# Appropriating Stereotypes of Kin, Romance, and Gender

An Ethnographic Study of Filipina Migrants

Married to or in De-Facto Relationships with

New Zealand Men

# By Hollie Alexandria Doar

A thesis submitted to Victoria University of Wellington in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in Cultural Anthropology

## **Abstract**

Transnational marriage migration is an emerging area of interest in anthropology, and contemporary scholars have written extensively on the international movements of Filipina women who have married non-Filipino men. Extending this research into an antipodean context, this thesis is based on interviews with Filipina migrants married to or in de-facto relationships with New Zealand men. Through an examination of narratives of love and romance, identity, and kinship, this work highlights the ways participants undertook identity work in their interviews. In particular, this thesis reveals the strategies employed by Filipina migrants in constructing narratives in which they distance themselves from negative stereotypes, while incorporating more positive typologies into their identities. Stereotypes included Filipina women as mail-order brides, domestic workers, subservient wives, and good family members. These narrative strategies demonstrated the ways participants sought to control and manipulate stereotypes in order to present themselves as successful and virtuous migrants. This thesis applies current scholarship on identity work and stereotypes. It also contributes to literature on marriage migration by expanding a contemporary focus on participant agency through acknowledging how migrants utilise identity resources, in this case stereotypes, available in their host society.

# Acknowledgements

First and foremost I would like to thank my participants for so generously sharing their experiences with me. I hope I do them justice.

I would like to thank the Building Research Capability in the Social Sciences Network for their generous Masters Research Award. With this I was able to attend conferences, and also to support myself throughout the research process. A Small Grant from the Victoria University of Wellington allowed me to travel around New Zealand to conduct interviews.

To my supervisor Catherine Trundle, I am exceptionally grateful for your generous feedback and advice throughout this journey. Your support and guidance have not only helped me to knock my thesis into shape, but also to become a better scholar. My decision to come to Victoria University and study under your supervision has exceeded all my expectations, and I have not for a moment regretted it.

I was lucky enough to have a small army of proof-readers to assist me in the final stages. Thank you, Claire Norris, Mark Barrett, Cara Gledhill, Marita Hunt, Sonja Bohn, Hannah van Voorthuysen, Eleanor Riddick, Kim Dobson and Annemarie Doar.

The academic environment on the ninth floor of the Murphy Building over the last year has been the envy of many, and I am so grateful to have had the opportunity to be surrounded by such wonderful people. Thank you for all of the support, for sharing highs and lows of my research journey, and most of all for your friendship.

There are many, many people who deserve to be recognised for helping me throughout this process, but I only have space to mention a few. A very special thank you goes to Ryan O'Byrne, Lynzi Armstrong, Shona Jowett, Sonja Bohn, Jared Walton, and Kim Dobson for sharing with me far too much food and drink, for

making me laugh, being there when I needed you, and for shoving me towards the finish line when I felt like I wasn't going to make it. I really don't know what I would have done without you. Ele Riddick, thank you for the emails and chats. It is a comfort to know that despite the physical distance between us, I have a wonderful friend just a mouse-click away.

Last, but most certainly not least, I would like to thank my parents for their continuing unwavering support. For never failing to let me know that you are proud of me, for dropping everything to come and be there when I needed you most, and for generally just being the most wonderful parents anyone could possibly hope for.

Thank you.

# **Table of Contents**

Abstract	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Table of Contents	V
Introduction	1
Anthropological Approaches to Migration	3
Methodology	
Methods	
Participants	
Chapter Overviews	Authenticity
Explaining and Defining Love	
Global Influences	
Love among studies of marriage migrants	
Filipina marriage migrant studies of love	33
Care	
Trust	
Commitment	
Fate	
Authenticity	
•	
Chapter Two "Not a Typical Filipina"	55
Identity Work	55
Stereotypes	
Perceptions and Representations of New Zealand and the Philippines	
Filipina as Woman	
Filipina as Domestic Worker	
Filipina as Mail-Order Bride Concluding remarks	
Chapter Three Relatedness: Narratives of the Ideal Family	
Kinship in anthropology	
Sacrifice: The Role of Wives and Mothers	
Intergenerational Respect	
Care	
Choice and Obligation	
Concluding Remarks	
Contrading Itematic	

Conclusion	107
Limitations, Contributions, and Suggestions for Future Research	109
Appendices	112
Appendix A: Demographic Chart	112
Appendix B: Consent Form	
Appendix C: Interview Schedule	
Appendix D: Demographic Questionnaire	
Bibliography	120

# Introduction

This thesis explores the narratives of Filipina women who have migrated to New Zealand and married New Zealand men. 1 More specifically, I examine the way participants demonstrated and built their identities through narratives of love and romance, and how they constructed their identities in order to combat stereotypes that others held of them. Finally, I explore how participants incorporated notions of relatedness and the family into their self-representations. Overall this thesis asks how participants narratively controlled and manipulated stereotypes, and used them to present themselves as successful and virtuous migrants. In each chapter I demonstrate how participants strategically created and maintained positive migrant identities through the construction and manipulation of stereotypes. I argue that by reinforcing common typologies of Filipina women and either narratively distancing themselves, or incorporating them into their identities, participants were able to thus present a positive and continuous migrant identity.

My interest in international marriage migration began in mid-2009 while I was volunteering as a teaching assistant at a migrant women's centre in Hamilton.<sup>2</sup> The group consisted of women from diverse backgrounds, and topics covered tended to revolve around such shared subjects as childrearing, cooking, and marriage. A Korean woman in the class was married to a New Zealand man, and often brought their son with her to the classes. When I discovered that she had

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> 'Filipina' is used throughout this thesis to refer to a woman from the Philippines. I use 'Filipino' to refer to a male from the Philippines, or as a gender 'neutral' term. See Deidre MacKay's (2007a) work for historical background of the term. Other terms are 'Pinay' and 'Pinoy' which I do not use in this thesis. I use the broad category of 'New Zealand men' to describe the men interviewed for this project. While problematic, it is outside the scope of this thesis to explore the ethnic identity of the male New Zealand participants.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> I use the term 'marriage' here to describe a relationship that has been formally sanctioned by the state, and in some cases, the Christian Church. The term 'de-facto' relationship is used to refer to a long-term relationship where the couple have lived together for more than a year, but are not married.

met her husband via the internet I was surprised, as she seemed assertive and independent. I had subconsciously assumed, erroneously, that such wives would likely be submissive and dependent on their New Zealand spouse. The uncomfortable discovery of this assumption was a revelation to me, as I was unaware of the stereotype I held and believed myself to be very gender aware. I was able to conduct some initial reading due to a Summer Scholarship at The Australian National University, which led me to formulate the topic for this thesis.

The contemporary relevance of my thesis was demonstrated in February 2011 when New Zealand radio station *The Rock FM* held a controversial competition entitled 'Win a Wife'. The winner of the competition would receive a trip to the Ukraine and while there would embark on a romance tour.<sup>3</sup> A campaign was launched with the intention of pressuring The Rock FM into cancelling the competition. A letter written to The Rock FM by Wellington based feminist blogger Scuba Nurse, posted on her blog, outlined her opposition to the competition based on the understanding that the competition was encouraging the 'mail-order bride' industry as she saw it (Scuba Nurse 2011). The blog post contained images depicting 'mail-order brides': a picture of a box with a pair of a woman's stockinged legs coming out over the top, and a picture of a Filipina woman with stamps covering her mouth. She asks of the radio station, "Do you have any idea of the negative history of 'Mail order Brides'?" followed by three examples of women from Kyrgyzstan, the Ukraine, and the Philippines who were murdered by their foreign husbands (Scuba Nurse 2011). The conflation in this blog entry of Ukrainian romance tours and the mail-order bride industry, and the

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> A romance tour generally involves a group of men who travel to a given location and take part in pre-organised meetings with women in a date-like scenario. See for example work by Felicity Schaeffer-Grabiel (2005) who travelled with a group of American men on a romance tour to South America.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> This campaign was primarily internet based, and involved extensive use of social networking sites and blogs. A Facebook page was created, and protesters were encouraged to write letters of complaint not only to *The Rock FM*, but also to companies advertising on their station and website. While the competition went ahead, its name was eventually changed to the facetious title of: 'Win a Trip to Beautiful Ukraine for 12 Nights and Meet Eastern European Hot Lady Who Maybe One Day You Marry'.

use of images and instances of domestic violence against Filipina women provides a local example of the mail-order bride stereotype. This portrays marriage migrants as objects of sexual desire, and as an image of vulnerability and victimhood, which I discuss in the second chapter.

In examining the literature on marriage migration I found that there is very little work in New Zealand that addresses the migration of women from nations such as the Philippines and Thailand who marry New Zealand men, either as the purpose of their initial migration, or as an outcome of meeting someone in New Zealand after migration has occurred. Existing research has focused on motivations for migration, and has tended to employ the aforementioned stereotypical ideas of Filipina 'mail-order brides' (see for example Ramos 2001). This thesis aims to go beyond the exploration of migration motivation, to ethnographically fill a gap by exploring the lived experiences of Filipina migrants who have either married or entered into de-facto relationships with New Zealand men. I have followed the approach taken by researchers such as Nicole Constable (1997; 2003a; 2003b; 2005; 2006; 2009) and Lieba Faier (2007; 2009) who have examined the experiences of Filipinas who have married, or are intending to marry, Northern American or Japanese men, respectively. By taking this kind of approach, I aim to critique, rather than reinforce, stereotypical notions of transnational marriage migration experiences.

#### **Anthropological Approaches to Migration**

Levels of international migration have increased significantly in the last 50 years. Rahel Kunz (2008) states that, "The UN estimates that about 190 million people lived and worked outside the country of their birth in 2005, up from around 150 million in 1990, and 75 million in 1960" (161). As a result, anthropologists in the last few decades have become increasingly interested in the processes and experiences of migration, as the bounded notion of culture was challenged by approaches to culture that focused on its dynamic, mobile, and contested nature. In these earlier works migration was understood in terms of unidirectional and

permanent movements which were motivated by 'push' and 'pull' economic factors (Boyd 1989).<sup>5</sup> More recent literature has moved away from simplistic explanations and instead attempts to represent the complexities of the migration experience through theories on transnationalism and globalisation that focus on issues of identity and networks that are fluid across time and space. An overview of the key literature on migration, Filipino migration, and Filipina marriage migration is provided here to give an outline of the theoretical context out of which this research project emerged.

Early studies on migration viewed immigrants as making a single movement from their nation-state of origin, to the 'host' nation-state, where they would attempt to incorporate themselves into the new society to the detriment of ties with the old (Glick Schiller, et al. 1995: 48). According to Phizacklea (2000: 110), "Neoclassical economic accounts...saw the migrant as a rational decision-maker setting off with his or her suitcase to the country best suited to the maximization of their human capital." While these earlier accounts provided a limited understanding of population movements, they did demonstrate the agency of the migrant in the decision making process (see also Nonini 2002).

In Michael Kearney's (1995) review of globalisation and transnationalism in anthropology, he made clear the impact that these concepts had on anthropological research, even going as far as saying that transnationalism was "causing anthropologists to reconsider the validity of the culture concept" (556). Prior to, and a clear influence on Kearney's review, Basch, et al. (2003 [1994]), called for a rethink of migration studies, as they believed research at the time was too focused on migrant incorporation in the 'host' nation and lacked the depth of transnational realities.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> 'Push' factors were understood to include such influences as poverty, famine, unemployment, and family conflict that compelled migrants to leave. 'Pull' factors included the possibility of higher wages, the presence of family members, and images of a more 'modern' country that acted to entice a migrant to a certain country (Nonini 2002: 8-9).

'Transnationalism' as the term used in this thesis is understood as:

Migrants' successful manipulation of available resources to engage with multiple locations. A "transmigrant," therefore, is somebody who has acquired and maintained multiple relationships, be they familial, social, economic, organisational, religious, or political, during their lived experiences transcending the boundaries of nation states (Szanton Blanc, et al. 1995, as cited in: Ramirez, et al. 2007: 417).

The notion of the 'multiple' relationship is key here; migrants not only conceive of themselves in relation to the context of the nation they currently occupy, but simultaneously understand themselves as part of their nation of origin. This breaking down of boundaries between nation states is made possible through the use of modern technologies. Basch, et al. (2003 [1994]) developed a more comprehensive theoretical framework around transnationalism than previous scholastic work. They critiqued the notion of the 'immigrant' as a permanent rupture from the nation of origin. They argue that the term 'transmigrant' moves beyond perceptions of the single migration from one nation to another, and better incorporates the multiple relationships and ties that are developed between people in those nations (Basch, et al. 2003 [1994]: cf. Vertovec 2004: 280).

As anthropologists and other academics become more interested in the phenomenon of globalisation, theories on migration became more complex. Westwood and Phizacklea (2000) use the term 'rupture' to emphasise the

active decision-making processes of migration and the ways in which economic and cultural phenomena are creatively reinscribed in new settings and the ways in which the diaspora feeds economically and culturally back into the homeland, for instance, through remittances. The use of the term rupture also suggests the unfinished and

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> I have used ellipses in quotes from academic sources to indicate the removal of words or sections for the sake of clarity. In participant quotes ellipses indicate a pause in speech, and the removal of words or sections is indicated by ellipses within brackets, for example: [...].

discontinuous nature of both the migratory process and that making of national identities and nations (7).

They claim here to be attempting to 'disrupt' the earlier, linear, notion of migration in order to better explore migrant experiences. By acknowledging that the transnational migration process is never 'finished', Westwood and Phizacklea allow for studies of migration to be carried out long after participants have made the initial journey.

Steven Vertovec (2004) confirmed the continued relevance of transnationalism into the 21<sup>st</sup> century:

A look through the [transnational lens on migrant activities] shows clearly that many migrants today intensively conduct activities and maintain substantial commitments that link them with significant others...Migrants now maintain such connections through uses of technology, travel and financial mechanisms than ever before possible (970).

However, he also points out some of the flaws in transnational notions as they were previously understood. For example, as the belief that the relative speed of new technologies in getting messages to people, and the increased ability to travel, would lead to significant changes in transnational networks (972).

Theories of transnationalism see migrants as understanding themselves both from the point of view of the nation-state of origin, and also the host nation-state in what Vertovec (2004) terms 'bifocality'. This bifocality provides a lens through which transmigrants construct and understand their identities. Identity work here is a contrastive process, where migrants also compare the state of origin to the host country. This is a useful concept for my own research, as it is important to acknowledge the ways in which migrants consider themselves to be at once a part of New Zealand society, whilst still taking part in events in the Philippines. In the second chapter, I demonstrate ways in which participants constructed and

contrasted New Zealand and the Philippines in their narratives in order to further constitute their identities.

The discussion on transnationalism also resulted in a swathe of research conducted on diasporic communities, understood here as migrants of descendants or migrants from the same 'home' nation who are dispersed across space and time, yet share a common, yet dynamic, identity. Cohen explains that "a member's adherence to a diasporic community is demonstrated by an acceptance of an inescapable link with their past migration history and a sense of co-ethnicity with others of a shared background (Cohen 1997: ix). Participant constructions of identity were influenced by notions of what it meant to be a Filipina both in the Philippines and in the diasporic community in New Zealand. How this influenced their narratives is examined throughout this thesis, but most specifically in chapters two and three.

#### Filipina Transnational Labour Migration

A significant body of literature now exists exploring labour migration, particularly for Filipina migrants (for example, Aguilar Jr 2003; Amrith 2010; Bahramitash 2005; Constable 1997; Gibson, et al. 2001; McAllister Groves & Chang 1997; Nakonz & Wai Yan Shik 2009; Parreñas 2008b; Pe-Pua 2003; Shipper 2010; Silvey 2006). Despite the focus of this literature being somewhat divergent from marriage migration, it is important to explore such research as it encompasses many of the elements discussed in this thesis, such as the meaning of remittances and the maintenance of kinship ties across long distances. Since the 1970s the Philippine government has exercised a policy encouraging its citizens to migrate overseas and send remittances back to family members (Tyner 2009). In contrast to other settings such as the United States, New Zealanders do not hire reproductive labour in some of the senses explored in this literature, but do employ Filipina women as nurses in hospitals and retirement homes. Many overseas migrant workers are legally obligated to remit large portions of their pay

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> For a fuller discussion on the meaning of the term 'diaspora' see Braziel (2008).

(Tyner 2009). Much recent literature has focused on the experiences of these migrants. In particular I will outline the trend in research on female labour migration from the Philippines to so called "First World" nations such as the United States. Katherine Charsey and Alison Shaw state that:

Until relatively recently, migration studies have also tended to treat women's migration as primarily a consequence of male migration, and see women as merely accompanying or following husbands, fathers, or other related men...In response some feminist researchers have highlighted the existence of female labour migration, often predating the 'feminization of migration' that has been suggested as a global trend in migration since the 1960s (2006: 334-5).

They also point out that "the focus on such issues as remittances and transnational enterprise has, until recently, left the 'domestic' sphere of transnational practices somewhat neglected" (331). The 'domestic sphere' will be investigated in this thesis as a means by which to understand the lived experiences of my participants, particularly in relation to how it was deployed in their narratives as a means of identity construction. Furthermore, Deirdre McKay (McKay 2007a; 2007b) offers a bridge between economics and emotions. These two concepts are often presented as separate entities, a divide I also seek to cross in this thesis. In the following chapters I will use the concept of 'care', within which both economics and emotions are collapsed. These works are indicative of a move away from examining patterns of migration to seeking a deeper understanding of migrant identity construction. In her paper *Sending Dollars Home Shows Feeling* (McKay 2007b), Deirdre McKay explored intimacy and economic exchange amongst migrant families, and suggested that an account of emotion can enhance anthropological understandings of transnational mobility.

There is an important relationship between feminist scholarship and migration literature which is reflected throughout this thesis (see also Asis, et al. 2004; Pessar & Mahler 2003). Emotions have long been seen in Western society as the domain of women and the private sphere of home and the family (di Leonardo

1986). While emotional labour and domestic care has for centuries been outsourced in many contexts (Parreñas 2008b), a key difference in today's world is that due to its transnational nature, this kind of emotional labour is taken on primarily by poorer women who originated in outside nations such as the Philippines. Often these women have left behind their husbands and children in order to seek higher paying employment overseas than what is available in their home nation (Fresnoza-Flot 2009; Parreñas 2000). As a result, they too hire emotional labour in the form of nannies to provide emotional care to their own children (Parreñas 2000: 561). The focus of the aforementioned research tends to be on the social and economic factors that compel women to migrate, and the impact that this migration has on family members who remain in the country of origin (see also Sassen 2006; Wolf 1997). Rather than focusing on the effects of my participants' migration in their home society, I seek to understand how their personal experiences are conveyed and constructed through narratives of migration.

A relatively recent trend in this literature has been to demonstrate how women act as primary agents, arguing that they migrate independent of men due to the financial opportunity provided by transnational care economies. Charsey and Shaw (2006) argue that many of the women initiate 'migration chains', assisting family members to migrate to their new country of residence in order to be closer to them.

The issue of separation reaches to the heart of the repetitive nature of migration. In many of the cases presented here transnational marriage forms part of an evertransforming chain of migrations, with initial labour migrants being joined by spouses and children, who may also marry transnationally and then perhaps be joined by sponsored relatives. The emotional logic here is one of reducing distance by

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> As discussed in chapter one, this is part of a broader trend in feminist scholarship to highlight the individual agency of participants. See for example Laura Agustin's (2007) work critiquing the 'rescue industry' which has emerged in response to perceived sex trafficking.

migration, which simultaneously recreates distance elsewhere, leading to a desire for further migration, and so on (Charsey & Shaw 2006: 338).

Charsey and Shaw's argument that chain migration occurs due to affective ties highlights the importance of emotion in the migration process and is supported by the narratives of my participants. I extend their argument in this thesis by highlighting the importance of emotion in participant narratives of migration.

