your self into a difficult situation".

As previously mentioned all of the New Zealand ITP's interviewed were aware, to varying

degrees, of some of the tools available in competitor countries. A couple of the respondents

had been in the position to use these tools in previous roles while working for providers from

these countries, and believed that they added real value to the opportunity assessment and

decision-making process.

"I've had the opportunity to use some of the tools and they are really good. They force you to

review all of the opportunities in a systematic way".

"I've used some in the past and they are really good".

The main concept behind these tools is to improve and or increase the chances of the home

countries education provider's success when heading offshore. For example the following

quote is taken from the introduction of the Australian Good Practice Guide for Offshore VET

delivery.

"The Challenges/Risks/Good Practices diagram outlined provides an overall framework for

the multiplicity of tasks which Australian providers need to do when planning and delivering

Australian Quality Training Framework (AQTF) programs offshore." (Foster et al, 2011, pg

4).

This quote, and many others cited during the literature review process, show that many of our

VET competitor countries have widely available tools that strengthen the position of their

providers as they head offshore, in terms of quality, risk, good practice and financial

sustainability.

When the interviewees were asked if they would like tools such as those available in other

countries, all said yes.

"It would be great if ENZ (or someone else) developed a set of frameworks that we could use to reduce our risk exposure, it would really help lead the sectors development offshore". "There is no need to reinvent the wheel, great tools are out there, we just need an organizing body such as ENZ or NZQA to adapt them to fit a New Zealand context".

As identified in the literature review, we shouldn't underestimate the importance of culture in the international education environment (Richards & Lee, 2004). Richards and Lee's study identified gaps and links between Hofestede's cultural dimensions framework with an enterprise-teaching framework. It clearly demonstrated that there isn't a one size fits all model for TNE and that different models needed to be developed for different cultural contexts.

Considering what these tools, templates, checklist and so on are designed for, identifying the challenges, reducing risk, showing good practice, it would seem logical that similar tools, templates and checklists, are developed for New Zealand providers as a ways to increase the chances of success offshore whilst maintaining quality. It would also seem appropriate that tools for understanding cultural dimensions and how they link to teaching and learning frameworks are investigated further.

The development of an easy to follow set of templates, decision-making tools, checklists and matrixes that follow a systematic, formal processes, would reduce risk and deliver consistency across the New Zealand ITP sector.

Government Agencies As Enablers:

The literature review identified one of the reasons education providers from many different countries got involved in TNE is directly related to the lack of public funding available in the home country. It is becoming necessary for education providers to secure alternative revenue streams if they wish to grow and remain relevant (Welch, 2009), (New Zealand Government, 2011). In New Zealand, the Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) funding for all tertiary education providers has remained relatively unchanged since 2008. Figures taken from the TEC website show that since 2010, TEC funding for ITP's has actually decreased from $664 million to $600 million in 2015 (TEC, 2015). When you factor in inflation and the increasing cost of living and cost of delivery, the funding reduction becomes significant.

Moreover, given the context of the Tertiary Education Strategy (TES), with priority six stating that New Zealand tertiary education providers should increase the value of educational services and products delivered offshore (Ministry of Education & Ministry of Business Innovation and Employment, 2015). When this is linked directly to the TES and the New Zealand Government's Leadership Statement for International Education, which identified that education providers need to increase annual revenues from offshore educations services to at least $500 million by 2025, from a base of $100 million in 2011 (New Zealand Government, 2011), it shows that ITP's are currently under increasing pressure.

This identifies that New Zealand ITP's are currently operating under constrained financial conditions at home, whilst at the same time being asked by central government to expand offshore. Further to this, many in the New Zealand ITP sector feel like central government agencies are a further barrier to success.

"By going offshore we are exposing our individual organisations to massive risks, which we are expected to absorb with no view on how central agencies can support us".

"We want to run full programmes offshore, but the costs (time and money) of compliance with NZQA is high and the process is really slow. These costs drive our price point up, which makes it even harder to compete, given the higher price point, especially against globally recognised big brands".

"We need to remove the blockages to deliver offshore, in particular NZQA barriers. These can add huge amounts of time, energy and costs. Delivery offshore with NZQA approval is hard to get and is really slow, time consuming process".

"It often feels like its easier for NZQA to say no than to work with us to get outcomes good for our organisation and for the country, they feel like a barrier not and enabler".