Remittances are a key focus of much research on Filipina labour migration (see for example Amrith 2010; Gibson, et al. 2001; Hochschild 2002; Keely & Tran 1989; Kunz 2008; Lianos 1997; McKay 2007b; Stark & Lucas 1988). It is widely acknowledged that the Philippines economy relies heavily on the remittances of its overseas workers. The importance of this is significant enough that James Tyner (2009) has an image of the Philippine Overseas Employment Administration on the cover of his book *The Philippines: Mobilities, Identities, Globalization.* According to Rhacel Salazar Parreñas, "34-54 percent of the Filipino population is sustained by remittances by migrant workers" (2005: 39). Jana Braziel (2008) outlines the significance of remittances to so-called developing nations:

Developing countries have become, perhaps, so financially dependent on diasporic remittances sent home by overseas migrant workers annually that national (or global) efforts to reduce international economic migration may have severe and deleterious consequences for the economic sustainability of those countries (41).

Like Braziel, many of the scholars I have discussed here focus on economic motivations behind remittances, but do not seek to investigate the lived experiences of migrants. In contrast, while exploring the emotional and financial ties that exist between my participants and their families back home, I seek to

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> The Philippine Overseas Employment Administration is the government body that acts the 'portal' to overseas employment opportunities for Filipinos (Tyner 2009: 3).

reveal how my participants themselves conceptualise, justify, and label such obligations.

#### Filipina Marriage Migration

Research on marriage migration over the last decade or so has also shifted from investigating motivations behind migration, and in particular structural restrictions on women's migration (for example Glodava & Onizuka 1994), to a deep questioning of the portrayal of female marriage migrants as victims and a demonstration of their individual agency (see Constable 2003a). Even more recently, research has moved from advocating the agency of female migrants to exploring what migration means to them and attempts to understand and represent their experiences (for example Bulloch & Fabinyi 2009; Faier 2007). By examining the way my participants have narratively constructed and negotiated their identities, this thesis falls into the latter category.

Nicole Constable's 2003 book *Romance on a Global Stage* was groundbreaking in its approach. Constable made the shift away from understanding marriage migrants who met their spouses online as being primarily influenced by market forces, or portrayals of such women as being 'bought' and 'sold' on the global marketplace. Instead she explores the motivations and understandings of the women and men who use online matchmaking services creating a more complex and nuanced ethnographic picture. Her book focuses on the processes of correspondences, rather than the actual marriages themselves. Importantly, she problematises the notion of the 'mail-order bride' industry, and locates understandings of this industry within the larger international sex industry. She roundly criticises the assumption that "mail-order brides" are a "singularly oppressed category of victimized women who are 'trafficked' and in need of rescue' (Constable 2003a: 4). Many of these stereotypes are perpetuated throughout feminist and development discourses, and are further explored in the second chapter of this thesis.

Bulloch and Fabinyi (2009) take up the subject of marriage migration in their paper that focuses on the "*idea* of transnational romance" in the Philippines (129). They look at how their Filipina participants construct the West and Western men as desirable partners, linking together ideas presented in literature on both marriage and labour migration. In their article they argue that Filipinos demonstrate a sense of inferiority when comparing themselves to America, which is understood as the "ultimate other" (133). This research offers a unique perspective into constructions of both correspondence maritime as it is understood in the Philippines, but also into Filipino construction of the West, and how they understand themselves in a paradoxical Self/Other relationship (Bulloch & Fabinyi 2009: 139).

Extending this approach to a different ethnographic context, I also demonstrate how a migrant identity relied upon stereotypes of self and other that perpetuate an oriental/Western divide. In her 2003 article, Nobue Suzuki outlines historical discourses of Filipina brides who migrated to Japan in "administratively mediated international marriages" that occurred in the mid-1980s. Women were incentivised by the Japanese government in order to provide men in rural areas with wives, thus ensuring that their population and way of life continued (Suzuki 2003: 400). By exploring migrant experiences Suzuki is able to question notions put forward by activist and feminist literature that portray these women as victims, and who conflate this type of marriage with prostitution (Suzuki 2000; 2004; 2007). Lieba Faier (2007; 2009) has also conducted research on unions between Japanese men and Filipina women who had worked in hostess bars. 10 She also focuses on the lived experiences of the women, and highlights demonstrations of agency as "situated within social, cultural, and politicaleconomic structures of power" (2009: 40; see also Nakamatsu 2003; 2005). These works are explored in more depth, and applied to my own participant data in chapter one.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Faier (2009: 42) is careful to point out that work in a hostess bar is not necessarily synonymous with work in a brothel. Bar work in this context involved entertaining men through conversation, karaoke, encouraging them to purchase drinks, and sometimes going on dates.

Hung Cam Thai (2002) discussed the example of a Vietnamese refugee living in the United States and his prospective marriage to a well-educated Vietnamese woman. Thai outlines the desires of Vietnamese women who have obtained high levels of education, noting that in order to do so they have remained unmarried and thus have become less desirable as a prospective marriage partner as they aged.

Thai argues that for highly educated Vietnamese women, the opportunity to marry a Vietnamese man living in the United States is taken up in the hope that her migration will allow her to take up employment opportunities that are unavailable in Vietnam, and that living in a more 'modern' society will mean that she will receive more respect from her future husband (2002: 233). Conversely, Vietnamese men living in the United States marry women that they believe will exhibit more 'traditional' values that they feel the Vietnamese diaspora have lost. The conflicting desires and expectations of the men and women in Thai's study also appear in Constable's (2003a) work. Throughout this thesis I explore how my participants portrayed their multiple expectations and desires in marriage and kinship, and how they justified their choices and described their experiences within their narratives.

Other marriage migration studies have focused on the effects differences in the cultural backgrounds of marriage partners have had on cross-cultural relationships. For example, Dan Rodriguez Garcia (2006) looked at patterns of endogamy and exogamy among Senegalese and Gambian immigrants and their Spanish partners in Catalonia. He argues that conflicts that arise from these "binational marriages" are less to do with "cultural clashes", and instead tend to be the result of "socio-economic, situational, and personal factors" (426). He also argues that by intermarrying and raising children, the couples in his research "necessitate dealing with multiple localisations (here and there), a process that involves accommodating hyphenated senses of belonging" (426, italics in original). In a similar vein, James Farrer (2008) has explored "patterns of intermarriage in the formation of a long-term community of Western expatriates living in Shanghai" (7). He investigates the role of 'cross-border sexual

relationships' and resultant transnational marriages in the formation of transnational communities. Farrer finds these relationships to be mutually beneficial in terms of the sharing of intercultural resources, such as linguistic skills and economic status

This thesis contributes to the literature on marriage migration through its focus on transnational relationships in the New Zealand context. Furthermore, the examination of the lived experiences of my participants as demonstrated through their narratives situates this research amongst the most contemporary research in marriage migration.

#### Methodology

Much recent scholarship is "devoted to understanding concrete social actors along with the specific contexts in which they organize themselves and their resources as well as create meaning in their lives" (Peletz 2001: 423). It is within the context of this scholarship that the methodology for this thesis has emerged. I have used a narrative based, interpretative epistemological framework.

I have employed interpretative methods in this thesis in order to gain a strong understanding of the lived experiences of my participants as demonstrated through their narratives. As Dvora Yanow states, interpretative research "begins from the presupposition that social reality is multifold, that its interpretation is shaped by one's experience with that reality, and that experiences are lived in the context of intersubjective meaning making" (2006: 23). Interpretative methods stand in contrast with positivist methods that perceive an objective reality that is able to be apprehended, understood, and explained (Bernard 1994). By using interpretive methods I acknowledge that data is produced and analysed by researchers situated in social and cultural worlds, and are influenced by particular academic worldviews, and therefore craft and utilise socio-cultural lenses through which such data can be conceived, collected, and interpreted (Willis 2007: 6).

Narratives can be understood as a mode of communication, or a verbal performance. in which the speaker tells a story (Alasuutari 1995; Bauman 1975). This performance, according to Baumann, "is situated, its form, meaning and functions rooted in culturally defined scenes or events" (3). In the analysis of narrative, the researcher must go beyond the specific details of the story, and also explore contextual structural implications (Alasuutari 1995; Byrne 2003). Bridget Byrne (2003) takes this further and seeks to utilise narrative analysis in order to better understand the construction of the self: "telling a narrative about one's life involves making oneself the subject of the story, claiming both intelligibility and agency for oneself" (46). Narrative analysis will be used in a similar vein in this thesis. I explore identity construction within participant narratives, as well as taking into account the structural context impacting on those accounts. In particular I acknowledge my own position as a young, educated, unmarried white woman and attempt to demonstrate awareness of ways in which that impacts on the responses of participants. This is in line with contemporary research on marriage migration above, and has allowed me to explore important themes as put forward by my participants in their narratives. I have also used this framework to examine how participants give meaning to their migrant lives and migration decision, how they create coherence in their stories of self, and how they craft key stories in their narratives in order to demonstrate ideal selves.

#### Methods

This thesis is based on qualitative research conducted between June and November, 2010. To begin this research, and in order to locate participants and gain further insight into the Filipino community, I conducted three meetings with individuals who had ties to the Filipino community in Wellington. The rationale behind two of these meetings was twofold. I was hoping that my contacts would put me in touch with potential participants, while at the same time aiming to provide them with the peace of mind that I was conducting research that would not harm the community. During the meetings both women emphasised the diversity of Filipinas, and the multitude of possible reasons for their migration to

New Zealand, statements that are supported by my final cohort. They appeared enthusiastic about my research and made attempts to assist with participant recruitment by sending emails on my behalf to contacts they had with Filipina-New Zealand couples. Despite their endorsement, I received few replies and recruited only one couple. At this point I was unsure why potential participants did not want to meet with me.

The third meeting was with a New Zealand woman and a Filipino man with whom I discussed my planned interview questions in order to avoid any offense or confusion during the interview process. I had been put in touch with Roseanne as she had previously been married to a Filipino man and had subsequently spent time in the Philippines. In the meeting she outlined some of the issues she felt she had faced as a non-Filipino woman attempting to be accepted by the Filipino community, and some cultural differences she felt might have affected my research. In particular she emphasised the sensitivity she felt, the community that she had previously been a part of in Wellington, felt towards the 'mail-order bride' stereotype. It became apparent that my position as a white researcher was most likely affecting the willingness of potential participants to speak with me. Despite my attempts to enter into the community slowly and with the endorsement of respected sources, it seemed that the fear that I was only going to perpetuate the stereotype was preventing participants from coming forward.

#### Recruitment process

Faced with this reluctance, the recruitment process took some time, and involved some difficulties. The primary method for the recruitment of participants was snowballing. I located participants through the networks of family members, friends, and fellow students. The majority of participants were recruited through the network of another participant. In this case the participant actively sought out potential interviewees after she had been interviewed, and also after we had spent an evening together at a community event and I had the chance to explain to her in detail what I was hoping to achieve with my research project. This development

of trust and rapport over time was key for my eventual successful entry into the field, and is also indicative of the power and influence of stereotypes in the lives of Filipina women.

#### Interviewing

I conducted eight semi-structured interviews with eleven participants between June and September 2010.<sup>11</sup> The cohort consisted of seven Filipina migrants and four New Zealand men. These interviews are supplemented with a small portion of participant observation conducted over a weekend in Nelson, where I had the opportunity to stay with a Filipina-New Zealand family, with whom I attended a meeting for couples consisting of New Zealanders and migrants, and also a non-denominational church service the next day. I also observed and participated in informal conversations with a range of people throughout the duration of my research.

I gave all participants information sheets and they signed consent forms. The interviews were informal and lasted between thirty minutes and two hours. Some notes were taken by hand; all interviews were tape recorded and later transcribed. Interviews were semi-structured and were loosely based on an interview guideline which covered topics such as: the immigration process, family connections and differences, community involvement, and potential experiences of racism. As I was concerned about the potential sensitivity of asking questions about the participants' marriages, I phrased the question about their marriage thus: "Do people ask you how you met your husband?" I found that this question, with some prompting, did indeed elicit interesting results. Other questions that were specific and closed such as, "Do you go to community events that are not for Filipinas?" were received with an air of confusion, and the question was generally glossed over quickly. I therefore learned quickly to ask broad questions that allowed my participants to chart the direction of interview narratives.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> See appendices for interview schedule and demographic questionnaire.

Three of the interviews had both partners present and five interviews were with individuals. In each of the interviews with couples there were segments of the interview where one partner left the room (for example, to have a cigarette, run an errand, or check on children). I let these moments occur as I wished to keep the interview relaxed and informal in order to aid the development of trust and rapport. I also found that the change in dynamic also elicited some interesting responses as the lack of a second person often resulted in a more coherent narrative, and at times participants adopted a more confidential tone and took the opportunity to say things that their partner might have disagreed with, such as remarks on what they believed was the ideal family formation. All names have been changed in this thesis for purposes of confidentiality. Pseudonyms were selected by the researcher.

#### **Participants**

While the majority of interviews were conducted in the Nelson region, I also interviewed participants in Whangarei, Wellington, and Hawera. This geographic diversity reflects the difficulties in finding participants, but also demonstrates that the experiences of Filipina migrants as explored in this thesis are not localised to as single area. Participants ranged in age between 34 and 53 years old. The sample also contains some social diversity: the marital background of the women ranged from women who had never been married to women whose previous marriages ended in divorce or annulment. The occupations of the women when they were living in the Philippines was varied; women previously occupied roles as teachers, midwives, legal secretaries, entertainers, and worked in the media and communications industries. Their employment situations in New Zealand were less varied. Two worked in nursing homes, one as a nurse, another in a role as a community worker, one self-employed on a part-time basis, and the other was unemployed. The men worked as dental technicians, as IT analysts, and at a meat works. There was also considerable diversity in the way the couples met, an

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> The ages of two of the male participants are unknown.

aspect which I explore in more detail in the first chapter. It is significant that in New Zealand these women have moved into roles associated with notions of care. It is also significant that all but one of the Filipina participants were tertiary educated. One woman had achieved bachelor's degrees in both the Philippines and in New Zealand. Two of the New Zealand men were tertiary educated, and the remaining two had finished some secondary training before leaving school around age 15.

All but one of the interviews were conducted in the homes of the participants. The other was conducted at the participant's place of work at her request. Six of the participants were married, three were in de-facto relationships, and two were unclear in their interview as to their legal status, but were living together as a couple. At least three of the participants had their first marriages annulled; two Filipina participants in the Philippines and one New Zealand man. All of the men had been married once before, and all but one of the men had children from previous relationships. Two of the men had five children to previous partners. One of the men was a grandfather. All of the participants were part of family units that had children. The three women who did not have children were in relationships with men who did. The construction of families and notions of relatedness are explored in chapter three. The time migrants had spent in New Zealand ranged from just over one year to fourteen years.

With this cohort I am not aiming for representativeness, but rather with a small sample, to examine the complex meanings, beliefs, and practices of my participants. By doing this I am able to reveal ways in which they constructed their identities, as well as notions of love and kinship in their narratives.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> In the demographic survey the participant wrote 'civil', but referred to herself during the interview as being married.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> I refer to participant ages as they were given to me at the time of the interview.

#### **Chapter Overviews**

In each of the chapters in this thesis I explore the way in which participants narratively construct their identities, in relation to broad stereotypes held of them as Filipina migrants who have married New Zealand men. The first chapter focuses on participants' portrayals of love and romance, revealing how descriptions of acts of care, trust, commitment and fate blur the categories of emotion and economics prevalent in earlier literature on migration. In this chapter I also argue that participants used romance narratives to portray themselves as in successful, authentic relationships, thus contrasting stereotypes which understand marriage migrants as marrying for pragmatic, rather than emotional purposes.

I expand on this in chapter two, where I explore the way participants narratively utilised and manipulated stereotypes of Filipinas as subservient women, domestic workers, and mail-order brides in order to present a positive migrant identity. I argue that participants reinforced, rather than denied, negative stereotypes in order to construct their identities in oppositions to them. Furthermore, I assert that by making a claim to 'not typical' Filipina identity, participants thus maintained a sense of continuous self-representation.

In chapter three I also explore how participants reinforced stereotypes in order to construct an oppositional identity. I demonstrate how, in narratives of kinship, participants contrasted a stereotype of the family orientated Filipina with negative perceptions of self-interested New Zealand family members. Participants incorporated this more positive stereotype into their identities. I argue that by doing this, participants were narratively creating a sense of moral superiority over the dominant New Zealand culture.

Throughout the thesis I demonstrate that participants consistently made claims to identities of successful and virtuous migrants, and did so through the control and manipulation of stereotypes in their narratives. I have highlighted the way participants undertook identity work by narratively distancing themselves from

negative stereotypes of Filipina women, and incorporating more positive typologies into their identities.

### **Chapter One**

# **Explaining Love: Narratives of Care, Success, and Authenticity**

In this chapter I argue that participants expressed the notion of 'love' as an integral part of their notion of an ideal relationship. Moreover, I claim that ideas of love are expressed in narratives through demonstrations of sacrifice, trust, care, fate, commitment, romance, and choice. Anthropological and sociological theories on love have tended to focus on two main themes. In a Euro-American context, love is explained and understood in relation to theories of individualism, and modern subjectivity (e.g. Beck & Beck-Gernsheim 1995; Giddens 1992). In contrast, anthropological theories of marriage in non-Western settings have tended to focus on the range of economic and societal justifications and approaches to marital relations that exist in a range of cultures and do not prioritise affect and individual satisfaction (Lipset 2004). Abu-Lughod (1986) shows, for example, that while emotions of attachment are present among Bedouin couples, their culture prioritises other qualities in a person such as duty, strength, and romantic attachment must be furtively expressed in poetry. In Western settings certain sectors of society deemed 'traditional' are also seen to view love differently (e.g. Bellah, et al. 1996). These approaches tended to polarise affect and economy along a Western and non Western divide, or along modern and traditional lines (for example: Goode 1959). Among studies of marriage migration scholars have often followed these divides, citing economic opportunities or emotional factors as motivations for migration (Beck-Gernsheim 2007; Cahill 1990; del Rosario 2005; Tyner 2009). Negative stereotypes, such as the 'mail-order bride' typology, are premised on such a divide. I argue in this chapter, and throughout the thesis, that by collapsing the dichotomy between emotions and economics in their narratives, participants challenge and distance themselves from the stereotypes and thus reinforce their identity as successful migrants in authentic relationships.

#### **Explaining and Defining Love**

#### Euro-American views of love

A key text in modern scholarship on love is sociologist Anthony Giddens' influential 1992 work, *The Transformation of Intimacy*, in which he proposes the emergence of categories of love within 'modern society'. Giddens charts the shift in expectations of gendered division of labour that has occurred as a result of women's and gay rights movements, as well as a growing sense of individualism, which, he argues has also led to a shift in the way in which people understand relationships. However, this work offers an unacknowledged, primarily Anglo-American focus, and is thus limited in its applicability to different cultural settings. He argues that Westerners in the modern era have moved from entering into relationships, and subsequently marriages, which they are bound to through duty and obligation, and instead enter into relationships of choice based on the ideal of 'the pure relationship'. 'The pure relationship', as Giddens defines it is:

A situation where a social relation is entered into for its own sake, for what can be derived from each person from a sustained association with another; and which is only continued in so far as it is thought by both parties to deliver satisfaction for each individual to stay within it (Giddens 1992: 58).

Giddens argues that Western societies are becoming increasingly individualised, and that this focus on individual agency is impacting on the way in which people experience relationships. <sup>15</sup> Individualism is seen as a key factor which differentiates Western societies from others, and is also understood as a signifier of modernity (Giddens 1991).

23

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Giddens (1991) further elucidates his understanding of individualism in his book *Modernity and Self Identity*, describing a move away from 'traditional' family life, and higher rates of divorce as people leave marriages that are no longer considered 'satisfying'.

Ulrich Beck and Elisabeth Beck-Gernsheim (1995: 6) also discuss love in relation to changing gender roles, and the increase in individualisation. Like Giddens they trace the path of love from 'traditional' to 'modern' society, from collectivist societies to individualistic ones, and even go as far as arguing that love can act in the place of religion in a post-Christian society (169). Modern love can thus be understood as a move away from the Christian Church:

Thanks to the Reformation, people were released from the arms of the church and the divinely ordained feudal hierarchy and into a social, bourgeois and industrial world that seemed to offer them virtually unlimited space to cultivate their interests and subjugate nature, using the drawing-board of technology (Beck & Beck-Gernsheim 1995: 5).

Also like Giddens, there was a distinct separation of the realms of love and economics, love was portrayed in the text as an emotional sentiment that exists separately from economic demands or requirements. I will argue in this chapter that this separation is a false one, based on deep seated notions of the Western distinction between public and private spheres in which public life refers to the rational and the marketplace, and private refers to the emotional and the domestic (Weintraub 1997: 2). While both Giddens (1992) and Beck and Beck-Gernsheim (1995) attempt in their works to define and understand what romance *is* and how it is expressed as an emotion in the West, my aim is to instead explore participant constructions and engagement with notions of 'love' and 'romance' as expressed in their narratives.

#### 'Traditional' love in the West

As outlined in the introductory chapter, each of the Filipina respondents categorised herself as Catholic. As it was apparent in participant narratives that Catholicism was influential in the way Filipinas understood love and marriage, it

is important to explore the notion of Christian love in order to provide a further framework for the interpretation of their narratives.

In their study of evangelical Christians in North America, Bellah et al. (1996) demonstrate that Christian love is closely intertwined with notions of obligation and sacrifice. They argue that partners sacrifice their 'freedom' as an individual and are obligated to care for their partner as required by marriage: "In the evangelical Christian view...love involves placing duty and obligation above the ebb and flow of feeling, and, in the end, finding freedom in willing sacrifice of one's own interest to others (95)." Bellah et al. continue:

Christian love is, in the view of its practitioners, built on solider stuff than personal happiness or enjoyment. It is, first, a commitment, a form of obedience to God's word...Most crucial in love are a firm decision about where one's obligations lie and a willingness to fulfil those obligation in action, independent of the ups and downs of one's feelings...Only by having an obligation to something higher than one's own preferences or one's own fulfilment, they insist, can one achieve a permanent love relationship (97).

Thus, sacrifice and obligation can be understood as core elements of Christian love in the United States. The sense of obligation to 'something higher' is also discussed later in the chapter when I explore the role of 'fate' in participant constructions of love.

Obligations are described by Bellah et al. as independent of emotion, but that it is the existence of these obligations that allows for the continuation and maintenance of the love relationship. While they are referring to this understanding of sacrifice and obligation as being a part of love specifically in relation to American Christianity, I argue that it can be applied more broadly. In this chapter I use the notion of 'care' in order to demonstrate ways in which participants explained their understandings of love and romance which expressed this kind of obligation and sacrifice.

Lieba Faier (2007) has also explored how the religious faith of Filipina migrants was an integral component of constructing oneself as a loving partner in her exploration of the love narratives of Filipina women married to Japanese men:

For Filipina migrants in Central Kiso all of who were raised Christian and the overwhelming majority of whom were Catholic, loving one's husband was part of a language and discipline through which a woman might craft a moral sense of self. Love was both how a woman lived as a good Catholic and how she maintained (to herself and to others; in a language translatable in the Philippines, if not through significant portions of the world) that she had an emotional interiority – in short, that she was both moral and fully human (Faier 2007: 155).

Faier's analysis takes us from the observation of Bellah et al. of love as 'something higher' than oneself as an integral part of a love relationship, and proposes that through the demonstration of love for their husbands, her participants are performing the role of a virtuous Catholic woman.<sup>16</sup>

Catholicism was introduced to the Philippines with the Spanish colonisation of the Philippines in the 16<sup>th</sup> century, eventuating in the adoption and implementation of Catholic doctrine at the state level (Tyner 2009: 12). This combined with the more recent colonial impact of the United States and the influences of globalisation have resulted in Filipinos straddling a complex and often conflicting line between notions of the 'modern' and the 'traditional'. Values regarding marriage and family held by Filipinos often reflect the nation's commitment to Catholicism. These are indoctrinated in legal statues which make divorce illegal, and

moral and ethical principles.

17 The terms 'modern' and 't

I use the term 'virtuous' throughout this thesis to express participant attempts to conform to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> The terms 'modern' and 'traditional' are problematic, particularly in that 'tradition' refers "a set of practices...which seek to inculcate certain values and norms of behaviour by repetition, which automatically implies continuity with the past", a past which lives only in the imagination of those living in the present (Hobsbawm 2003 [1983]: 2).

contraception difficult to obtain. Furthermore, the role of women as mothers and wives are understood in accordance with a conservative Catholic doctrine. (Constable 2005). Meanwhile, many women in the Philippines are leaving the domestic realm and are taking up opportunities to enter into paid work (Parreñas 2008a). This movement of women into work has coincided with policies for Filipinos to seek employment outside of the Philippines, sending back remittances to help their families and also their nation as a whole (Constable 1997; Parreñas 2005; 2008a; 2008b; Parreñas & Siu 2007; Tyner 2009). For my participants, their Christian beliefs meant that to some extent they too held a sense of obligation in love, and this is clear in their narratives. Christian love, as defined by Bellah et al., allows for care to not just demonstrate affect, but an integral aspect of love in practice. These acts and subsequent renegotiations of Filipina identity as well as claims of being a virtuous woman and migrant are explored throughout this thesis.

#### Anthropological theories of marriage and affect

While providing useful attempts to understand what love is, the Eurocentric focus of the scholarship of Giddens and Beck and Beck-Gernsheim limit the utility of their work in this study. Alternatively, anthropological theories on marriage and affect offer some cross-cultural alternatives. Owing to its status as one of the few cultural universals, marriage has been a keystone of anthropology for many years (Parkin & Stone 2004). The union of two individuals in marriage was often understood to form a basic function in kinship, particularly in the 'nuclear' family, as the site where families were created either through the birth of children, or the union of the families of each spouse (for example, Quah 2008: 13). In the last twenty years much research on love and marriage has moved away from describing the function of marriage in cultural structures and has instead increasingly focused on the lived experiences of those in or affected by the marriage (for example Breger & Hill 1998; Charsey & Shaw 2006; Constable 2003a; Faier 2009; Suzuki 2000).

As a result of this shift in focus, theories on emotion have become increasingly important. Lutz and White cite a tension between 'universalist' and 'relativist' explanations of emotion in anthropological research (Lutz & White 1986). The first explanation focuses on emotion as an internal state which affects all humans universally. Cross-cultural studies demonstrate this universality and are used to explore the way love is then manifested within those societies (Goode 1959). William J. Goode, for example argues that love is understood as highly desirable yet potentially dangerous in societies such as those in the United States, Northwestern Europe, and Polynesia, and thus it needs to be controlled (42). Alternatively, relativist explanations, "tend to define emotion as a more socially validated judgement than an internal state, and hence they focus their research largely on their translation of emotion concepts and the social processes surrounding their use" (Lutz & White 1986: 408; cf. Faier 2007: 149). Relativist explanations have been used to critique divisions between love and arranged marriages (De Munck 1996). By demonstrating that partners did in fact take into consideration the desires and emotions of their children when it came to choosing a suitable marriage partner, de Munck's work in a Sri Lankan Muslim community blurs the distinctions between arranged and love marriages. This critique is important, particularly in relation to my own work, as it adds weight to the argument that love is often not perceived as a separate entity to more practical considerations by many cultures.

In L. A. Rebhun's (1999) work on love in Brazil, she demonstrated how care and worry can be understood as love. She argued that love was considered by her participants to be between mother and child; other family members; friends and neighbors; and also pursuits of romance, marriage and sexual experience. Importantly, Rebhun problematised the distinction between emotions and economics:

People I interviewed distinguished between true (verdadeira) love and what they called "interests" (intereses): economic stakes in the object of love, saying that to mix love with economic stakes was to sully the purity of the sentiment. This idea, deriving from Biblical precepts as exemplified in First Corinthians 13:4-7, enjoys

widespread secular currency as well...However, in practice, love and economic interest cannot easily be distinguished. People show their love for family and friends by sharing material resources, presenting food, money, clothing, and services like labor and child care as gifts, without explicit demands for remuneration (Rebhun 1999: 148).

It is this demonstration of love through the sharing of resources that I seek to highlight in the narratives of my own participants in this chapter.

#### **Global Influences**

In order to better understand how understandings of 'love' might appear in a transnational context, I turn to Arjun Appadurai's 1990 work Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy in which he coined the terms 'ethnoscape', 'technoscape', and 'financescape'. Appadurai 'ethnoscapes' as a "landscape of persons who constitute the shifting world in which we live: tourists, immigrants, refugees, exiles, guest workers and other moving groups and individuals constitute the shifting world and appear to affect the politics of (and between) nations to a hitherto unprecedented degree" (Appadurai 1990: 325). 'Technoscapes' are the "the global configuration, also ever fluid, of technology and the fact that technology, both high and low, both mechanical and informational, now moves at high speeds across various kinds of previously impervious boundaries" (Appadurai 1990: 325). 'Financescape' refers to the increasingly complex and 'mysterious' global market (Appadurai 1990: 325). The notion of 'mediascapes', which refers to the 'refraction' of all of these 'scapes' through the media, provides a framework that can be used to consider the way in which the Philippines and New Zealand are conceptualised within the umbrella notion of globalisation.<sup>18</sup> Appadurai's model allows for research to go

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> The plotlines of *Cinderella* (Clements & Musker 1989) or *The Little Mermaid* (Geronimi, et al. 1950) are about individual freedom, and the ability to achieve romantic love in the face of

beyond cross-cultural comparison, to understanding the influence of globalisation on cultural understandings of love and romance.

In particular, the influence of Anglo-American culture on countries such as the Philippines can be explored through these mediascapes, which through modern technologies have a global reach (cf: Askoy & Robins 2008). The example of Disney films that are watched by children around the world can be used to demonstrate this point as films whose plotlines champion certain moral standpoints that may or may not reflect the standpoints of their culture of origin. 'Romantic love, in Giddens' sense of the term, comes through strongly in Disney movies. <sup>19</sup> Of course, it is important to acknowledge that, "the global is always imbued with local meaning, such that local actors, living their everyday lives at particular historical moments in particular places, mould the very form that global processes take" (Inhorn 2007: 139).

Marriage based on romantic love is portrayed as the height of achievement in these stories, reinforced by the words, 'and they lived happily ever after' (Constable 2003a). While I do not wish to overstate the influence of films such as those mentioned above, I present them as an example to note the ubiquitous nature of the romantic love story in Anglo-American cultures and its influence in the global mediascape and ethnoscape.

#### Love among studies of marriage migrants

Studies of marriage migration have at times treated love as an 'emotional motivator' for migration, but have neglected to engage with what love means to those they are discussing, nor why they might consider it to be a motivational factor (see for example Charsey & Shaw 2006; Constable 2003a; Piper & Roces

adversity. Romantic love in these films is portrayed as a force that is so strong that it conquers barriers such as class, family ties, and in the case of *The Little Mermaid*, being a different species.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> 'Romantic love' to Giddens "is a process of attraction to someone who can make one's life, as it is said, complete" (40).

2003). Researchers have instead directed their focus to the demonstration of agency by migrants, and challenging reductionist stereotypes held of them in both academic literature and in the public sphere. For example, Nicole Constable states that "[i]n contrast to many popular stereotypes and representations, women and men both exert a multitude of choices, compromises, and negotiations" (112-3). Alternatively, Jennifer Patico (2009) has highlighted notions of 'real' and contrived romance by participants and outsiders in her study of the Russian-American matchmaking industry. She notes that

the fact that international matchmaking is rarely portrayed as a complex amalgamation of sentimental and instrumental concerns, but rather tends to be discussed as either 'real' romance (especially by clients and agencies) or, more often, as something akin to human trafficking, suggests that this kind of definitional work is being done by both participants and outside observers (313).<sup>20</sup>

Other research on marriage migration avoids the topic of love altogether, or only engages with it superficially, and marriage is instead discussed in relation to gender division and difficulties faced by migrants in cross-cultural marriages (Breger & Hill 1998; Rodriguez Garcia 2006). For example Dan Rodriguez Garcia (2006) argues the importance of social class in determining patterns of endogamy and exogamy in his study of African-Spanish mixed marriages (426; cf. Curran et al. 2010). Elisabeth Beck-Gernsheim (2007) examines the motivations members of ethnic communities in Europe who seek spouses from their nation of origin, concluding that their motivations are loyalty and obligation to kin; upward mobility; and shifting the power balance in kin relations (279–282). Commercially arranged marriages are examined by Melody Chia-wen Lu (2008), who concludes that these marriages are not entirely motivated by

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> A large body of research exists on human trafficking. The portrayal of marriage migrants as trafficking victims is only briefly touched on in this thesis but has been heavily critiqued by authors such as Nicole Constable (2006), and Laura Agustín (2007).

economic factors, but rather the potential for increased employment opportunities upon migration, as well the cultural importance of marriage.<sup>21</sup>

Anthropologists have also considered ideals and hopes of transnational marriage prior to a marriage or relationship taking place by conducting research on the use of online dating sites, chat rooms and other internet based matchmaking services (Bulloch & Fabinyi 2009; Constable 2003a; Johnson-Hanks 2007; Venables 2008). In these studies women are described as using the services available to them in the hopes of finding a good match for them. For example, Jennifer Johnson-Hanks (2007) explains that "Young, educated Beti women now often say that they hope for a "modern" marriage, by which they mean a marriage that is monogamous, based on love, and eased by financial security" (648). Despite explaining that women are looking for a love based marriage, Johnson-Hanks does not explain within her article what love means for the women in her study. However, she does explain what women are looking for in a marriage, including reliability, commitment, and trust (650). In this chapter I argue that not only are these concepts important to my own participants in their portrayals of an ideal marriage, but that reliability, commitment, and trust are understood as an integral part of their conceptualisation of love.

Transnational marriages are also portrayed as a means by which migrants are understood to be accessing modernity (Patico 2009; Rebhun 1999). In her study of Senegalese women who used online dating sites in the hopes of becoming transnational marriage migrants, Emilie Venables (2008) states that:

The global North was attractive to the women I spoke to, both because of the economic and employment benefits it is believed to offer, but also because of how European men and relationships with them are imagined. They saw the possibility of replacing a town in which they had no employment or future prospects with a modern, European lifestyle and relationship. They did not imagine a life of domestic chores

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Chia-wen Lu (2008) briefly touches on love within arranged marriages, but maintains the distinction between economic and emotional factors, and it is unclear as to whether she understands love to be a primary motivation for engaging in matchmaking processes.

and petty trading, thus sought to migrate elsewhere where they believed life would be more prosperous (476).

Venables' exploration of global imaginings is a clear demonstration of Appadurai's *scapes*, discussed earlier, in that the women in her study envision themselves belonging to an idealised world that has been refracted to them through mediums such as the internet. Potential migrants thus imagine the modern world as accessible, and understand marriage as a means of accessing that modernity as conveyed through these scapes (cf. Bulloch 2009; Bulloch & Fabinyi 2009)

### Filipina marriage migrant studies of love

I found little scholarly work exploring Filipina understandings of love. Much research on Filipina marriage migration focuses on arguing against previously popular representations of Filipina marriage migrants as victims through demonstrating the agency of Filipina women in the marriage migration process (see for example: Gibson, et al. 2001; Suzuki 2003).

Nicole Constable (2003a) draws on fairytale narratives in order to explore love in her study of potential Filipina and Chinese marriage migrants, locating her participants' narratives in broader discourses of Filipina women and American men:

Just as Cathy Preston argues that Cinderella's classical body - fully clothed and attempting no explicit allusion to sexuality or lower body processes - is essential for the story to function as an American bourgeois fantasy, so, I would argue, does the fantasy of a Filipina marriage partner generally depend on a representation of her innocence and perceived respectability as opposed to an overt sexuality. Like the Disney Cinderella, prospective Filipina brides are often represented as poor, innocent,

young women who deserved to be rescued from menial labor and shabby clothes by way of marriage to a western hero prince (96).

While serving as a further example of the desire of the marriage migrant to access an imagined 'modern' lifestyle, this focus on representation and perception of Filipina women and American men does little to engage with Filipina understandings and demonstrations of love. However, some recent literature has shifted the focus from demonstrations of Filipina agency to a more participant centred approach. For example, Lieber Faier (2007) follows L. A. Rebhun's (1999) approach described earlier, and explores what love means to Filipina women married to Japanese men. In this work she demonstrates that her participants engaged with love as an element of transnationalism and relative modernity:

I focus on love as a term of global self-making: at once a language and a set of conditions through which these women articulated globally recognizable forms of agency and subjectivity within transnational relations of power. I argue that, when professing love for their husbands, Filipina women I knew in Central Kiso were claiming a sense of humanity, countering the stigma associated with their work in bars, and articulating a sense of themselves as cosmopolitan, modern, and moral women who possess an emotional interiority. In addition, I suggest that, by enabling these women to craft moral senses of self in their married lives, love also facilitated in their commitments to financially supporting their families in the Philippines and to becoming new citizen-subjects in Japan. Love was significant for them both because it engaged globally translatable languages of cosmopolitan and modern personhood and because it made the transnational ties of their lives possible (Faier 2007: 149).

Faier's statement is important because rather than looking for an essentialised notion of love as it is *felt* by Filipina marriage migrants towards their husbands, she is instead exploring how the concept of love is *utilised* within their narratives to both challenge stereotypes, but also to demonstrate their engagement with

modernity, and their sense of morality. She illustrates that love can be understood not only as an emotional entity, but also can be used as a narrative device through which identity can be constructed and performed. It is this utility of love within the narratives of my own participants that I will be exploring further in this chapter.

Like Faier, I do not seek to explain love as objective reality, nor do I focus on whether my participants are 'in love', but rather I explore how love is constructed and utilised in their interview narratives. I have attempted to be sensitive to my position as interviewer and audience, and the relationship I had with the participants at the time of the interviews. This was important as participants constructed their narratives in relation to what they believe my understandings of love and romance to be as a 'white Western woman'. In the remainder of this chapter I explore participant portrayals of love, romance, marriage, and de-facto relationships. I do this through examining key themes that emerged in my analysis of the interviews, care, trust, sacrifice, fate, commitment, and authenticity. The generation of themes from a 'bottom up' analysis allows for a deeper analysis of participant understandings.

#### Care

A key theme in participant narratives was the understanding that demonstrations of care were synonymous with demonstrations of love. Stories of acts of care were often given as evidence of a partner's feelings towards the speaker. I use the term 'acts of care' to denote behaviours described in interviews that are examples of when a person or group of people does something for another that is of benefit to the receiving party, and also aids in the maintenance of the relationship. I argue that 'acts of care' can also be a means by which the dichotomy between emotions and economics that remains in scholarship and popular discourses of marriage migration can be collapsed.

The narratives of Lisa and Noel provide examples of acts of care, while also demonstrating the one of the numerous ways New Zealand/Filipino couples meet. While I only give one example in detail here, it is important to note that the meeting of Lisa and Noel is not 'typical' for New Zealand/Filipino couples. In their interviews, participants were in fact keen to demonstrate the lack of typicality in the way they met their partner. The participants in this study show that there is in fact no 'typical' way of meeting. Where some couples met online or through newspaper advertisements, others met through friends and family members, or at their place of work in New Zealand. Noel and Lisa's story demonstrates most of the elements explored in this chapter; notions of love and romance, what is considered to be a 'good' relationship and what is not, and outsider understandings of what constitutes a genuine relationship and having to live up to those expectations. Some of the ways in which they distanced themselves from 'typical' stories and stereotypes of how they believed other participants would meet, and how they believed both New Zealanders and Filipinos would think they met, are examined in the next chapter.