One of the most consistent themes throughout the interviews was the role that government agencies could play in achieving success in regards to the TES and the Leadership Statement for International Education. Most importantly all of the ITP's had a want to see government agencies as key enablers to their organisations individual success and the success of the sector as a whole. Many were aware of, and spoke positively of a working group set up with NZQA that is looking at the streamlining overseas approvals and were hopefully of positive results.

Considering the goals of the TES, the Leadership Statement for International Education and the current financial constraints of the domestic funding system, central agencies could work with the sector and individual ITP's to remove some of the barriers relating to offshore delivery. They could develop systems, processes and support structures that spread, and or share the financial risks associated with the complexities of offshore delivery. Further to this, if New Zealand is to reach the goals set out in the government's business growth agenda, then government should invest in its own agency or agencies so that they are acting as enablers for

the sector. Finally as noted earlier with the British Council, the weight of a country's

government leading international initiatives should not be underestimated.

Opportunities In Trades Training:

A key part of this discussion is the linking of the literature review to the ideas and discussions

from the interviews, that then lead to insights. For example if we link to the initial discussion

with the Indonesian education official (that inspired this research) to the literature review, in

particular, that TNE often flows from developed countries to developing countries. Then link

this to the consistent themes from the interviews about New Zealand ITP's focusing on our

strengths and areas of expertise. Combined together, this leads to an interesting proposition.

Should the New Zealand ITP sector be focusing on lower level trades training to low skilled

workers in developing countries? This idea acknowledges trades training is an area where we

have globally recognised strengths, especially when it is focused on areas of expertise, such

as the primary sector, maritime, construction and so on.

 "Everything we are hearing from governments offshore is that they require training in the

lower level qualifications. If the customer starts to talk about this, then we need to find a way

to deliver it".

"We should try and do more work in the areas of our real strengths, like vocational trades".

Most of the interviewees mentioned that this was an area they were interested in investigating

in more detail. Importantly they also identified that there were issues that needed to be

addressed in particular, around languages and teaching in English and the how the education

would be funded by the developing country. The literature review identified that, generally

speaking, VET is more costly to delivery than academic programmes.

Further to this, some of the interviewees identified that having an agency that worked closely with ITP's, bringing expertise, knowledge and knowhow when it comes to applying for development funding from the likes of NZ Aid, Asian Development fund and the World Bank, would add real value to the sector. Further to this the literature review identified that education is a focus of the development community (Tooley, 2005).

"We need resources and experience that we could all call on".

The development of a model that focuses on the delivery of lower level trade training, linked to the idea of developing a New Zealand way of teaching experiential learning, and better access to aid funding, opens up some genuine opportunities for the New Zealand ITP sector, particularly in the developing countries of Asia.

A Joined Up Approach:

As identified during the summary of responses section, question 4, all of the ITP's interviewed saw value in a joined up approach for offshore VET, with many stating that this approach would help New Zealand and its providers standout in a busy and congested international market. A model similar to the original PINZ model was noted as being worthy of further investigation. What the study revealed was that the ITP sector wanted an agnostic agency that was focussed on the growth for the ITP sector as a whole.

It is important to note that the New Zealand ITP, Wintec, now owns PINZ. Therefore PINZ as it currently stands probably isn't the appropriate delivery mechanism, especially when consideration is given to the comments from interviewees about the high levels of competition within the New Zealand sector.

"Our current competitive model is undermining progress right from the start".

Another example is NZED, a collaboration between 16 of the 18 New Zealand ITP's, to develop education business opportunities in India. Of note, not all of New Zealand's ITP's joined and the initiative was primarily funded by the ITP's themselves.

A number of interviewees mentioned the potential for the ITP sector and the government to co-fund the agnostic agency, while other suggested that the agency be 100% government funded especially when considering the current domestic funding constraints. They also mentioned that the agency needs to be focused on developing opportunities, government-to-government relationships, building skills and capabilities for the sector, and that it shouldn't make any profits in its own right.

"We don't want a repeat of the previous mistakes, where things start off good and then things change and competition shows its head again ".

Its focus needs to be on the developing a strong and globally competitive ITP sector that has the best opportunities to be successful offshore.

Finally, some respondents referred to Education New Zealand as potentially being that central agency but felt that ENZ wasn't currently delivering these services.

Conclusion

The literature review and qualitative study of nine of New Zealand's 18 ITP's investigated a number of areas and delivered a number of insights.