Noel and Lisa lived in Wellington and had been married for seven years at the time of the interview. Noel was 49 years old, Lisa was 34 and together they have a three-year-old child. The couple met online rather serendipitously through an MSN Catholic group that no longer exists. Noel had joined the group to discuss his Catholic faith, and also as a support mechanism for his recovery from alcoholism. Lisa, meanwhile, was having difficulties with her then fiancée in the Philippines and joined the group to seek advice. 'How they met' was described to me by Lisa in an amusing and romantic anecdote. Lisa was eager to tell me the story, and showed me photographs of herself and Noel getting married and visiting her family in the Philippines during the interview. From this and her careful, fluent narration I gained the impression that their courtship was a story that had been told many times in the past. As well as demonstrating acts of care as love, Lisa's courtship narrative contained elements such as fate, commitment, and trust. Lisa's description of Noel's affection for her through acts of care serve as evidence for his love for her, as well as to demonstrate why Lisa considers him to be a better choice than her ex-fiancée. For Lisa, she has met the man of her

dreams and has entered into a marriage where love is demonstrated and maintained through acts of care.

Before meeting Noel, Lisa had been in a relationship with a Filipino man for seven years but was extremely reluctant to marry him. Lisa explained to me that their wedding was postponed or cancelled three times:

We were not meant to be. [...] I'm looking for a guy who'd be responsible enough so that my [future] children can look up to him. You know, this guy, [my ex], [...] he's [not worried if he has a job or not], and I'm teaching. [...] And working my butt out! [...] [Life] was just [...] easy peasy for him. So I told him how many times, 'oh you have to prove to me that you're ready [...] to settle. Otherwise, [...] it's not worth it.

Lisa's assertion that she did not wish to marry her ex-fiancée because she considered him irresponsible is telling. Despite what her feelings for him may have been, her unwillingness to enter into a marriage with him is based on her perception that he would not fulfil his martial obligation to support her. Even so, Lisa described to me feelings of uncertainty in her decision, and her resultant desire to seek advice and guidance from religious sources. She described meeting Noel as an innocent mistake by explaining that she could not speak to a local priest, thus justifying her decision to seek online support:<sup>22</sup>

Because we'd been boyfriend and girlfriend for seven years, [...] [my ex boyfriend] knew everyone that I knew. [...] We'd been very close for seven years. So I had nowhere to go to. [...] I ended up going to internet cafés to speak to a priest or a nun on a Catholic page. There was a Catholic group on MSN. [...] It's like chat rooms. [...] I was looking for a nun or a priest that I can talk to, just to assess my decision, [and] whether I was too idealistic [in what I was] looking for [in] a husband, and [...]

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Online chat rooms have been considered places in which deviant behaviour is prevalent, particularly in the early to mid-2000s. Microsoft announced that it was shutting down its chat services in 2003 amid concerns that paedophiles were using the service to meet and groom victims (Carter 2003).

not going through with the wedding we had at our house. And... I just didn't want to go through with it, and I told him to cool off. And so I started typing, looking for a nun or a priest and... his [Noel's] name popped up. He had a cross in his name. 'Cross', and then 'Noel'. So I thought it was a priest, clicked on him, clicked the name, [started chatting]. [...] You know, 'this is what I've done and you know this is my life'... and gave him all my life story and then in the end I said, "So Father, do you think that my decision was right?", and he said "Oh! Did you think that I was a priest?" [...] He was not a priest. So that started it. [...] So that's how we met.

Lisa also described her life while she and Noel were chatting online and had not yet met in person:

Noel and I met on the internet. [...] And he's being very persistent. My life there was teaching, and then internet, then sleep. [...] That's my life. [...] So, [...] we would probably stay online five to seven hours a day. [...] Where I [was] teaching is about an hour away from my house. So I would go [an] internet [café] [...] near where I teach, and I would travel an hour to get home. [...] He would wait for an hour and then he would ring when I get home, just to make sure I'm safe. [...] So that's how charming he was... so he was so persistent.

By contrasting Noel's caring behaviour with her ex-fiancée's unreliability, Lisa here demonstrates her understanding of love as care while simultaneously narratively justifying her decision to migrate to New Zealand in order to be with Noel. Noel's attentiveness to Lisa's wellbeing and demonstration through acts of care are utilised in her narrative as evidence of his affection for her. This also serves the purpose of proving to me, her audience, that their romance is 'genuine' – a theme which will be further explored later in this chapter. Care in this case is thus demonstrated through worry, preoccupation, persistence, and paternalistic protection.

Noel elaborated on the ways he supported his wife in his interview, explaining that due to ongoing civil unrest in the Philippines he was concerned for her safety while she was using a public internet café. Here Noel demonstrated that he cared for her by explaining ways in which he was able to use his economic advantage to keep her safe from what he understood to be a very real threat to her safety. Despite his physical distance, Noel was able to use his financial position to obtain Lisa a computer:

[...] During that year they had a bombing in the [...] international airport, [which] killed several people. And she said, 'no, I don't want you to come here [as it is not safe for foreigners].' I said, 'in that case, I don't want you contacting me using an internet café', which is where bombs would go off. [...] So I bought her a PC, so she could do it [continue the relationship online] from home. [...] And paid for a landline, so she could do that in the safety of her own home. [...] Because where foreigners gathered, is in internet cafés.

While Noel had originally intended on visiting Lisa in the Philippines, they decided that it would be unsafe for him to do so. Lisa describes her visit to New Zealand to meet Noel, and her reservations about whether they would "be what we are on the internet":

[Our first meeting] [...] was two years after we met on the internet. And I said 'all right, I'm gonna sign up another year's teaching contract [in the Philippines]. Just to show him that I'm not really coming here to marry him straight away. I'm just going to come here to meet him and his family. And then, I'll decide. [...] My purpose was to meet my boyfriend. And his family. And that was it. And so I stayed here about [...] three weeks. [...] They were all lovely. And [...] then at the airport [...] we were both crying 'cos we.. we obviously... we clicked! [...] [I felt that if] after we have met and [if after a year] we still continue what we were doing [...] it probably is

meant to be. [...] So... he waited. [...] And after a year I came back and settled. And that was it.<sup>23</sup>

This story demonstrated that, despite the fact that the couple met online, they did so in a way that has not been adequately covered by previously scholarship due to its focus on purposeful transnational romance meeting sites: hostess bars, romance tours, and dating websites. (for example Constable 2003a; Faier 2009; Patico 2009; Schaeffer-Grabiel 2005). Despite the intention of this type of research to challenge stereotypes of Filipina marriage migrants as 'mail-order brides', focusing on only a limited range of ways in which partners met it reinforces the idea that Filipina relationships with non-Filipinos only occur through premeditated means such as online dating. By describing their meeting story to me Lisa and Noel are actively using their narrative to normalise their experience, thus challenging negative perceptions of online romance.

Lisa and Noel gave examples of acts of care throughout their narratives. As discussed earlier, marriage migration studies have often assumed a distinction between economics and emotion, stemming from a belief that 'real' love is separate from the economic realm. Thus relationships, romantic or otherwise, where one or both parties cite economic factors as part of that relationship or motivation for coming together are understood as less legitimate (for example Ramos 2001). This is particularly apparent in research on the 'mail-order bride phenomenon' (Glodava & Onizuka 1994; Kim 2011; Ramos 2001). Lisa's explanation that she did not wish to marry her ex-fiancée because he was unreliable and unlikely to provide for her financially demonstrates her understanding that a part of what it meant to love someone was to demonstrate care for them economically.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> I interviewed Noel separately at a later date, and he told the same story but with considerably less detail in most parts, except for the moment of meeting which was covered with much technical detail regarding armed guards at the airport. This is possibly due to gendered differences in narrative styles (see Pinar 1997)

#### **Trust**

As noted above, an aspect of care was the notion of trust. Lisa's ex-fiancée's unreliability, and her subsequent refusal to marry him, can also be understood as a lack of trust in his ability and willingness to care for her. According to Diego Gambetta "[t]rust is a particular level of subjective probability with which an agent assesses that another agent or group of agents will perform a particular action, both before he can monitor such action...and in a context in which it affects his own action" (1988: 217). In other words, trust is the ability to predict future behaviour (Uslaner 2002). In reference to the 'pure relationship', Giddens (1992) defined trust as "a vesting of confidence in the other and also in the capability of the mutual bond to withstand future traumas" (138). These definitions are useful in relation to participant narratives regarding the importance of trust in their relationships, as it emphasises the future focused nature of intimate ties and the importance placed on the willingness and ability of a partner to provide care over time.

Research using the notion of trust with regard to relationships has tended to focus on trust in regards to commitment. For example, Cherlin (2004), takes a rational choice perspective and argues that a major benefit of marriage is "enforced trust" in his research on contemporary American marriage (854). Since marriage involves making a commitment in front of friends and family, which Cherlin describes as being less easy to break than the relatively private commitment involved in cohabitation, there is less risk in getting married as individuals are able to enter into the relationship with "less fear of abandonment" (854). Alternatively, scholars have discussed the issue of trust in relation to condom use and the spread of AIDS by married couples in Tanzania (Bujra 2000), and homosexual men in Norway (Middelthon 2001) and New Zealand (Worth, et al. 2002). Trust was also closely linked to commitment in this research, as couples 'trusted' their partners not to have sexual liaisons outside their relationship, and thus not cause them physical or emotional harm. Trust was expressed in a similar sense by my participants, who discussed the importance of their ability to believe that their partner could be relied on.

The following narrative provides an example of the future focused nature of trust. Melissa is 40 years old and lives in Nelson with her husband and three schoolaged children. In her interview Melissa described many acts of care performed by her husband. She explained to me that her husband took responsibility for, and organised her migration to New Zealand. He took care of the immigration process, paid for her first marriage to be annulled, and organised a house for himself, Melissa, and her son to move into when they arrived in New Zealand. Despite these acts, Melissa expressed apprehension regarding what would happen should the relationship not work out:<sup>24</sup>

[My son] was a year old when my husband met him. And my husband didn't have any children. He was single. [...] So when, when he met me... I [...] told him, you know, 'I have a son', I said, 'and I know you're promising so many things, really nice things,' I said, 'but, you know I don't want my son [to get hurt], if our marriage doesn't work, [...] [if he is] attached to you [...] [then] he gets hurt'.

Melissa's explanation that she did not feel comfortable remarrying until her future husband demonstrated to her that he could be trusted to care for her, her son, and any potential future children over time demonstrates the future focused nature of trust in participant narratives. Trust was understood by my participants as the predictable continuation of demonstrations of care over time. Participants demonstrated that it was important that their partner be faithful, reliable, and emotionally and financially supportive of them and their children.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Melissa expressed concerns in relation to her son, situating herself as a concerned mother, who puts her son's needs before her own. This can read as an appropriate and expected act of sacrifice for a mother, explored later in this chapter in the context of romance, and again in the third in relation to motherhood.

#### **Commitment**

The demonstration of trust, as articulated in the previous section, relates closely to commitment. Trust can be developed through commitment to another person. In this section I explore participant understandings and experiences of commitment to their partners as constructed in their interview narratives. Scholarship of commitment in relationships has predominantly focused on marriage. In this section I also focus primarily on the narratives of participants who were married, but I seek to develop an understanding of commitment that is inclusive of participants in de-facto relationships as well. In their study of long-term marriages in Norway, Swensen and Trahaug (1985) provide a distinction between commitment to the institution of marriage, in which people remain in a marriage due to a sense of obligation or duty, and a commitment to persons, where a couple instead understand commitment within marriage as being to one another (940) (940; see also Amato & DeBoer 2001; Quinn 1982). They term the latter understanding of commitment 'sympathetic person bonds':

Commitment of one person to another in marriage necessarily gains security in the relationship at the expense of denying intimate relationships with other people. People value the security that such a commitment brings but resent the restrictions on freedom that it produces. However, when this commitment is a sympathetic person bond, there is no ambivalence because the relationship with the person to whom one is committed is not replaceable by a relationship to any other person. This kind of relationship makes it possible for a couple to drop pretences and be open in the expression of thoughts and feelings. Thus, this kind of a relationship makes it possible for a couple to develop a greater intimacy than would otherwise be possible, because it is not necessary to erect defences against the possibility of being hurt by the other person (940).

This differentiation between commitment as obligation and commitment to each other as a choice relates closely to Giddens' (1992) 'pure relationship' whereby

couples remain together as long as it remains beneficial to both parties (137). However, despite many of the participants in my research having been divorced in the past, it was apparent that marriage was understood as an important and lifelong commitment that went beyond the notions of the 'pure relationship', and the 'sympathetic person bond' described here.

The importance of commitment to participants came through most prominently during discussions of previous relationships. The ending of a relationship or marriage played a large role in the lives of the respondents and greatly informed the expression of how they understood their situation at the time of the interview. Donna was 38 years old, and had been living in New Zealand, in a de-facto relationship, with her partner Clive for three years. She makes the following statement which demonstrates her understanding of divorce as she sees it in New Zealand:

Why is it so easy to decide to have divorce [in New Zealand]? [...] Easy to say, 'we split up.' [...] You don't think about the children. Cos when the parents' divorce, the one affected is the children. [...] Cos so many get divorce. It's just a very small thing [that goes wrong] then you split up, or you divorce. [...] So many couples are not really perfect living together but, you know they just think about the children, so they have, you know, to stay together just for their children.<sup>25</sup>

Religion also played a role in Filipina understandings of commitment. Divorce is not accepted in the Philippines by either the State or the Catholic Church (Constable 2003b). Donna's understanding of divorce is intertwined with social and state discourses in the Philippines. She expresses marriage as a life-long commitment and even if one or both partners are unhappy in the marriage they must sacrifice that happiness for the sake of the happiness of their children. As will be discussed in further detail in the following chapters, sacrifice for Filipina women is a means by which they demonstrate their identity as a good woman,

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> It is also worth noting that Donna made this statement without any prompting from me, and in the presence of Clive who has children and is divorced from his New Zealand wife.

mother, and in this case, wife. Thus, Donna's description of the importance of marriage acts as a means of enacting her desire to be a good Filipina.

Despite Donna's understandings that couples should remain married for the sake of children that were a result of the union, Constable argues that for some Filipina women transnational migration can offer an opportunity to leave a marriage that was not working (Constable 2003b). It is common and generally accepted that Filipino men may take on a mistress, as long as they do not neglect their responsibility to financially provide for their legal wife and any children from that marriage (Lauser 2008; cf. Lewinson 2006). Lauser (2008) writes that Filipinas whose husbands are having extramarital affairs are looked on with pity, as they were unable to hold the attentions of their husbands (91). Only by leaving the Philippines are women able to break their commitment to their husbands. Thus while the ideal of marriage is lifelong commitment, in the sense explored by Bellah et al.'s (1996) research on Christian love, there are strategies and social circumstances that allow these rules to be transgressed. This demonstrates that social norms and ideals and social practices are at times divergent (cf. Constable 2003b).

Jennifer, 43, had been "happily" married to her husband Michael for three years when I interviewed them together in their home. Jennifer told me of friends and family members actively encouraging her to leave the Philippines to get away from her previous marriage:

I was having a rough, um, time back in the Philippines with my previous marriage. And my brother [...] said 'why don't you come over [to New Zealand] [...] for a vacation'. [At] the same time another best friend was saying, 'can you come to, to San Diego?' [...] Yeah, a lot of things were falling into place where, I was being pulled *out* of the Philippines by friends and family because they knew that I was going through a rough time. And they were saying, '[...] just come here for a vacation'. And, it was, to a degree [...] bad enough for them to offer me, 'I'm

sending you a ticket, just come!' [...] So, I took my brother's offer, I came here for [...] was it a month? And then I went to San Diego for five months.

Jennifer's narrative demonstrates that despite the ideal of marriage as a lifetime commitment in the Philippines, there are circumstances under which family and friends will encourage separation and provide support in the event of marital problems. Because women are unable to access divorce in the Philippines, many travel outside of the country in order to leave their relationship (Constable 2003b). Divorce granted outside of the Philippines is also not legally recognised in the Philippines, so a woman who later remarries, and subsequently brings her husband to the Philippines is at risk of being charged with bigamy (Constable 2003b: 165). In some circumstances it is possible for marriages to be annulled, but Nicole Constable explains that "despite its existence...annulment is difficult and expensive to obtain and most often resorted to by the privileged, rich, and famous, but not by ordinary people" (Constable 2003b: 165-6).

Melissa's first marriage was to a Japanese man who, upon encountering financial problems, returned to Japan not long after they were married. Due to problems with her passport, Melissa was unable to accompany him. By the time the paperwork was organised she had heard rumours that he had met another woman, and decided to remain in the Philippines.

I had a previous marriage, which didn't work. And, in the Philippines, you get married, you get annulled. There's no divorce. And annulment there takes seven years. [...] And very expensive. [...] So. I had a son. I'm happy. I don't want another marriage 'cos I can't get married. [...] Anyone who wants to marry me has to, you know wait, or has to have money to... set me free, you know. And [my husband] did everything. He was ready to do everything. [...] He said, 'I don't care how much, I just want you free'.

limited.

46

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Filipino men are also unable to escape marital ties, but as Constable (2003b) and Lauser (2008) point out, a higher level of social tolerance for male infidelity means that their options are less

Melissa's experience provides an example of the difficulties faced by those who remain legally bound to a marriage despite partners having little or no contact with one another. Here the commitment to the institution of marriage was imposed upon her by the state, regardless of the fact that her commitment to her husband and his to her had long since diminished. By framing the marriage as a form of entrapment from which her New Zealand husband was able to rescue her, Melissa also hints at orientalist ideas of female subservience in the Philippines. these narrative are explored further in chapter two.

Conversely, divorce is legal in New Zealand and marriage is understood by the state as a legal commitment between two people which can be reversed. Despite having the option to obtain a divorce, as a practising Catholic Noel felt that it was important that the dissolution of his commitment to his first marriage also be recognised by the Catholic Church. Noel explained his experience to me:

I was married before. I married in '96 and I broke up around about the year 1999, yeah, we separated. Uh, got divorced and went through the long procedure with the church through their tribunal of getting an annulment. [...] It's a very strict process, and often does *not* get granted, because you need to decide whether you went into the marriage knowing what to expect. And whether you were of sound mind. [...] I'm a recovering alcoholic, [...] which is the main reason my marriage failed. So I lost pretty much everything and had to start my life from scratch. And they said, well yeah that's pretty much good grounds, on the basis that you were mentally unwell. Which is true. I was a practicing alcoholic for some fifteen – twenty years. [...] So, on the grounds of that, I mean, I wrote this all down and presented it to the tribunal and they came back after two minutes and said 'yeah, it's granted'.

The distinction provided by Swensen and Trauhaug (1985) between commitment between persons and commitment to the institution of marriage is based on situations where the couple are able to choose whether to remain in a marriage or not. This is also in line with Giddens' (1992) notion of the 'pure relationship'. Commitment to marriage was emphasised as important in participant interviews but was complicated by prohibition of divorce by the Catholic Church and Filipino state. While participants indicated that they were committed to the institution of marriage, their narratives of divorce and annulment reveal that their understanding of commitment is more flexible. Commitment to marriage was thus expressed by participants as ideal, but the actions taken by participants showed that such commitments could be broken if marriages became untenable.

#### **Fate**

Care, trust, and commitment were identified by participants as key components of their relationships. In this next section I examine fate both as an important means by which participants understood how they met their partner, but also its significance as a narrative device. According to Matthew Adams' (2004) summary of Anthony Giddens' 1991 work *Modernity and Self-Identity*, 'fate' and 'destiny'

involve a conceptualization of the world usually framed in religious terms. Life and the events which mark one's life are not understood as a series of random or chance occurrences. Neither are they perceived to be solely within the domain of human knowledge and control. The patterns and sequences of individual histories only make sense against the backdrop of an omnipotent controlling force. This force, once acknowledged, is still not perceived to be completely understood by merely human endeavours (389-90).

Giddens (1991) emphasises the future-focused nature of fate:

The world is not seen as a directionless swirl of events in which agents are natural laws and human beings, but as having an intrinsic force which relates individual life

to cosmic happenings. A person's destiny – the direction his or her life is due to take – is specified by that persons fate, what the future holds in store (109).

Fate therefore refers to forces beyond human control which dictate the future of individuals (cf. Ahearn 2001; 2004; Hatfield 2002). Romantic films often depicted notions of fate, and thus it can also be understood as a local example of global processes, as described by Inhorn (2002), perpetuated through mediascapes (Appadurai 1990: 325). Fate was an integral part of the relationships of some participants as they believed that meeting their partner and their subsequent romance was 'meant to be'. This was evident in the meeting narrative of Noel and Lisa described earlier. The following discussion between Jennifer and her husband Michael also demonstrate the importance of fate in participant narratives.

Jennifer met Michael while visiting her brother who was living in New Zealand. At the time of her visit she was experiencing problems in her previous marriage in the Philippines, and was not intending to embark on a romantic relationship.

Michael:

There's some really cool things [that] happened, and, you know, they're too crazy to... be normal eh. Its [...] like someone out there's running interference to make problems when they arise go away. [...]

Jennifer:

...and [they] push you to do things you wouldn't normally do, and one of them was possibly my coming here. [...] There's too much synchronicity in our lives for me not to have made the trip here. [...] There were a lot of spooky things. [...] I think the important thing is that we started out not on a romantic level. We started as friends and conversation and, just bouncing ideas off, and just sharing stories. And, he wasn't looking, and I wasn't looking, and that friendship just turned something else over time. [...] With all those spooky, or sometimes not so spooky synchronicities [...] you just accept it and then realise, "oh, something's pushing us together," [...] there must a reason, and all the difficulties just disappear and it just becomes, it's

so easy, this is the next step. It's, it's like somebody showing you, "this is next, this is next, this is next."

To Michael and Jennifer, love was something that was in part beyond their individual agency, orchestrated from an unknown and incomprehensible outside force. Melissa's use of description of things she considered "spooky," and various "synchronicities" served in her narrative as evidence to this claim. Outside forces "run interference" in order to ensure that the couple come together, despite any obstacles that were in the way.

The idea of 'fate' within narratives can also be used in order to shift blame, or in this case justify a decision. For example, Douglas Ezzy (2000) argues that in difficult circumstances the idea of fate "serves an important rhetorical purpose. It shifts blame from the individual to these larger social factors" (128). Fate is also used as a narrative device by Michael and Jennifer. As the couple met while Jennifer was still married to her ex-husband their narrative acted to shift the blame from themselves as individuals and onto fate, over which they had no control. Within their interview narrative they relinquish agency, therefore justifying any potential moral wrongdoing that occurred as a result of their actions. Their narrative also serves to distance them from stereotypes of mail-order brides in which both men and women are often depicted as engaging in a premeditated search for a partner on the 'marriage market'. By explaining that they met as a result of forces beyond their control, Michael and Jennifer thus distanced themselves from being understood as self interested actors looking for a spouse (cf. Constable 2003a: 92-3).

# **Authenticity**

Writing in an American context, Nicole Constable has dedicated a chapter of her book *Romance on a Global Stage* (2003a) to the issue of immigration. Constable argues that despite understandings of Filipina in popular discourses, which often

portray transnational marriages as instant, and migration to the United States (and other Western nations) as unproblematic, the immigration process for brides-to-be is often drawn out and difficult (see also Coutin 2003).<sup>27</sup> She explains that "Foreign spouses of fiancées from China and the Philippines, so-called mail-order brides, must meet the state's moral, physical, and financial requirements, and are still met with suspicion as to their motives for marrying Americans" (176). While participants in my research had different experiences than those in Constable's (2003a) study, those who had obtained, or were in the process of obtaining, New Zealand residency through The Family Partnership Category described having to 'prove' to New Zealand immigration authorities that their relationship was 'genuine'. 28 Current immigration policy requires that applicants supply 'evidence of partnership'. This evidence includes proof of shared residence, proof of financial dependence or independence, documentation of family or public recognition of the relationship, evidence of the duration of the relationship, and, significantly, "evidence of you being committed to each other emotionally and exclusively, such as evidence of joint decision making, and exclusive sexual relationship, and the sharing of household duties, parental responsibility, and spare time" (Immigration New Zealand 2005a; 2005b). Thus, I argue that to the New Zealand government 'partnership' is understood as monogamous and enduring over time, and involves living in close proximity and a strong emotional bond (cf. Britt Flemmen 2008).

Participants described giving immigration officials' stacks of letters, photographs, and other information such as phone bills that demonstrated the couple's genuine affection for each other. Love, in this case, was demonstrated through the amount of time the couple spent together or in contact with each other, and how

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Researchers also argue that policies that result in migrants being vulnerable to domestic abuse, as leaving an abusive partner can result in deportation, or partners may use the threat of deportation as a means of power and control (Narayan 1995; Vergara 2000).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Further information on obtaining New Zealand residency under the Family Partnership Category can be found on the Immigration New Zealand website, www.immigration.govt.nz. One notable difference between Constable's study and this research is that the New Zealand couples were permitted to remain in New Zealand while residency applications were processed, while participants in Constable's study endured long periods of separation.

affectionate they were during those times. Participants described having their relationships reduced to photographs, letters, and phone bills with a sense of bemusement, but generally agreed that they understood that the process existed in order to 'protect' both them and their New Zealand partners (Narayan 1995). This need to protect both parties' ties in with stereotypes held of Filipina women and their partners. For example, Donna explained that she felt the difficulty of the immigration process was justified as it offered a source of protection for herself and other women:

Maybe so many cases that are, you know, maybe they already started and, they aren't, maybe they're not compatible or whatever. Violence, just coming [to New Zealand] and you know [not realising that your partner is violent]. So, the immigration [service is] just making sure that [...] you're both compatible with each other. [...] So one of the requirements is the, like Frank don't have violence [...], domestic violence records [...] that's the one. And they should have income, a good income that he can support me on my stay here, and accommodation. [...] It's not only me, but only him, also him that he should also pass all the requirements at immigration. [...] You have to show them your income, your income tax return, [...]

Donna narratively acknowledges the possibility that some men who marry foreign women have a history of domestic violence through her justification of the immigration process. In doing this she engaged with the stereotypes of the violent, exploitative male and victimised foreign bride that are further explored in the second chapter. Alternatively, Melissa downplayed her involvement in the immigration process and explained to me that is was primarily her husband who dealt with it:

He started, the moment he wanted me, I think he already researched and asked. [...] When he was courting [me], he was writing letters already. [...] So he already knew what to do I guess. He was sending me letters every day with flowers, and nice stuff.

Every day I had a love letter. [...]. And emails, uh, 'cos he's calling you get, you know, a bill. So he kept all of those, so when, when I, we applied for fiancée visa. A long time ago it was called fiancée visa. We did not get married in the Philippines. He applied for a fiancée visa for me. [...] And they needed to look at our evidence. Letters, photos. [...] And so, I gave them a box, one box. And then, um, there was proof that we living together there. So they have no doubt that our relationship was genuine.

Melissa's descriptions of frequent contact and gifts sent by her husband frames the narrative of her migration process as an an act of care. Thus, her example of the strategic measures taken by her husband to ensure they had sufficient evidence to support a successful residency application through the Partnership Category, simultaneously acted as evidence that their marriage came about as the result of the caring, romantic gestures of her husband.

Lisa's decision, outlined in the section on care, to return to the Philippines to teach for a year not only allowed for herself and Noel to assess their feelings for one another, but also held the strategic advantage, as they saw it, of demonstrating to immigration officials that they were meeting requirements. As Noel put it, "Immigration [...] didn't see any problem [...] because she had gone back, voluntarily, within the terms of a limited purpose visa. So she was playing by the rules. [...] So, they thought well, 'maybe this is genuine.'" The experience of migration for my participants meant that they were not only working with notions of love and romance as they understood and experienced them, but that they had to conform to the expectations of the New Zealand state in order to achieve their goal of residency through the Family Partnership Category. The performance of their relationship through documents and photographs felt reductionist to some, while for others like Melissa, the process of gathering information simultaneously involved the enactment of romantic gestures.

Thus, participants demonstrations of love were required to comply with notions of 'authenticity' dictated by Immigration New Zealand. In their narratives,

participants described how they complied performatively to these notions, but were careful to illustrate that this was both an enactment of love and romance, but also a strategic attempt to reach the desired goal of residency which would allow them to demonstrate a long term commitment and trust.

### **Concluding Comments**

The dichotomy between economics and emotion set up in past research is blurred in this chapter. Participants described examples of acts of care which were demonstrated through economic means such as paying for goods, but were also understood as a gesture of love by both parties, thus collapsing the distinction.

In their narratives participants used examples of acts of care, trust, commitment, and fate to demonstrate their understanding of love and express the significance of its presence in their relationships. I suggest that participant expressions of love and romance were influenced and framed by Christian and Western notions of love as refracted through globalscapes and mediascapes (Appadurai 1990). Participants also presented narratives that conformed to Christian expectations of marriage, demonstrating the importance of commitment to the institution of marriage regardless of past failed unions.

I also argue that participants used narratives of love to make identity claims as virtuous, successful, and modern Filipina women. These narratives also offered a means of negotiating stereotypes and demonstrating the legitimacy of their relationships. By highlighting examples of love and romance through care, trust, commitment and fate in their narratives, participants were able to counter assumptions that their marriage to a New Zealand man was somehow not authentic or claims to love not legitimate.

# **Chapter Two**

# "Not a Typical Filipina"

In this chapter I build on the discussion of participant expressions of care, and how these were used in their narratives to collapse the divide between economics and emotions, and continue to explore how participants strategically manipulated negative stereotypes in order to present a positive migrant identity. I reveal how participants undertook identity work in their narratives, negotiating negative stereotypes held of them based on their gender and ethnicity. I argue that rather than denying the stereotypes, participants narratively reinforced and Othered negative typologies of 'typical' Filipinas as mail-order brides, domestic worker, and subservient women. This enabled them to then construct contrasting identities as modern, virtuous, and successful Filipinas, thus distancing themselves from the negative stereotypes and maintaining a continuous migrant identity.

# **Identity Work**

Identities are developed over time and within certain social and cultural contexts. Here I am interested in the way in which interviewees constructed their identity in the broad category (that I am giving them) of a Filipina migrant. In order to understand identity in a way that is useful for the exploration of the narratives of my participants, I utilise the work of Holland et al (1998). They argue that identity is "a central means by which selves, and the sets of actions they organize, form and re-form over personal lifetimes and in the histories of social collectivities" (1998: 270). I understand identity as constructed, processual, transitional, and performative (Blackburn 2002; Fortier 2000; Holland, et al. 1998). In this chapter I focus on the development of identity in practice, Holland et al provide a useful means by which to understand "practiced identity" using the idea of different 'contexts'. Firstly, the *figured world* refers to the way people

send messages and place themselves in social fields in relation to Others (271). Second, positionality refers to the social position of an individual in terms of social stratification, such as gender, ethnicity, sexuality. The third context they give, space of authoring, is defined as,

A matter of orchestration: of arranging the identifiable social discourses/practices that are one's resources...in order to craft a response in time and space defined by others' standpoints in activity, that is, in a social field conceived of as the ground of responsiveness (272).

The final of Holland et al.'s contexts of identity is *making worlds* through 'serious play', by feeding "the personal activities of particular groups, their 'signatures,' into the media, the cultural genres, through which even distant others may construe their lives" (272). Using this framework, I understand identity as a practice by which people, both at the individual and group levels, present themselves to others, and position themselves in the world as they understand it.<sup>29</sup> Supplementary to this is the concept of 'identity work', defined by David Snow and Leon Anderson (1987) as: "The range of activities individuals engage in to create, present, and sustain personal identities that are congruent with and supportive of the self-concept" (1348). Snow and Anderson's (1987) scholarship on 'identity work' among homeless men in the United States demonstrates the way the men in their study created and performed an identity that added a sense of meaning to their existence.

## Deirdre McKay (2007a) explains that for migrants

these identities are forms of subjectivication that fit individuals, however awkwardly, into the specific subject positions named. Migrants become dependent on these identities - discourses they have not chosen - to initiate and sustain their agency in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> See Blackburn (2002) for an example of the work of Holland et al. used to explore the identities of students in a queer youth group.

transnational cultural fields.<sup>30</sup> Thus, this limited set of subject positions is the frame in which people, including migrants, comprehend and interpret migrants' experiences (McKay 2007a: 193).<sup>31</sup>

Filipina migrants perform identity work within their narratives in order to explain, make sense of, and give meaning and depth to their experiences. In this chapter I use the frameworks described above to explore the ways Filipina women practiced identity, and performed identity work in order to place themselves in social fields in relation to Othering stereotypes, their positionality, and the context in which their identity narratives were crafted.

### **Stereotypes**

Through an exploration of common stereotypes held of Filipina women I aim to demonstrate how participants performed 'identity work' in order to negotiate stereotypes and actively present an identity in relation to what they expected me to be interested in as a researcher (Rosenblatt 2003: 227).<sup>32</sup> Maryon Macdonald (1993) cites Walter Lippman as bringing the term 'stereotype' into the social sciences in his 1922 book *Public Opinion* (220). Macdonald paraphrases Lippman's definition, stating that stereotypes are "erroneous representations acquired through other than direct experience of the reality that they are claimed to represent" (220). Xavier Andrade (2002) extends this is in his argument that stereotypes

2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> In this study I demonstrate that participants do in fact choose discourses, and actively build them up in order to position themselves in opposition the them.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> 'These identities' McKay refers to are common stereotypes of Filipina women such as; dutiful daughter; self-sacrificing mother; global servant; domestic helper; nanny; deskilled professional; national hero; unruly migrant; mail order bride; domestic helper (193).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> In this chapter I do not intend to embark on a moralistic condemnation of stereotyping, but rather present stereotypes of Filipina women as common representations that will be explored in this chapter, as well as manipulated and used by my participants in order to situate their own identities.

express a perverted sense of the concept of culture, inasmuch as they deny its internal diversity, negate its dynamic and contradictory nature, and freeze its historically situated contents. Typecasting is the result of cataloguing culture in static terms, proceeding through a careful selection of traits that are assumed to incarnate one's own and the other's identity, with the intention of producing public understandings of differences among groups, classes, races, and societies...The easy classifications make stereotypes particularly suitable for circulation throughout society, from networks of gossip to open broadcasting in the public sphere (256).

Thus, stereotypes are reductionist and homogenising in their representation and classification of groups. This view of stereotypes sees them as imposed on groups and individuals by outsiders, and those being stereotyped as having little or no influence over how they are represented. However, I demonstrate that in my case participants did in fact attempt to control and influence stereotypes. Writing from a cultural studies perspective, Michael Pickering (2001) takes a similar approach to Andrade, and explains that in the 'classical view,' stereotypes

distort the ways in which social groups or individuals are perceived, and they obscure the more complex and finite particularities and subjectivities tangled up in the everyday lives of groups and individuals. They are seen as deficient either because they encourage an indiscriminate lumping together of people under overarching group-signifiers, often of a derogatory character, or because they reduce specific groups and categories to a limited set of conceptions which in themselves often contradict each other (10).

This "indiscriminate lumping together of people" does not allow for understanding the lived experiences of those being stereotyped (7). He argues that while the provision of more complex information about the stereotyped parties seems the logical solution to the problem of stereotyping, this answer is "too easy," and underestimates the staying power of such negative representations (12).

Pickering also notes the overlap between the concepts of stereotyping and Othering, "Stereotyping...involves using the Other as a means to know yourself, or rather, have a certain belief about yourself that attains legitimacy by its symbolic exclusion of the other" (74). This notion of knowing oneself though creating an opposing Other is useful in this study, and will be explored further throughout this chapter, as I look at commonly held stereotypes of Filipina women. I found that rather than correcting assumptions of essentialist notions of Filipinas, my participants would often use stereotypes held of Filipina women in order to demonstrate ways in which they themselves differed from 'the norm'.

Pickering claims that the construction of the Other is produced by those in a position of privilege and power, rendering those being stereotyped as "heteronomous, subordinated types who cannot retaliate in kind" (75). This view of stereotypes as serving as rhetorical tools for those in power also contributes to the negation of the lived experiences for those who are stereotyped. Within anthropological literature, the notion of stereotypes have been used as an analytical tool in order to make sense of the lived experiences of those being studied (see Chock 1987). For example, studies have also been carried out examining stereotyping of people based on national categories (Tseliou & Eisler 2007), and Robin Queen (2005) has researched how stereotypes are projected, recognised, and negotiated though the telling of jokes. Bulloch and Fabinyi (2009) explore the notion of Self and Other in relation to transnational marriage from the perspective of Filipinos residing in the Philippines. Judith Okely (1996) discusses the active use of stereotypes by Gypsies in the British Isles. She explains that "the image of the Gypsy as presented to outsiders is variable and adjusted to the needs of a particular context" (51). According to Okely, Gypsies would adjust their image when interacting with non-Gypsies in order to best suit an occasion or achieve a desired outcome, generally one that is economically beneficial. She gives the examples that her participants would play up to exoticised and romanticised stereotypes when acting as fortune tellers, degrade their image when begging, deny it altogether when seeking short-term employment, or present a neutral image when it was beneficial for them to break down barriers between themselves and an outsider (52-56). The active engagement with and utilisation of stereotypes demonstrated in Okely's work is useful for understanding the ways my own participants presented their identities in their interviews.

Furthermore, Catherine Trundle (2010) has explored how American migrants living in Nelson negotiated negative stereotypes which portrayed them as 'rich Americans', held by the local population. She explains that in order to uphold their rights to purchasing land in the area, American participants would narratively distance themselves from negative stereotypes:

Such a discursive strategy maintains oppositional identity claims commonly directed at migrants, but internalises the debate within the migrant group, strategically shifting the boundary. Locals and 'good migrants' blur, while the stereotyped identity of 'bad migrants' solidifies into ultimate outsiderhood (43).

I make a similar argument in this thesis, demonstrating that participants discursively reinforced versions of negative stereotypes by constructing them as Other, in order to then reinforce their own identity as virtuous, successful migrants (see also Bönisch-Brednich 2002).

The participants in my research demonstrated that certain stereotypes have become intrinsic to their own understandings of themselves and their identities. They actively use the stereotypes in ways that are positive for them, while also experiencing the stereotypes negatively from outsiders. This demonstrates that stereotypes are dynamic, and can be held as positive and negative simultaneously. How they are understood is dependent on who holds them and in which context they are deployed. In the next section I explore some of the stereotypes held of Filipina migrants living in New Zealand. Moreover, I attempt to reveal some of the strategies employed which enabled them to understand and negotiate these stereotypes, and how they deployed them as a means of doing identity work.

# Perceptions and Representations of New Zealand and the Philippines

In this section I explore representations of New Zealand and the Philippines as a means of providing context for the remainder of the chapter. Edward Said's (1978) work *Orientalism* outlines the way the 'Orient' has been constructed by those in the 'Occident'.<sup>33</sup> He states that "it is Europe that articulates the Orient; this articulation is the prerogative, not of a puppet master, but of a genuine creator, whose life-giving power represents, animates, constitutes the otherwise dangerous space beyond familiar boundaries" (57). As in Pickering's definition of stereotypes, Orientalist discourses generated by those in academia and in public culture can be understood as dominant and powerful, and with little chance of redress by people who fall within its articulation. Said's critique of this kind of representation is relevant here as it is important to acknowledge the discourse and potential stereotypes upon which knowledge is based.