The study looked at nine of New Zealand's ITP's and their activity offshore, including delivery models and financial / commercial consideration. It also looked at the use of a formalised set of templates, checklists, decision-making tools, risk assessment matrix and systematic processes, and asked if these influenced the chance of a successful outcome when assessing opportunities and implementing offshore VET. Further to this, the study asked if there was a need for the development of a shared sector wide set of tools and if they would enhance the sectors global competitiveness. Finally the study questioned the need for, and the value of a joined up approach for the New Zealand ITP sector when delivering VET offshore.

As this study was qualitative, other themes and ideas bubbled to the surface during the interview process. These included how government agencies can act as enablers, opportunities for the delivery of lower level trade training offshore and the opportunity to develop a New Zealand way of teaching experiential learning.

The findings suggest:

- New Zealand ITP's are active offshore.
- Anecdotally, the interviewees believe that the use of formalised templates, checklists, decision-making tools, risk assessment matrix and systematic processes have a positive influence on successful outcomes, when assessing and implementing offshore VET opportunities.

- The New Zealand ITP sector has a want for the above-mentioned tools, templates, matrix and system to be developed for sector use. The use of such tools should increase opportunities for success, identify key challenges, while maintaining high quality delivery and reduce overall risk.

- The linkages and gaps between cultural dimensions and enterprise training and education, should also be considered carefully when entering different markets.

- The ITP sector currently sees some government agencies as barriers to achieving the goals of the Tertiary Education Strategy and the Business Growth Agenda.

- The ITP sector wants to work closer with these agencies to break down barriers, improve efficiency, develop systems, processes and support structures that increase opportunities and spread and or mitigate risks.

- A central agency approach, such as the British Council, is seen by the New Zealand ITP sector as adding 'real weight' to their competitors.

- Many ITP's saw our skills, strengths and expertise in our lower level trades training programmes as an area worthy of further investigation and consideration

- There are opportunities for trades training in developing nations.

- Having access to specialist skills, experience and knowhow in applying for and accessing Aid funding would benefit the ITP sector.

- The sector sees value in and wants to have more joined up approach, in particular an agnostic central agency that is focused on developing opportunities, government-to-government relationships, building skills and capabilities for the sector. The sector see this as adding 'real weight' to New Zealand offerings offshore.

Future Research and investigations:

This research study has identified a number of areas that require further research. Due to the size and style of this research study, there wasn't the opportunity for this to be included.

- Research on our competitor countries to see if the development and implementation of tools, checklists and templates for the successful delivery of VET offshore delivered positive tangible results.

- Research into potential models for the delivery of lower level trades training in developing nations.

- Further investigation into the opportunity, and a model, for developing a New Zealand way for the delivery of experiential learning. This work could include the development of cultural dimension and enterprise learning frameworks for specific targeted countries.

- Review and analysis of competitor countries, in particular Australia and the UK, to determine possible models and structure for government agencies to be enablers.

- Research into opportunities and delivery models where New Zealand ITP's, Private Training Establishments and Universities could work together to deliver a full suite of New Zealand education products offshore.

References:

Alam, G.M. (2008). The Role of Technical and Vocational Education in the National Development of Bangladesh. Asia-Pacific Journal of Cooperative Education, 2008, 9(1), 25-44.

Australian Government. (2013). Delivery of VET Offshore by Public Providers 2013. Retrieved from: https://internationaleducation.gov.au/research/TransnationalEducationData/Documents/2013%20Public%20VET%20TNE_Main_Report_FINAL.PDF

Bannerman, P, Spiller, J, Yetton, P and Davis, J (2005). *Strategic Alliances in Education and Training Services: A Literature Review.* Canberra: Department of Education, Science and Training. http://aei.dest.gov.au/AEI/Shop/Products/Publications/Publication3 53

Beall, J. (2013). The shape of things to come: The evolution of transnational education: data, definitions, opportunities and impacts analysis.p3. British Council. Retrieved from: http://www.britishcouncil.org/education/ihe/knowledge-centre/transnational-education/the-shape-of-things-to-come-2

Becker, R. F. J. (2009). International branch campuses. London: The Observatory on Borderless Higher Education.

Bryman, A., & Bell, E. (2011). Business Research Methods (3rd ed.). Auckland: Oxford University Press.

Collings, P. (2006). Quality assurance procedures to enhance VET delivery offshore: final report *Taking Australian vocational education and training to the world.* [Adelaide]: NCVER.

Cross-Border Education Research Team (*2015*). C-BERT Branch Campus Listing. [Data originally collected by Kevin Kinser and Jason E. Lane]. Retrieved from: : http://globalhighered.org/branchcampuses.php (20July,2015).