During their fieldwork in the Philippines Bulloch and Fabinyi (2009) found that Filipinos in their respective field sites in Palawan and Siquijor held a strongly formed and Occidentalised construction of the West.<sup>34</sup> Through their fieldwork they discovered that many Filipinas desired transnational lives, and hoped to achieve this through marriage to a Western man. They argue that this desire is strongly influenced by romanticised imaginings of the West. "Purged from rural Filipinos' image of the West was hard work, poverty, inequality, destitution, violence, and the day-to-day discomforts of life. The construct of the Western man comes to personify this wealth" (Bulloch & Fabinyi 2009: 134; see also Tyner 2009).

Bulloch and Fabinyi also noted that to Filipinos the West was considered synonymous with the United States. Despite originating from New Zealand,

several decades, Spanish and US influences still exist.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> The Philippines were first colonised by the Spanish in the 1500s, and then later by the United States between 1935 and 1946 (Tyner 2009). Despite having been an independent nation for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> While problematic, I use the terms 'West' and 'non-West' to differentiated between the Philippines and nations such as New Zealand, the United States, and European countries.

Bulloch's physical appearance resulted in her frequently being mistaken as an American (132). Their article explores the notion of America held by Filipinos in relation to their understanding of the Self and the Other. "The idea of America occupies a predominant position in Filipino imaginings of the world. It is quintessentially other and, seemingly paradoxically, part of the self (Bulloch & Fabinyi 2009: 132). Because of the historical relationship and subsequent influence of the United States on the Philippines, Filipinos have come to feel they 'know' America. By 'knowing' America they also feel that they in a sense 'possess' it, with the result that it becomes a part of the self (133). They argue that overseas travel thus becomes a means by which Filipinos 'find' and consolidate their sense of self.

Perceptions held by those in the West also situate Filipina's firmly as 'other'. The Philippines is often portrayed in the media and some academic works as a place of poverty and conflict. Works that cite 'push-pull' theories of migration often claim that poverty acts as a primary motivational factor behind Filipina women leaving the Philippines in order to marry foreign men (Suzuki 2003), or entering into overseas employment as domestic helpers (Bahramitash 2005).

Due to opportunities for education and employment, New Zealand is considered to be a highly desirable destination by Filipinas. This is in line with the broader stereotypes of Western nation-states as being economically superior. Popular discourses imply that by moving to New Zealand women may engage in activities such as raising a family. This was exemplified by Noel, Lisa's New Zealand husband, who in his discussion on Russian mail-order brides, told me that a motivating factor for the women to leave Russia was that "there's a far better chance of having a successful family here, rather than back in Russia."

Bulloch and Fabinyi's (2009) research concluded that in the Philippines marriage of a Filipino to a Westerner was understood as a means of gaining social status, and also of travelling outside of the Philippines. However, gains made in social status were also accompanied by outsider feelings of jealousy and resentment. In my research, for example, Lisa and Noel described in their interviews that they

felt that they were subject to the judgement and suspicion of other Filipino migrants in New Zealand.

# Filipina as Woman

Lisa told me during her interview that "I think in your study you will not find [...] [many women] like me." She went on, "cause mostly the friends I have who also married [Kiwis] or other nationalities [...] they're more... staying at home, looking after kids." Lisa explained to me that not only does she have two tertiary qualifications, the first a degree in teaching which she obtained in the Philippines, and the second a bachelor of nursing from a New Zealand university, but she has also belonged to unions in her New Zealand work places and has actively campaigned for worker's rights. "I would say that I'm a stronger personality [than most Filipinas]". Lisa's statement that she is not a typical Filipina is made in relation to commonly held stereotypes regarding Filipina identity. Essentialised ideals of Filipinas commonly portray them as nurturing, maternal, patient, docile, and dutiful (Constable 2003a; Parreñas 2008b). Parreñas (2008a) argues that the Philippine state actively encourages the ideological construction of women as docile figures in order to maintain the flow of predominantly female overseas migrant workers, whose employment in low wage positions as maids and nannies is essential for the economic wellbeing of the Philippines (27).

Without question, the notion of docility...makes Filipino women more attractive as nannies and elder-care workers. Indeed, Filipino women have been stereotyped as naturally suited caregivers for the elderly and for children in the richer nations of Asia, Europe, and the Americas (30-1).

The participants in this study used the stereotype of the 'subservient Filipina woman' in order to construct and provide contrast to their own identity as a modern Filipina woman, exemplifying the strategic identity work. For example, in

her interview Lisa compared New Zealand – Filipina and Filipina – Filipina marriages:

If you see Filipinas who are not married to Kiwis, you would see that. [...] The subservient wife [...] looking after kids. [...] So, if they're living with Kiwis they [...] tried to make better of herself by doing what other Kiwis would do. But if you look at the Filipina – Filipino pair, it's prominently the husband has the say.

Lisa also explained to me that in her marriage to Noel domestic labour was shared evenly between them both, and compared it with what she felt was expected of wives in the Philippines:

[Everything] was to be done by the wife. Prepare the kids. Cook for your kids. Every single day. You have to wake up at four o'clock in the morning. [...] Because we don't have cereals. We always have rice in the morning. [...] So [the] mum gets up, very early, cooks breakfast for the kids, get them dressed, take them to school. [...] When the children get back from school and you're back from work you have to cook again for dinner. [...]Husband comes home, puts up his feet like that, watches telly while you cook, feed the children. 'Yeah', [he says], 'this is heaven'."

Lisa's contrasting of Filipino and New Zealand marriages can be interpreted as an assertion of her identity as a modern, independent, Westernised Filipina woman. The desire for a more 'modern' lifestyle has been cited as a motivation for entering into marriage migration by scholars such as Emilie Venables (2008), Hannah Bulloch (2009), Bulloch and Fabinyi (2009), and Deirdre McKay (2007a). For example, in her work with Senegalese women who were using cyber-cafes to correspond with foreign men with whom they hoped they would eventually meet, marry, and live with, they imagined "the global North...to be associated with modernity, luxury, and abundance of material goods and 'the good life'" (485). Hung Cam Thai (2002) also discusses the desires of brides to be, hoping that their migration to a wealthier nation will result in their being

afforded more respect as a woman, and the potential clash of ideals if the man she marries is desiring of a more 'traditional' and therefore subservient wife. Bulloch (2009) explains that "In understanding both the economic and symbolic significance of migration it is important to realise that Siquijodnon [inhabitants of a rural island in the Philippines] generally conceive of modernity and development as of foreign origin" (167).

Migration to New Zealand and marriage to Noel has thus allowed Lisa to act out her desires of modernity, and frame herself in her interview narrative as a modern subject. Hers is a success story, where she has found love, started a family, and has obtained a modern lifestyle where she is respected as a woman. She uses examples of what she believes to be a typical marriage in the Philippines to provide a contrast to her current lifestyle, thus creating juxtaposition in her narrative and also justifying her decision to move to New Zealand.

Melissa also discussed the stereotype of Filipina women as subservient in her interview: "I think [...] there is a lot of negative thinking because a lot of [...] New Zealand women say 'yeah, they [the men] married them [Filipina women] because they want someone they can, you know [makes a crushing motion with the ball of her foot]." She went on to contradict this perception of Filipina women:

Actually, Filipina women here are more of the boss. [...] It could be that the men might be thinking [...] that [Filipina women will be submissive] on the first thought, but when they get married, "oof" [they soon learn otherwise]. [...] Doesn't mean [...] that [just because] we don't [always] speak and we don't say what we're thinking that we are [...] submissive. [...] It's actually that we are strong. [...] We are preserving our femininity, [...] we'll say it when we are calm and the right time is.

Melissa's explanation that the silence of Filipinas is strategic stands in contrast to understandings of silence in Western cultures. In New Zealand and other Anglo cultures, the silence of one party during an argument is often interpreted as their inability to argue back, and in terms of an argument between husband and wife,

the silent party is often perceived as submissive, whilst the vocal partner is considered dominant (Ramos 2001).<sup>35</sup> However, Melissa maintained that the silence of a Filipina woman is not indicative of submission to her husband as stereotypes understand it, but that she is allowing her husband to have his say. Once he is finished, the woman will regroup, and will recall what he has said in anger at a later time, when it will be more effective, and she will be able to maintain control of the situation. It is the misinterpretation of this silence that, according to Melissa, has contributed to the perception of Filipinas as being submissive to their domineering husbands.

Maryon McDonald (1993) provides a useful framework for analysing this difference of interpretation, which she calls "categorical mismatch" (228). An ethnic group is considered a category, and then a stereotype becomes attached to that category. These stereotypes become so attached that they appear to be based on essentialised elements of that category, based on a 'truth' about that ethnic group (cf: Jenkins 2002; Ong 1996). An example of this is the notion that Filipinas are friendly and make excellent mothers. However, when a member or members of that category do not 'fit' or behave as the stereotype would dictate, a "lack of fit" occurs (McDonald 1993: 232-3).

Melissa also described her frustration at having her husband buying into the stereotype as Filipina as subservient:

Sometimes, when [...] I get so, so stubborn and [...] my husband he would say, "Oh! You're a New Zealander now!" [I respond to him], "No, I have always been like this. It's not because I'm in New Zealand. I've always been a stubborn woman. What do you think? I can't say what I want? Don't say that I've been influenced by New Zealand."

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> It is possible that this is related to the perceived importance of vocal debate in Western societies as demonstrated by the Socratic Method in law schools, and parliamentary debate.

By describing her own interpretation of conflicts with her husband, Melissa provides an insight into the impacts of stereotypes on her marriage, while simultaneously demonstrating to me that she, and other Filipinas, do not necessarily fall neatly into the categories that are assigned to them.

Melissa and Lisa both engaged with and positioned themselves against common stereotypes that are held of them as Filipina women. Lisa constructed an image of the role of the Filipina mother and wife as labour intensive, and with little respect or reward, thus providing a contrast to her life with Noel which she presents as loving, respectful, and containing equal roles for herself and her husband. Through this narrative she presented herself as a successful woman in a modern relationship, free from the drudgery that would have been her life had she remained in the Philippines. Lisa's narrative provided a critique of the stereotype of Filipina women as submissive. She too provided distance between herself and the stereotype by explaining that what may be interpreted by someone from a Western background as an act of submission, is understood by her as a strategic means by which she can gain the upper hand in a dispute between herself and her husband.

By saying that they are not 'typical Filipinas', participants are presenting a contradiction in their narratives. Participants simultaneously presented the norm of the 'typical' Filipina which encompasses other participants and Filipinas, and use it to position themselves as different, without relinquishing their identity as Filipina entirely. This demonstrates how participants undertook identity work by discursively constructing the stereotypical Filipina woman as Other, thus reinforcing their claim to a modern, successful migrant identity.

#### Filipina as Domestic Worker

I met Elizabeth and Jennifer after giving a talk at a local event for multicultural couples in Nelson. Elizabeth moved to New Zealand a year before I interviewed her. Prior to this she had spent several years in Italy working in an orphanage as a

nun. While we chatted after the talk, Elizabeth expressed concerns regarding how I was intending to represent Filipinas in my work, and wanted to make it clear to me that they were more than domestic workers. Her concerns confused me at the time, as I was then unaware of the broader stereotypes held of Filipina women. In her interview a few weeks later, another participant, Melissa explained to me that the stereotype of Filipinas as maids was endemic in Europe where Elizabeth had been living. "I don't think she realised that in New Zealand this impression is not there. [...] We're not getting domestic workers here from the Philippines, [...] we're getting caregivers more than anything." The distinction she makes here is between domestic helpers who often live with their employer, providing domestic services such as cooking, cleaning, and childcare. On the other hand, caregivers in New Zealand generally do not live with their employer, and instead work in rest home caring for the elderly. While employment as a caregiver does not carry the same connotations as a domestic worker, particularly outside New Zealand, it does tie in with an overarching stereotype of Filipinas as being friendly, caring, and maternal – rendering them ideal for work in the care sector.

The Philippine government actively encourages women to migrate to wealthier nations and to remit larger portions of their salaries in order to boost the Filipino economy (Bahramitash 2005; Parreñas 2008a; 2008b; Tyner 2009). Much research has been conducted on the effects of this policy, particularly focusing on Filipina migrants who have left behind husbands and children (for example: Arguillas & Williams 2010; Asis, et al. 2004; Fresnoza-Flot 2009). Through this research the expectation and importance of the role of Filipina as mother becomes explicit. Despite women living abroad for years at a time, the expectation of their role as primary caregivers of children remains:

Men rarely became full-time caregivers of children. This suggests that while women's migration may force men to do housework, they do not do so to the extent that it would free women, including migrant mothers, of nurturing responsibilities. Indeed, my interviews show that migrant mothers more than just 'communicate' but continue to nurture their children from afar (Parreñas 2005: 230).

While in the Philippines overseas migrant workers are portrayed by the government as 'national heroes' (Parreñas 2008a: 177; see also Gibson et al. 2001), there is also a growing movement of women seeking to challenge the stereotype. "Professional and academic women have published personal accounts of perceived discrimination against them as 'Filipinas' and therefore servants, despite what their visa, passport, class of travel or clothing might indicate" (McKay 2007a: 198).

Elizabeth and Jennifer told me in my conversation with them of the definition of 'Filipina' that had been included in a Greek dictionary. Filomeno Aguilar Jr. (2003) uses the same example, saying that,

In 1998...many protested against the word Filipineza (Filipina) in a Greek dictionary with its given meaning as "a domestic worker from the Philippines or a person (from any country) who performs non-essential auxiliary tasks"..."Filipina" and "domestic work" have become reducible and interchangeable, to the chagrin of Filipino elites (440).

Despite the claims by these authors that it is primarily elite Filipina women who are seeking to challenge this stereotype, I interpret Elizabeth's worries as a broader concern that, as a researcher, I too would fall into the trap of reducing her identity, and the identities of my other participants, to that of a domestic worker. This can be understood in reference to Holland et al.'s (1998) notion of *space of authoring*, and *making worlds* discussed earlier. Elizabeth and Jennifer both arranged their discourses in order to respond the assumptions others held of them, and did so through expressing concerns as to how they would be represented in my study.

Yet some participants did work in care positions – Donna works as a caregiver, and Lisa is a nurse – both spoke of how they had actively sought out such positions as they understood 'caring' as an integral part of their identity.

This demonstrates that in doing identity work, participants would distance themselves from negative stereotypes, while at other times they would incorporate more positive aspects of stereotypes into their identities, the complexities of which are explored in chapter three.

#### Filipina as Mail-Order Bride

Ideas and assumptions held of the mail-order bride are part of a broader discussion surrounding the sexual exploitation and victimisation of women. These stereotypes provide an ethnographic example of the division between emotions and economics discussed in chapter one. 'Mail-order bride' stereotypes are premised on this dichotomy. Such unions are understood as unauthentic as men and women are often understood to be entering into such relationships for purely economic or pragmatic as opposed to emotional purposes. As was demonstrated in the blog post by Scuba Nurse discussed in the introductory chapter, such claims are also closely linked to discourses on human trafficking (Agustín 2007). Women who meet their husbands through matchmaking agencies are often assumed to be victims of trafficking, an assumption that is problematic as it does not allow for the lived experiences of the women, and effectively obscures any demonstrations of agency. In both public opinion and academic works, when marriage migrants are understood as the victims of trafficking, they are often assumed to be at increased risk of domestic abuse. While there are most certainly cases of abuse, the assumption that all cases of marriage migration that have been negotiated through marriage brokers result in extreme domestic violence have been thoroughly problematised by many social scientists, most notably Nicole Constable (2003a; 2006). An example of this can be seen in a recent article by Jane Kim (2011). Kim has taken examples reported by groups working with victims of domestic violence, and has made the assumption that all men who meet their spouses through marriage brokers are guilty of the same abuse:

Such violent behaviour demonstrates that IMB-T [international marriage broker – traffickers] husbands marry their IMB-T wives for the purposes of various types of exploitation – for example, sex exploitation, domestic violence, forced caretaking, domestic servitude, or the abuse, manipulation, management, domination, and control of an IMB-T bride's immigration status and entire existence (2011: 471).

Recent works on marriage migration (Constable 2003a; Faier 2009; Hsia 2007; Patico 2009; Suzuki 2003) have outlined two primary intertwined and very pervasive stereotypes of the 'mail-order bride' that appear in some academic literature in law, sociology, and anthropology (for example: Glodava & Onizuka 1994; Kim 2011; Ramos 2001; So 2006; Vergara 2000).

The first stereotype portrays the women as victims; generally thought to be living in poverty in their home nation with marriage to foreign men the only possible means of escape. The partners are understood to be taking advantage of the desperate plight of these women in order to find a woman over whom they can assert their dominance (Glodava & Onizuka 1994; Kim 2011).

This pervasive stereotype has resulted in the creation of laws and regulations, particularly in the area of immigration, in nations such as the United States and New Zealand that are designed to 'protect' both the citizens of that nation and the women who wish to marry them (Constable 2003b). However, Constable argues that these regulations instead

serve to curtail women's (and men's) opportunities to shape the direction of their own lives as they see fit. It seems ironic that borders are policed not only by the INS but also indirectly by some women's organizations, academics, and middle-class professional Filipinos in the United States and abroad. Such groups seem intent on protecting rural Filipino women from becoming victims of their own decisions (2003a: 115).

While acknowledging the possibility of abuse within the relationship, 'policing' of this kind assumes that it is endemic and has the potential to result in the unnecessary demonization of all Filipina-Western marriages. These stereotypes are all based on the premise that people in the countries of origin must want what those in the host countries materially have. As discussed in chapter one, they are understood to be moving for economic purposes, not love, and therefore their motivation is not considered legitimate.

Conversely, although not entirely contradictory, is a second stereotype which also portrays the Filipina as subject to structural constraints. Yet, instead of being understood as the victim, her apparent desperation to escape by any means necessary sees her understood as a 'gold-digger' seeking only lonely, naïve men whom they are only interested in because of their money and immigration access to countries such as the United States and New Zealand (Ramos 2001). Constable here outlines her wariness of these stereotypes in relation to her research on marriages between American men and Filipina women who met through online marriage agencies:

I am critical of depictions of mail-order brides as passive victims and sex slaves. But I am also wary of romanticizing resistance and critical of depictions of mail-order brides or immigrant wives on the other end of the spectrum as hyperagents and calculating opportunists who seduce and take advantage of naive and unsuspecting western men. Within both of these images are embedded well known but highly problematic stereotypes of Asian women - the innocent sex slave and the manipulative seductress or whore, the "lotus blossom" and the "dragon lady" (Constable 2003a: 92-3).

Stereotypes of abusive husbands and victimised women, however, came through in participant stereotypes. For example, Michael iterated his belief that the exploitation and abuse of women from the Philippines by New Zealand men is "real".

All you need to do is get into the secret files in the Immigration Department to see how many, how many guys there are in this country that have bought them in, and are up to their third and fourth [partner]. And they abuse the shit out of them. [...] And [...] if they haven't got one they're off to Vietnam to get a fourteen year old, or a thirteen year old or something.

By referring to "secret files", the existence of which cannot be verified, Michael creates an alarmist picture that raises the spectre of trafficking abuses. This has the effect of providing distance between himself and the stereotype in his narrative. Snow and Anderson (1987) also found that their participants used 'distancing' as a strategy when performing identity work. Homeless men in their studies distanced themselves from notions of homelessness, as they were inconsistent with their self-identities and thus were not expressed as part of the self (1348). While Michael rejects the stereotype of the dominant male partner within his own relationship, in framing the stereotype as negative in opposition to his own relationship he also demonstrates how powerful the stereotype is in shaping his understanding of his relationship. By portraying himself as Other to this stereotype, he created his own identity as being a good husband who did not treat his wife in ways he considers to be abusive. His wife Jennifer, on the other hand, employed the second stereotype; portraying the Filipina as the exploiter and the "trusting" New Zealander as the potential victim.

Sometimes I think because of the trusting nature of the Kiwis and the carefree [...] and because of that lack of [...] knowledge on, or shunning away from that [...] system where there actually are different classes of people in that society. And you get a Kiwi guy entering into this [kind of relationship] [...]. A lot of times...they will get someone who's either a bar girl, or someone just really desperate enough to look for a better way out of life. [...] There are many of those. I can assure you of that.

In Jennifer's narrative the 'exploitative' woman was effectively Othered. Both of these examples demonstrated an awareness of the discourses surrounding the marriages of Filipina women to Western men and the need to narratively deal with them. Both statements can be understood as an example of participants demonstrating and manipulating the stereotypes to narratively portray themselves in a certain light. This is also consistent with Okely's (1996) demonstration that stereotypes can be utilised and manipulated by those who are stereotyped. By positioning these stereotypes as Other they are then able to distance themselves, and in turn enact agency to create new discourses over which they have more control – bringing their notions of who they are to the level of the individual, rather than being a subject/construction of the entire discourse of, for example, mail-order brides.

While Jennifer and Michael provided no challenge to the stereotype itself, instead creating it as an alarmist Other in which they positioned themselves in opposition to, Gloria, a 48 year old mother of three who had lived in Whangarei for fourteen year, took a different approach. She met her husband through a newspaper advertisement not long after she arrived in New Zealand. The couple married in 1996. When I asked her what she told others if they asked her how she and her husband met, she was defiant,

[I tell them] the truth! [...] Why do I have to tell them lies? Tell them the truth. I met him in the Newspaper! [...] At work they all [...] laugh at it. Cos they're all Kiwis they all laugh at it. I said "well, too bad! That's how I came here!" [...] Doesn't worry me. [...] why do you get worried with something that's real?

Gloria was also triumphant in her defeat of the belief held by her husband's exwife that she had married him for his money and access to New Zealand residency

She said to me, "you are just using my, my husband, using him to come here. And now you already got what you want. You can leave him now." And I said to her, "hey, I'm married to your husband, but you're not. So get, get away." [...] That's the first and the last fight we had, and after that we became friends.

Gloria's explanation can also be understood as one of 'successful migration', a narrative device also employed by other participants in this study whereby they presented their migration story to me as one where difficulties encountered had been overcome in time. By explaining that the confrontation with her husband's ex-wife resulted in friendship, Gloria demonstrated that she was successfully fitting in and making her situation work.

Gloria's statements show that she is aware of the stereotype and what people might think of the way she met her husband, but for her there is no contradiction between marrying for economic or emotional reasons. The belief that Filipinas marry non-Filipino men for economic purposes, while non-Filipino men marry Filipinas for company, unpaid labour, or sexual gratification is an example of the Western understanding of a dichotomy between emotions and economics discussed in chapter one. As I demonstrate in this thesis, marriages between Filipina women and New Zealand men blur this dichotomy, as love can be demonstrated through economic provision. The mail-order bride stereotype is problematic precisely because of the Western understanding that love, care, and affect are incompatible and stand in opposition to economics, money, and work. Despite working with this dichotomy, Nicole Constable hints at the fact that Filipinas do not see economics as a motivator for marriage as a contradiction to marrying for love:

Filipinas and Chinese women rarely objected to the idea that their relationships with U.S. men were related in part to political relations and the flow of capital. U.S. men, by contrast, often objected strongly. Most men considered it distasteful to connect politics and market forces with personal lives and intimate relationships, or to propose that love might not be the single or most essential ingredient of a marriage (Constable 2003a: 116)

For Maria, 40, who met her now ex-husband after she had migrated to New Zealand, the assumption that they had met online was a source of frustration.<sup>36</sup> "It

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> She later revealed that he was computer illiterate.

seems like when they [New Zealanders] look at us, 'ohh they're from internet girl' you know. [...] And I get annoyed with that." She felt that New Zealanders often assume that people from the Philippines or other Asian countries mostly meet their husbands online, and counters this by explaining that she does have friends here who met their partners online, but that they originated in Australia or the UK, "so [...] don't just look at the Asian people [who are] doing that." This links to a point raised in chapter one that demonstrated the ideal type of courtship that accompanies marriage. People who meet online in the UK and NZ are not subject to the same kinds of assumptions. These assumptions are based on racially essentialist notions of difference between New Zealand and other nations. The stereotype of Filipina women as innocent, naïve, and easily victimised comes into play here. Western women are assumed to have the power and agency to fully comprehend and manage the risks of meeting someone online, albeit while facing a different set of stereotypes, while the notion of Filipina women as victims renders them powerless and possibly duped, thus detracting from what may have been a positive experience.<sup>37</sup>

In response to my asking if anyone has said anything about mail order brides in regards to their relationship, Noel responded with: "No one actually mentioned it when I said where I met Anna. Or that she came from the Philippines because that's... Philippines is no longer *the* destination for mail-order brides. It's now Russia." <sup>38</sup> By situating mail-order brides as primarily being Russian, Noel negotiates his wife's identity further away from being potentially linked with that of the construct of a mail order bride. Noel also distances himself from the typical assumption of what happens when a New Zealand man marries a Filipina woman: "It just happened. That's what people ask me. 'Why did you pick a Filipina?' [...] Well we met online, she happened to be Filipina. [...] Because I got to know *her* 

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> While becoming increasingly mainstream, online dating is often understood to be an inferior means of meeting a partner resorted to by those who have failed at more accepted methods such as meeting through social acquaintances (Barlow 2009).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Noel was the only participant I asked directly about the mail-order bride stereotype, and I only did so as he had explicitly discussed the stereotype during an earlier meeting.

rather than a Filipina, that's not what defines her."<sup>39</sup> Noel and Lisa both portrayed their meeting as an exciting, romantic, and positive experience (see chapter one). His being asked why he 'picked' a Filipina is described as giving offense, as he deems her origin to be irrelevant, and rejects the implication that he made a consumer-choice type decision based on her ethnicity.

Lisa explained to me that stereotypes of their marriage were not just held by New Zealanders. When she arrived in New Zealand she attended a Filipino mass with her husband "To meet other Filipinas and also worship, [...] go to church. And. It's just that, [...] other Filipinos have these inclination to look upon you that, [...] it was an easy thing for you to come here because of a Kiwi husband." Lisa explained this by employing a further stereotype, saying that Filipinos have a "crab mentality"; when one person is on top others will claw them back down. This implication that others might be jealous of her marriage to a New Zealander is consistent with the work of Bulloch and Fabinyi (2009) and McKay (2007a) which explains the increase in status afforded those who travel overseas and marry westerners. Yet it also demonstrates the way a range of stereotypes are strategically deployed in particular narratives in order to counter stereotypes they believed others held of them.

Lisa's narratives, like my other participants, demonstrated strategies implemented by my participants in their interviews to distance themselves from, or problematise, perceptions held of them by outsiders at the same time that they actively utilised cultural generalisations and categories.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> I did not ask Noel about this directly in my interview. What I had asked was 'is there anything else you think you would like to mention' when I had run out of questions from my interview script, and without hesitation he told me this, ensuring that he placed himself outside of the possibility of being considered a stereotypical man who had married a stereotypical Filipina wife.

## **Concluding remarks**

In this chapter I have examined participant performances of identity work in relation to popular stereotypes of Filipina women. One strategy by which participants narratively constructed their identity was to describe how they were not a 'typical' Filipina. This had the effect of setting up what they believed to be the 'typical' features of a Filipina woman as Other, and in doing so reinforcing existing stereotypes. They then employed these stereotypes, narratively constructing contrasting their own Filipina identities against them. By doing this they were able to distance themselves from popular stereotypes of Filipina migrants as subservient women, mail-order brides, and maid. The New Zealand partners of the Filipina migrants also used this strategy to distance themselves from stereotypes of exploitative, abusive husbands. These narratives also demonstrate a careful balancing between insiderhood and outsiderhood. Participants maintained their claim to their identity as Filipina women in order to maintain a sense of continuous migrant identity, but they also negotiated which aspects were most useful to the identity they wished to convey in their interview narratives. In the following chapter I continue to explore participant utility and manipulation of stereotypes in order to create a positive migrant identity in relation to notions of kinship and relatedness.

## **Chapter Three**

# **Relatedness: Narratives of the Ideal Family**

In the previous chapter I highlighted strategies Filipina participants undertook in their interview narratives to deny or distance themselves from stereotypes they deemed negative or antithetical to their identity. Here I further this discussion by focusing on the utility of notions of Filipina women as family members to explore webs of kinship obligation through an examination of transnational ties. I argue that for my participants kinship relationships are not a static entity created only through ties of biological connectedness, but rather are negotiated and modified through daily practices like the provision of financial support and participation in events. I will begin this chapter by examining what values participants considered important in a 'good' family, and follow on by detailing how they enacted those roles and values through their participation in transnational networks. I assert that participants tended to contrast an idealised notion of Filipino families with life in New Zealand as they had witnessed it.<sup>40</sup>

#### Kinship in anthropology

Over the last three decades the anthropology of kinship has undergone significant changes in both focus and approach. In 1984 David Schneider provided a significant challenge to previous analytical frameworks in his work *A Critique of the Study of Kinship*, in which he argued that the approaches taken by anthropologists, including himself, were ethnocentric in their assumption that kinship ties were based on blood ties (Carsten 1995; 2000; Parkin 1997; Parkin &

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> While I note by asking Filipina participants what their families were like in comparison to the family of their partner I set up a framework for comparison, the level of emphasis on the differences, and amount of detail given in response indicates that such differences were strongly felt and thus were of importance to participants.

Stone 2004; Peletz 2001; Stone 2004). He argued that anthropologists should aim to understand kinship relations from the point of view of those being studied:

In the field we must not translate or gloss every relationship between a woman and what appears to be the child she has borne as a mother-child relationship until that translation or gloss has been fully explored by examining in detail how the natives conceptualize, define, or describe that relationship and their construction of just where it stands in the context of their culture (1984: 200).

The exploration of kinship as understood by research participants would allow for a more nuanced and detailed understanding of participants own understandings of what relationships meant. Schneider also pointed out that, "the European and the anthropological notion of consanguinity, of blood relationship and descent...rests...on the state of *being*...on qualities rather than performance" (1984: 72). The term '*being*' is used here by Schneider to encompass the assumption made by anthropologists that it was possible to discover an essence of 'true' relatedness based on substances and biological descent. He provides the alternative notion of '*doing*', which allows for kinship to be created through performance and process. The difference between '*being*' and '*doing*' can thus be understood as a distinction between biological and social constructions of kinship (72).

Janet Carsten (1995; 2000) expanded on Schneider's approach, to argue that despite Schneider's problematisation of the distinction between biological and social constructions of kinships, he never manages to escape it entirely. She explains that "indigenous statements and practices of relatedness are infinitely more dynamic and creative (or destructive) than an analysis of kinship predicated on a straightforward division between the biological and social domains would imply" (24). Carsten offers the term 'relatedness' as a solution by way of blurring the distinction:

My argument can be placed in the general context of an analysis of kinship that begins from native categories. I take for granted that the meaning of "kinship" cannot be assumed a priori. I use the term "relatedness" to indicate indigenous ways of acting out and conceptualizing relations between people, as distinct from notions derived from anthropological theory (Carsten 1995: 224).

In this chapter I follow Carsten's lead and use the notion of relatedness to explore participant experiences and discussions of familial relationships as migrants, and how they framed kinship while doing identity work. I examine the way relatedness is enacted and maintained through demonstrations of respect, sacrifice, care, participation, and obligation, both locally and across transnational boundaries. <sup>41</sup>

#### Transnationalism and Filipino Family Values

Recent research on transnational migration and the Filipino family has focused primarily on the experiences of Filipina labour migrants whose children and husbands remain in the Philippines while they pursue overseas employment (Asis, et al. 2004; Fresnoza-Flot 2009; McKay 2007b; Parreñas 2000; 2008a; 2008b; Parreñas 2005; Wolf 1997). Despite the wealth of scholarship in this area, and on women's experiences of transnational marriage migration, I found comparatively little information regarding the formation and continuation of ties between transnational migrants and their kin networks.<sup>42</sup>

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> This focus does not mean that participants do not have biological or sustenance based ideas of kinship, but rather that in their narratives they presented relatedness as demonstrated through 'doing', rather than the importance of blood ties. This could be because such ties are understood as so self-evident that they do not need to be mentioned, but further study would be required to provide evidence for this claim.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> As McKay (2007b) argues, the focus on Filipina labour migrants is potentially due to the belief of scholars that mothers are more appropriate caretakers than men, and thus the migration of women is understood to be harmful to their children who remain in the Philippines.

Rhacel Salazar Parreñas (2008b) discussed the importance of notions of the ideal family in the Filipino society. She explains that the 1987 *Family Code of the Republic of the Philippines* "recognizes the Filipino family as the foundation of the nation" (178), and that

with marriage and cohabitation at its core, the "Filipino family" follows the script of the modern nuclear family. By defining the Filipino family as nuclear, the Code not only establishes this arrangement as the norm but also as the embodiment of the "right kind of family." In fact, this kind of family reflects the dominant household pattern in the Philippines...As the "proper" household arrangement in the Code reflects that of the majority of families in the Philippines, we might conceivably consider the Code and its moral instructions to apply to the interests of the people (2008b: 178).

The normalisation and prioritisation of the nuclear family in the Family Code has broad implications for Filipino families. <sup>43</sup> Parreñas argues that it establishes that "maternity, understood to include the care of the family, is women's primary duty to the state" (2008b: 179). I explore the importance of motherhood and the demonstration of sacrifice as a means of enacting the role of a 'good' mother in the next section of this chapter.

In their study investigating the relationships between Filipina labour migrants abroad and the members of their families of origin in the Philippines, Asis et al. (2004) also note the importance of the family:

Despite the many changes that have taken root in Filipino society, no other social institution in the Philippines commands as much loyalty, sacrifice, and affection as does the family...Multiple sources – from the constitution of the Philippines – to

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Parreñas (2008b: 180) describes the 'nuclear family' as consisting of a cohabiting husband and wife, and any offspring.

casual comments in everyday conversation point to the importance of the family in the individual and collective life of the Filipino people

With reference to the previous chapter, participants in my study constructed the notion of the family as a key component of their identity as a Filipina migrant. Their migrant identities were consequently tied up with what it meant to be a good family member, woman, and for those who had children, mother. Filipina participants had family members located both locally, usually members of the nuclear family, and also transnational ties, primarily with family members in the Philippines, but also in Australia and the United States. They therefore had transnational family ties. Linda Basch et al. (2003 [1994]) provide the following useful definitions of transnationalism and transmigrants:

We define "transnationalism" as the process by which immigrants forge and sustain multi-stranded social relations that link together their societies of origin and resettlement. We call these processes transnationalism to emphasize that many immigrants today build social fields that cross geographic, cultural, and political borders. Immigrants who develop and maintain multiple relationships - familial, economic, social, organizational, religious, and political - that span borders we call "transmigrants" (7).

As Steven Vertovec (2004) argues, while the 'social fields' that are created give transmigrants a sense of simultaneously belonging to multiple places, transmigrants also often view the world through a 'dual frame of reference' through which they constantly compare their situation in their society of origin, to the situation in the host society (20). He points out that

such dispositions and practices have substantial impact on individual and family life course and strategies, individuals' sense of self and collective belonging, the ordering of personal and group memories, patterns of consumption, collective sociocultural practices, approaches to childrearing, and other modes of cultural reproduction (997).

In exploring these themes, I examine the performance and maintenance of kinship over multiple locations, and argue that transnational migration patterns allow participants to assist their families in the Philippines in the form of remittances, which in some cases creates an obligation. Furthermore, participants interpret these remittances to operate as acts of care through which kinship ties are maintained.

#### Sacrifice: The Role of Wives and Mothers

Participants in this research often discussed the roles of mothers and wives through narratives of acts of sacrifice. In this section I argue that participant notions of sacrifice were used as an expression of love, identity, and as a means of performing relatedness. Social psychologists Sarah Whitton, Scott Stanley, and Howard Markman (2002: See also Stanley et al. 2006; Whitton et al. 2007) argue that sacrifice can benefit to those who are sacrificing:<sup>44</sup>

sacrifice is associated with the sacrificer's own perceptions of having a more committed and healthily functioning relationship, and his or her greater satisfaction with the relationship. This is important to recognize, as it is strong evidence against the argument that sacrifices that better the relationship somehow come at the expense of the individual doing the sacrificing (2002: 162).

Thus acts of sacrifice can also be understood as acts of agency. As argued in the previous chapter, Filipinas are often depicted as submissive actors in popular stereotypes, whose sacrifices for their partners and their families are understood to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> While I could locate little anthropological or sociological research that dealt specifically with the notion of sacrifice in romantic or kin relationships, there were many examples of sacrifice in other areas. Examples include scholarship on the martyrdom of Palestinian youths (Pitcher 1998); the sacrifices made by nurses in order to provide patient care (Helin & Lindstrom 2003); and sacrifice in community decision making (Chong & Marshall 1999).

be at the expense of themselves as individuals (Ramos 2001). Such depictions construct sacrifice as a loss of agency. Yet I argue that narratives of sacrifice benefit participants as it allowed them to positively identify with Filipina identity, and also positioned participants as virtuous family members. Deidre McKay (2007a) noted the importance of narratives of sacrifice in her research with Filipina labour migrants:

Women justify their work abroad with reference to the 'Filipina' virtues of self-sacrifice and caring for family. Since being household-centred is both a desirable Filipina trait and a motive for working abroad, migrants speak of 'sacrificing' themselves through separation from their loved ones in order to provide for the economic needs of their families (McKay 2007a: 196; See also Stanley et al. 2006; Whitton et al. 2007; Leckie 2002).

Through examples of sacrifice in their narratives, participants were able to show that they were virtuous mothers, wives and Filipinas, while simultaneously demonstrating their individual agency within the structure of the kin relationship. For example, one participant's motivations for her initial migration differed from those narratives explored in McKay's work. The following example of sacrifice justifies her decision to marry a New Zealand man while demonstrating kin ties and obligations to her ex-husband's family. Gloria was forty-eight years old and lived on a farm near Whangarei with her husband and two of her three children. She moved to New Zealand fourteen years earlier at the suggestion of her exhusband's mother and sister who had migrated earlier from the Philippines, and at their insistence placed an advertisement in the personals section of a local newspaper. It was through this advertisement that she met her current husband.

A week after I arrive my ex's [family] advertise[d] my name in the papers. How good is that? "[...] educated Asian lady wants to meet someone" I still remember it, stupid Jan. [...] When they said to me "oh, we're going to put your name in the papers," I said "uh, whatever [...] [I don't care]" So they did. [...] So all in all I get 28, 29 letters. [...] Some have pictures, some doesn't. Some are good looking! [...] And

then this husband of mine, he send me [a picture with] a moustache – he look so ugly! [...] I said to myself, "ah, nah not this man," so I put him [at the bottom of the pile – the best were at the top of the pile].

She went on to describe her discomfort at finding a partner this way:

And then one day [...], maybe after a week [since placing the advertisement], my sister-in-law said 'you should try calling them because that's how it should be'. I call them. It's just like selling meat you know. "Hello! I'm the lady from the..." It's *so* annoying, and it's so shameful from my point of view. [...] But that's the way it is.