Dollery, P. (2006). A toolkit for the selection and approval of VET offshore projects: project report: final report. Taking Australian vocational education and training to the world. [Adelaide], NCVER.

Education New Zealand (2015): About ENZ, our role. Retrieved from: http://www.enz.govt.nz/about-enz/our-role

Education New Zealand (2015). International Education Industry, Strategic Road Map, Final Summary. Retrieved from: http://www.enz.govt.nz/sites/public_files/Industry%20final.pdf

Education New Zealand (2015). Educational Services and Products Sector, Strategic Road Map, Final Summary. Retrieved from: http://www.enz.govt.nz/sites/public_files/ESP%20final.pdf

Education New Zealand, 2007 Good practice in Transnational Education. Retrieved from: http://mams.rmit.edu.au/b0fsg6huol3q1.pdf page 3.

Fields, G. S. (2010). Labor market analysis for developing countries [Electronic version]. Retrieved [insert date], from Cornell University, ILR Retrieved from: http://digitalcommons.ilr.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1156&context=workingpapers

Foster, S., et al. (2011). Good practice guide for offshore VET delivery: January 2011. Melbourne, TVET Australia.

Garrett, R (2004) 'Transnational Delivery by UK Higher Education, Part 2: Innovation & Competitive Advantage', London: The Observatory on Borderless Higher Education. http://www.obhe.ac.uk

Javidan, M. Teagarden, M. Bowen, D. (2010) Harvard Business Review: *Making it Overseas.* Retrieved from Blackboard.

Loveder, P. (2011). Globalization and vocational education and training, In Rubenson, K. (Ed.), Adult Learning and Education (pp. 283-287), Oxford, Academia Press.

Maringe, F. and P. Gibbs (2009). Marketing Higher Education: Theory and Practice, McGraw-Hill Education.

Mazzarol, T. (1998). Critical success factors for international education marketing. The International Journal of Educational Management, 12(4), 163-175. Retrieved from http://search.proquest.com/docview/229189666?accountid=14782

McNamara, J. Knight, J. Fernandez-Chung, R. (2013) The British Council. The shape of things to come, the evolution of transnational education: data, definitions, opportunities and impacts analysis. Retrieved from: http://www.britishcouncil.org/sites/britishcouncil.uk2/files/the_shape_of_things_to_come_2.pdf

McBurnie, G. (2007). Transnational education : issues and trends in offshore higher education. New York, NY, New York, NY : Routledge.

Ministry of Education. (2015). *Tertiary Education Strategy.* Retrieved from: http://www.education.govt.nz/ministry-of-education/overall-strategies-and-policies/tertiary-education-strategy/

Ministry of Education New Zealand (2008). Technical and Vocational Education and Training in India. Retrieved from: http://www.minedu.govt.nz/~/media/MinEdu/Files/EducationSectors/InternationalEducation/ProvidersOfIntEd/Ind iaTVETrainingReport.pdf

Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade. (2015). *NZ Inc ASEAN strategy | One pathway to ten nations, New Zealand's ASEAN partnership.* Retrieved from: http://www.mfat.govt.nz/NZ-Inc/8-NZ-Inc-ASEAN/index.php

Morgan, N.A. (1991). Professional Services Marketing, Butterworth-Heinemann, Oxford.

Mun, C. T. (1999). The cost of vocational training. Education & Training, 41(2), 79-97. Retrieved from http://search.proquest.com/docview/237065226?accountid=14782

Naidoo, V. (2009). Transnational higher education: A stock take of current activity. Journal of Studies on International Education, 13(3), 310–330.

National Centre for Vocational Education and Training (2011). VET Glossary. Retrieved from: http://www.ncver.edu.au/resources/glossary/intro.html

New Zealand Government. (2011). Leadership Statement for International Education. Retrieved from: http://enz.govt.nz/sites/public_files/Leadership%20Statement%20for%20International%20Education.pdf

New Zealand Qualifications Authority. (2012). Offshore delivery guidelines. Retrieved from: http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/assets/Providers-and-partners/Registration-and-accreditation/Programme-approval-and-provider-accreditation/offshore-delivery-guidelines.pdf

New Zealand Qualifications Authority. (2012). Offshore delivery rules. Retrieved from. http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/about-us/our-role/legislation/nzqa-rules/nzqf-related-rules/offshore-programme-delivery-rules-2012/

Nikiko, S. (2001). Role of agriculture in development in Bangladesh. Dhaka, Bangladesh: Japan International Cooperation Agency.

Pekar, P. and Allio, R. (1994, "Making alliances work - guidelines for success", Long Range Planning, Vol. 27 No. 4, August, pp. 54-65.

Porter, M.E. and Fuller, M.B. (1986, "Coalitions and global strategy", in Porter, M.E. (Ed.), Competition in Global Industries, Harvard Business School, Boston, MA, pp. 315-43.

Richards, N. and R. Darren Lee (2004). "Offshore teaching and learning: an exploratory Singaporean study." The International Journal of Educational Management **18**(4/5): 260-265. tertiary educators operating or contemplating entry into Asian markets. [PUBLICATION ABSTRACT]

Stewart, D. (2015) – Lecture 5: MMBA 532 – Qualitative Research. [PowerPoint Slides]. Retrieved from blackboard.

Thomas, T. (2014). MBA Research Project, The Influence of Trust and Knowledge Sharing on Virtual Team Effectiveness. Retrieved from: http://researcharchive.vuw.ac.nz/bitstream/handle/10063/4562/thesis.pdf?sequence=2

Tooley, J. (2005). The Global Education Industry. IEA Hobart Paper No. 141. Retrieved from http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=681181##

Tertiary Education Commission (2015). About Institutes of Technology and Polytechnics. Retrieved from http://www.tec.govt.nz/Learners-Organisations/Learners/performance-in-tertiary-education/performance-by-type-of-tertiary-provider/about-itps/

United Kingdom Higher Education Statistics Agency, 2013. Higher Education Student Enrolments and Qualifications Obtained at Higher Education Institutions in the United Kingdom for the Academic Year 2011/2012 Retrieved from https://www.hesa.ac.uk/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=2667

United Nations Education, Science and Cultural Organization (2011). Revision of the International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED) (2011). http://www.uis.unesco.org/Education/Documents/UNESCO_GC_36C-19_ISCED_EN.pdf, p.11

Wanhill, R. (2015). MMBA558, International Business Paper, assignment 1. Retrieved from personal files.

Wanhill, R. (2015). MMBA558, International Business Paper, assignment 2. Retrieved from personal files.

Welch, A. (2011). Higher education in Southeast Asia: Blurring borders, changing balance. Abingdon: Routledge.

Wilkins, S. and J. Huisman (2012). "The international branch campus as transnational strategy in higher education." Higher Education **64**(5): 627-645.

Worldmeters.info (2015). Top 20 Largest Countries by Population, Retrieved from: http://www.worldometers.info/world-population/

APPENDICES:

Appendix 1: Interview Guide: Opportunity assessment and decision making process when considering offshore delivery of VET.

(1) The following serves as an interview guide for Richard Wanhill's MBA university research project.

(2) This guide is used to provide structure for the interview. However, as it is only a guide, it is likely the interview will deviate from these questions as each conversation naturally unfolds.

(3) Interviewees will be sent this guide prior to the interview to provide context and allow time to consider their answers – it is not expected that interviewees will have answers for every question.

(4) The commercial / financial / business considerations set of questions are optional as an interviewee might be uncomfortable with the information being discussed.

Interview Questions:
Personal experience / engagement / delivery (ITP specific information)

• Is your organisation currently engaged on the offshore delivery of VET? (if yes, which country / countries and for how long?)

• Are you involved in offshore delivery of VET in Asia? (if yes how did the decision come about for deciding on an Asian country/ies)

• Can you please tell me about what you are doing? Field of education, mode of delivery (class room, online/blended, on-job etc)

• What is the delivery model you are using? (EG Twinning, international branch campus, joint/dual degree, articulation, validation, fly in fly out, other)

• Is the programme delivered fully or partially offshore?

Opportunity assessment / decision making process (ITP specific)

• How do you identify and assess opportunities for offshore VET?

• Do you follow a formal process? If yes can you please discuss / describe the process?

• Do you have specific (written) policies / procedures that you use when assessing offshore opportunities?

- Once an opportunity has been identified, what is the decision making process to get from identified opportunity to the final go /no-go decision? What do you look for / look at?
- Do you use templates, checklists, matrix or the like?
- Is cultural of the host country and how our culture and the host country interact considered?
- What organisational conditions do you need to be successful? (Support of CEO, resourcing, organisational capability, reporting structure etc.)