By describing that she felt 'shameful' and comparing her experience of finding a husband to "selling meat" Gloria actively referred to marketplace 'mail-order bride' stereotypes discussed in the second chapter, where women are understood to be 'bought' and 'sold' on the international market (Constable 2003a). This reference demonstrated her belief that the way she met her husband was less socially acceptable than methods like face-to-face meetings through friends and family members.

Gloria's narrative is complex. Her description of meeting her husband acts as a narrative device in which she placed the onus for finding a husband in this morally suspect manner on the members of her ex-husband's family. By doing this she is able to continue to situate herself as a good migrant, while simultaneously taking on board the role of a sacrificial mother and family member. Her agency in this case is relational in that her wishes and desires are intrinsically tied to the wishes and desires of others. Gloria explained to me that she made clear early on what she was looking for when she met her husband; in particular that she and her two sons from her first marriage were a "package deal". Thus, through describing her compliance with her ex-husband's family members, and also by meeting the needs of her children, Gloria is enacting a form of collective agency whereby the needs of herself and her kin members were complex and interlinked.

Concurrently, Gloria made it clear that it was up to her to choose a partner who best suited her. While she explained that it was her ex-husband's family who actively encouraged her to find a husband, she had the final choice. In her interview she described meeting up with only two of the men who had responded to her newspaper advertisement. The first was her now husband and the second was an ex-policeman who she did not like: "I'm definitely poor, but not, not desperate". So, Gloria demonstrated in her narrative that she had both an individual but also a collective form of agency. Her descriptions of sacrifice also demonstrate her agency to utilise narrative devices that portray her simultaneously as a strong woman who is able to make her own choices, but also as a sacrificial, virtuous, mother and kin member.

Furthermore, participant notions of sacrifice were influenced by Christian doctrine. As the majority of participants identified as Catholic, or were raised in a Christian family, it is worth exploring the importance of sacrifice in Christianity. Sacrifice plays a fundamental role in the Christian belief system as "Christ offered himself as a sacrifice for the forgiveness of sins for all" (Florezak 2004: 196). Sacrifice is thus linked to constructions of morality and of moral behaviour. Bellah et al. (1996) outline the idealised expectations of wife and mother within Christian marriage:<sup>45</sup>

At the crux of family life is the relationship between a man and a woman who become husband and wife, father and mother. The love that unites the marriage partners grows into the love between parents and children. It is the characteristic virtue of love that made the family appear as the locus of a morality higher than that of the world. Indeed, the "unselfish love" of a wife and mother for her husband and children was seen as the most visible example of morality itself (88).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Bellah et al (1996) refer specifically to American Christian marriages, but I believe the reference is applicable to the beliefs of my participants.

Thus, in order for a Christian woman to perform the role of a good wife or mother, she must demonstrate acts of "unselfish love," or in other words, she must be seen to sacrifice her own wants and needs as an individual for the benefit of her husband and children. However, as demonstrated in the discussion of Gloria's narrative, sacrifice and agency are not as oppositional as Bellah et al. claim; it is possible to interpret "unselfish love" as an act of agency *and* sacrifice.

Melissa described some of the difficulties that her husband experienced during his youth and, compared it with her own upbringing. This provides an example of the importance of a narrative of "unselfish love,"

[My husband's] family broke up. [My husband] was the youngest [child]. [...] His mum left [the family]. So he was left with his dad. His older sisters are all away from home already. [...] So he... he has this, [...] image of his mum as not really nice. Which is so hard for me to understand... because my mother [...] would do everything for me. Would sacrifice everything for me [...]. She's done a lot of hardship just to give us a good life. [...] Totally a [...] saint. [...] So that [my husband's experience] for me is like, 'no, don't hate your mum [...] she probably [...] had no choice' [...]. Because mums cannot just abandon their children [...]. Children can abandon their parents, but parents cannot abandon their children.

By juxtaposing the sacrificial and "saint" like qualities of her mother, with the self-interested mother-in-law who "abandoned" her son, Melissa constructs the exercise of individual agency as dangerous and potentially harmful. This conforms to stereotypes of Western women being less family orientated, and more selfish than their Filipina counterparts, and issue that is further explored in the next section.

Melissa's conceptualisation of relatedness between women and their offspring is narratively demonstrated in her claim that mother's "cannot just abandon their children," and her refusal to accept that her husband's mother could have left her son unless she had no other choice. Carsten's (2000) work applies here in that she

is actively "conceptualising relations between people" (224). To Melissa mothers and children are thus understood to be bound by a bond which is unbreakable and strengthened by acts of sacrifice.

### **Intergenerational Respect**

Melissa also spoke to me about the differences between her experiences in the Philippines and New Zealand when it came to settling family disputes, including domestic violence incidents. She argued that the lack of government organisations like Child Youth and Family Services in the Philippines, meant that issues were resolved within the family without the intervention of outside authorities whom she perceived to be invasive and potentially harmful:<sup>46</sup>

If there are disputes within that community, [...] it's fixed within [the] family. [...] Conflicts get settled [...] because we *respect* authorities. And we respect our older generations. Like for [...] for example if my sister and I, as an adult, fights [...] my mum and my dad [would step in and] we would listen to what they say. [...] And we would respect what they say because we know they are knowledgeable. They are wise. They are older. Or if my mum and dad are fighting, then they would have their mums or older sister or older brother [resolving the conflict]. [...] So yes. We respect authority [...] and then we get settled and we move on.

In Melissa's narrative "respect" acted as a means of social control. Her explanation implied a comparison between New Zealand and the Philippines, where the heightened respect for familial authority in the Philippines meant that

referring to.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> In her narrative Melissa included other members of her community in her description of the 'family' in this particular context. This indicates that there is potentially less division between notions of family and community in the Philippines than in the New Zealand context she is

external social services were deemed unnecessary.<sup>47</sup> Maria also noted differences in the level of respect shown to parents by children in the Philippines and New Zealand:

When I was working in the petrol station [in New Zealand] I have noticed, I'm sorry about this, I just noticed [...] young kids that didn't even [...] respect their parents. If they want something they just keep screaming there [in] the shop. And I was [...] just new at the time and, think[ing], "oh my God." [...] Cos, you know, if we do that our parents are going to be slap[ping] our face in front of people. And they start swearing to their mum. [...] But then when I get married I tried to teach my child not to do that way [...]. So I applied my, some of my culture, you know my, I applied it to my son, so it does work.

These narratives used anecdotes of intergenerational respect as a means by which to demonstrate the morally 'superior' elements of Filipino culture. Similarly, Yen Le Espritu (2001) explored the construction of Filipina morality by migrants in the United States, and argued that:

Shifting attention from the otherness of the subordinated group (as dictated by the "mainstream") to the otherness of the dominant group (as constructed by the "margins"...[helps us focus] on the alternative frames of meaning that racially subordinate groups mobilize to (re)define their status in relation to the dominant group....Female morality - defined as women's dedication to their families and sexual restraint - is one of the few sites where economically and politically dominated groups can construct the dominant group as other and themselves as superior (421).

2009).

90

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> This could also be a result of a weaker state structure in the Philippines where there is no comparable welfare system and citizens must rely on community support for assistance (Tyner

Using Espiritu's argument, it follows that by constructing New Zealand youth as disrespectful to their elders, Filipino children, and by extension their parents, are understood to be 'superior' in that they are better behaved and their parents are able to control them. Melissa's explanation of intergenerational respect being used as a means of social control also follows this logic. By engaging with the stereotype of Filipina women as family orientated, both Melissa and Maria, like Espiritu's participants, use their narratives to construct New Zealand families as Other in a way that defines them as being more family orientated, better parents, and with stronger ties to kin than New Zealanders.

The belief that Westerners are lacking when it comes to interpersonal family relations is demonstrated clearly in Elizabeth's comparison of care of the elderly in New Zealand and the Philippines:<sup>48</sup>

We respect people, especially the elderly [...]. Here [in New Zealand], even in Italy, you put elderly people in [...] elderly homes. But in the Philippines, [...] if there are [people in elderly homes], it's so, so, so, [...] few [...]. Because [...] we look after our parents until they die. So if all the children are married the, either the parents will live in one of [...] their sons or daughters [homes]. [...] It's quite different here. You, you just send your parents, parents to an elderly home or they just live alone, which is very sad. Yeah. Even in Italy it's just like that. And the sad thing is [that] the kids are already quarrelling [over] the inheritance. [...] They just put them in the elderly homes and, yeah, get the money. And sometimes forget to visit them.

Her condemnation of perceived practices regarding the care of the elderly highlights her belief that unlike Filipinos, Italians and New Zealanders (i.e. Westerners) do not respect their elderly and are more concerned about potential material gain than looking after their kin. It also hints at broader beliefs that in family matters, Filipinos are more caring and less selfish than Westerners.

<sup>4</sup> 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Elizabeth conflates New Zealand and Italian values throughout her interview, possibly as a result of spending several years in Italy as a nun and having only lived in New Zealand for just over twelve months at the time of her interview.

Elizabeth is engaging with Occidentalist notions of Western culture as being individualistic, and motivated by economic desires (Said 1978). By applying these stereotypes to New Zealanders, Elizabeth, like Maria and Melissa, also actively constructs Filipino culture as more caring, collectivist, and thus more morally virtuous. This links back to my previous chapter, where I discussed common stereotypes held of Filipinas and how participants situated themselves in regards to the perceptions outsiders held of them. Elizabeth's argument that Filipino's are more respectful of the elderly can also be understood as a form of oppositional identity work where she constructs her identity as a respectful Filipina in contrast to a negative New Zealand identity.

The presentation of Filipinos as 'superior' to New Zealanders when it comes to family matters stands in contrast to narratives in the second chapter where participants actively distanced themselves from the stereotype of the 'typical Filipina'. This shows the dynamic and shifting relationship participants had with stereotypes held of them, and that participants use and propagate stereotypes, or distance themselves from them, depending on the objective of their identity work in specific narrative contexts. It also demonstrates the fluidity and social construction of identity. Thus, participants utilised narratives of kinship throughout their interviews as a means to portray a sense of moral authority over the dominant culture.

#### Care

As was identified in the first chapter, acts of care were understood in participant narratives as demonstrations of love. In this section I explore participant discussions of remittances, and argue that they too act as demonstrations of care for family members. Notions of relatedness are also demonstrated, created, and maintained through the act of giving money and goods to those deemed important in their lives.

Participants demonstrated relatedness in their narratives through descriptions of transactional exchanges. Remittances between the New Zealand and the Philippines are common, and in many cases expected. Money is sent from those living in New Zealand, who are perceived as having significantly more access to wealth and other resources than those in the Philippines. This money often contributes to health and education costs that the family would otherwise be unable to afford.

Notions of 'care' and 'obligation' can again be used here to break down the analytical division between emotions and economics common in literature on Filipina marriage migration and transnational marriage migration more generally (Constable 2003a; 2009; Giddens 1992; Parreñas 2000). This distinction contributes to stereotypes and ideas in popular culture that are suspicious of Filipina - New Zealand marriages because they are seen to blur the domains between emotional relationships and the rational economic marketplace, which assumes Filipinas are marrying New Zealand, or Western, men a rationally calculated strategy to gain more money and an improved material existence. In this section I show that participants enacted and maintained kin ties to family members through remittances, while simultaneously challenging these stereotypes. In particular, participants framed remittance payments as acts of care through which they maintained their relationships whilst ensuring family members were also benefitting from their improved financial position. Lisa, for example, explained her reasons for sending money to her mother in Cebu:

I still help my Mum financially. I still send her money. [...] Not a lot, probably \$100 a month. Just to help them pay the bills and [...] it's, [...] common for Filipinas to send money home. Because they're quite poor there. [...] Especially if someone's sick in the Philippines, and because healthcare is not publicly funded, therefore whoever has something have to give [does so] [...]. Like for me, if a very close family member happens to be ill and [...] no one else would help, so you have to. [...] Sometimes it can put a lot of pressure to those who are outside of Philippines because they're the first ones that will be asked for help.

Lisa's remittances to her mother and other family members considered to be in need can be understood as an enactment of kinship. Instead of kinship ties being diminished by the physical separation created by migration, Lisa's move to New Zealand and subsequent marriage to a New Zealander enables her to access greater wealth and thus send remittances. This has meant for her, and other participants in my study, that one way in which to maintain kin ties is through meeting obligations to provide financial assistance in times of need. Care for her mother is demonstrated by "helping pay the bills".

In her article *Sending Dollars Shows Feeling*, Deidre McKay (2007b) explored the experiences of Filipina and Filipino labour migrants (c.f. Hochschild 1983; Parreñas 2005). She argued that sending money and goods to extended family members was understood as a means of performing and maintaining kinship. "intimate family relations expressed and maintained by economic exchanges form the ground for migrant subjectivities, as these subjectivities are revealed through the emotions of migrants" (192). While McKay's research focuses on the experiences of migrant workers more generally, her argument is relevant to my participants, as is exemplified by Lisa's narrative above.

Donna expressed a similar desire to assist family members in the Philippines, and explained to me her concerns regarding their situation. I met Donna and her partner Frank in their home in Hawera. At the time of the interview she had been unable to work in her job at a local rest home for two months while she waited for her work permit to be renewed or permanent residency to be granted by Immigration New Zealand. Her inability to send money to her sister, who was in need, or visit her mother made the wait difficult for Donna, who expressed a sense of frustration in her narrative:

Sometimes I get homesick. [...] It's really hard, you know, almost three years here. I miss everything what happened, you know, my mother's got sick all the time and I'm so much worried about her. [...] I talk [to her] on the phone and she said [...] and she said "hello how are you," I said, "don't worry about me ok, how are you?" [...]

That's why she retire[d] earlier because she always gets sick. And I tell her you should go, she should retire because, you know, the doctors already advise her to stop working. She needs a rest so.

Donna went on to explain that her sister was reliant on her and their mother for financial support:

One of my sisters lost her husband [...] [I] Talk[ed] to my sister last week. She cried and cried [...], she's asking [for] money from me. So [I was thinking] "oh my God, I don't have work, I don't have income [...] So, how can I send you money?" 'Cos she got three children, [...] Her [...] [youngest] is one year. [...] She can't [...] work 'cos no one to look after her baby. [...] So just stay at home. [...] She get a pension but [...] it's only about sixty dollars, in New Zealand dollars, it's only sixty dollars a month. [...] Her eldest and the second one is going to school and, you know they travel every day. And she doesn't have enough money [...] for their travel. [...] So that's why she ask [for money]. She ring again to my mum and ask some money from [her]. My mum send her money but not that much, and that's ok but I don't know what's... I don't know what [will] happen now.

Donna's description of concern for her family and desire to help them despite the physical distance between them demonstrated a sense of responsibility toward her mother, sister, and her sister's children who remain in the Philippines. By showing that her family was reliant on her, Donna actively constructed her identity as a caring kin member, and also countered the stereotype that she married a New Zealander for the self-serving purposes of enjoying a more materialistic lifestyle. Her worries over what would happen if she did not gain employment in the near future provide further evidence of her sense of self as intertwined with the identity of her family members.

Asis et al. (2004) also notes the importance of exchange in maintaining family ties in their study:

Reciprocal exchanges and mutual assistance among kith and kin not only cement the ties that bind family members, but also sensitise family members to one another's needs, thereby encouraging individual members to pursue ends that are intended to uplift the family, not just the individual. The individual-family nexus thus is theoretically seamless: the family is a source of emotional, economic, material and social support for the individual; in return, individual family members strive to promote the interests of the family. In a society where institutionalised social security arrangements have yet to develop fully, the family performs a variety of functions to take care of the needs of individual members throughout their life stages (202).

The notion of taking care of family members throughout their life course links back to the previous section's discussion of intergenerational respect. Sending goods and money back to the Philippines acts as a means of demonstrating respect to family members, especially parents as they get older and become more senior family members. Furthermore, care in this sense can be understood as a form of sacrifice in that participants are sacrificing money they could have used for themselves and their immediate family in New Zealand for the good of their extended family. For example, Faier (2007) states that:

Married women went to great lengths to demonstrate their selflessness. Most regularly sent large amounts of money and gifts to their families in the Philippines. When women returned home for visits, they brought large boxes of goods ranging from television sets to packages of instant ramen to distribute among friends and family. Through consumption, display, and gift exchange, Filipina migrants demonstrated their commitments to their families abroad and reinforced the idea that they had not gone to Japan simply for selfish economic interests (155).

The act of remitting money to the Philippines is thus a demonstration of care, sacrifice, and respect, and is a key means of performing and maintaining kinship relations.

#### **Participation**

While sending remittances back to the Philippines was used as a means of enacting kinship across the distance between the New Zealand and the Philippines, participants also described the importance of keeping in touch with family members and attending significant family events such as funerals. Returning to the Philippines was considered difficult by participants due to the expensive airline tickets and other costs involved. Some participants had made plans to return home, but had not yet been able to finance the trip. Modern communication technologies such as the telephone and internet, and software such as email, Skype, and Facebook, were used by all participants to maintain ties with family in the Philippines.

Wilding (2006) found that transnational migrants from England living in Australia felt that the instantaneity of modern technology such as email and cellphones, allowed migrants to "overlook their physical separation by time and space – even if only temporarily" (132). This "imagined proximity" was also enhanced by the increased frequency of communication compared with older forms such as sending letters through the postal system. While Wilding (2006: 134) points out that the "connected presence" is at times insufficient, particularly in times of tragedy, Jennifer found that it allowed her to participate in her father's funeral which was otherwise too expensive for her to attend.

Jennifer: I had the option of going back sometime last December, [...] because my Dad passed away. But we were also in the process of moving here [into this house]. And when we asked about tickets, the quote came back to us at \$6000. I said "this is crazy. My Dad's not going to like it. So I'm not going."

So, I [...] watched the funeral and the mass and all [...] online at Skype. [...]
So, it was almost like being there, although not being there. [...] My niece...

Michael: Brought a laptop with [...] a wireless connection and lined it up with Skype,

so she carried the laptop in front of her and put it down on a pew at church

and [through that we] watched the...

Jennifer: Service [...] And then when they walked to the [...] burial site... [...] it cut

off exactly about an hour after. [...] It just dropped out exactly when it was

finished.

Jennifer claimed that while she would have preferred to have been there physically, her virtual attendance of the funeral was sufficient. Her use of modern technology to participate in a significant family event also allowed her to demonstrate her presence at the event, without the expense and difficulty of the journey there. This shows that when participants are unable to physically attend events that they would otherwise be obligated to attend, they are able to maintain kinship ties by participating through modern technology. Furthermore, the importance of the attendance of a parent's funeral also serves as evidence of notions of relatedness between parents and children in Filipino society.

Researchers exploring the relationships between Filipina migrant mothers and their children also noted the importance of modern communications in the maintenance of kinship ties (for example Parreñas 2008b; Parreñas 2005). McKay (2007b) explains that despite the distance between themselves and their children, her participants felt that any downfalls were countered by the improved lifestyle and greater respect gained from overseas work, and that "while they now express care for their son through telephone calls, text messages, and gifts, their premigration circumstances had not allowed them to be nurturing parents" (187). This example serves to demonstrate that physical separation can be largely overcome in order to enact kinship relationships.

While in the case of Jennifer, technology enabled a sense of connectedness and participation despite physical distances, not all participants found it to be as beneficial. As Raelene Wilding points out:

Although 'connected presence' gives the appearance of the annihilation of distance, it can also result in an increased guilt and anxiety when the distance becomes evident again through tragedy. The very real limitations of distance are also clear when someone becomes ill or requires personal care. In some circumstances, a telephone call or email is simply not sufficient to show care for kin in need (2006: 134).

Donna's anxious phone calls to her mother and sister in the Philippines discussed earlier reflect this claim, as despite being in frequent contact with her family, (in her interview Donna stated that she spoke with her mother over the phone almost daily), her inability to help her mother or sister when they were in need made the distance between them that much more salient. Being a good family member in this case meant being involved in the lives of parents and siblings through