Commercial / financial / business considerations (ITP specific, optional – ITP's can choose not to answer any of these questions)
- Are you engaged in offshore delivery of VET for pure financial gains (profit making) or there other reason / benefits?
- Is this profitable in a purely commercial sense, if yes approximate margin?
- Do you factor in a return on investment time line – EG invest now in developing a market for return in 3-5 years, if yes can you please describe?

ITP industry wide questions
- Compared to Australia and the UK, New Zealand is lagging behind in terms of offshore delivery of VET, why do you think this is?
- Are you aware that competitor countries have assessment tools, checklists, forms, and good practice guides for offshore delivery? Do you think these documents provide a competitive advantage?
- Is there a want / need for a set of widely available (in NZ) decision making tools, checklists and templates?
- What could the sector do as a whole that would increase / improve New Zealand ITP's market share of offshore VET?
- Do you see value in a joined up / collaborative / NZ Inc, approach delivery offshore? Please discuss.

Appendix 2: Consent form for Personal Interview

TE WHARE WĀNANGA O TE ŪPOKO O TE IKA A MĀUI

VICTORIA
UNIVERSITY OF WELLINGTON

Consent Form for Personal Interview

Personal Interview
CONSENT FORM

I agree to be interviewed by Richard Wanhill for the purposes of his MBA Business Research Project and consent to the use of my opinions and information. I understand that none of the opinions or statements that I make during the interview will be attributed to me personally, and that I may withdraw from the research before 1st October. I am also aware that the findings derived from this study will be published in the Victoria University Library and excerpts may be included in academic publications and/or academic conferences.

I have been informed of the purpose of the research and the confidentiality conditions.

I understand that raw data collected during the interview will only be available to the researcher, name, and his supervisor, Professor Siah Hwee Ang.

I have been informed that a copy of the research summary is available upon request

        Name: ……………………………… Date: …………………………………

        Signed: ………………………………..

If you would like a copy of the research summary please add your email/address below:

        …………………………………………………………………………..

Appendix 3: Letter Requesting Personal Interview

TE WHARE WĀNANGA O TE ŪPOKO O TE IKA A MĀUI

VICTORIA
UNIVERSITY OF WELLINGTON

Letter Requesting for a Personal Interview

XXXX 2015

{Name}
{Title}
{Company Name}
{Address}

Dear XXXXX

I would like the opportunity to interview you as part of my MBA Business Research Project. The research is concerned with the assessment of opportunities and decision-making processes for the delivery of VET offshore. The interview is designed to take between. 60-75 minutes. The CEO/Manager of (name organisation) has agreed to your participation in this research.

The success of this research is reliant upon your honest opinion so maintaining confidentiality is of the utmost importance. **Under no circumstances will the information presented during the interview be attributed to any one individual. The organisation will not be identified and your name and title will remain anonymous.** Interview tapes and transcripts will be kept in a locked office, and will be destroyed at the conclusion of the research. The research findings will be published in the Victoria University library and excerpts may be included in academic publications and/or academic conferences.

Victoria University of Wellington has granted ethical approval as a teaching activity and this project has been reviewed by the Course Coordinator and the MBA Programme Director.

With your permission the interview will be recorded. If you for any reason would like to make contact regarding this research please contact one of the following:

Richard Wanhill   027 289 9596   richardwanhill@gmail.com

Professor Siah Hwee Ang   (04) 463 6912   SiahHwee.Ang@vuw.ac.nz

Yours sincerely

Richard Wanhill

Appendix 4: Agreement for Employee / Student Relationship.

Agreement for employee/student relationship

Agreement between Richard Wanhill and The Wellington Institute of Technology (WelTec) concerning Business Research Project for the Victoria MBA programme.

This agreement is for the study of, **opportunity assessment and decision making process undertaken by Institutes of Technology and Polytechnic's (ITP's), when considering offshore delivery of Vocational Education and Training (VET) in Asia.** This research is being undertaken by Richard Wanhill. The agreement covers Richard Wanhill interviewing 1 staff member from WelTec.

I, Richard Wanhill have two roles, namely that of a student at Victoria University and that of an employee at WelTec. Therefore I will make it clear when I am operating as a student and when I am are operating as an employee. A plan and timetable will be submitted to the CEO of WelTec and the staff member being interviewed, outlining the access that is requested and the time that is involved. I agree to act professionally and with integrity throughout the research process.

The data collection and the research paper remain the intellectual property of Richard Wanhill.

I, Richard Wanhill will obtain written consent from staff before they are interviewed.

Signed:

Student: Richard Wanhill   CEO WelTec: Chris Gosling

Date: Date: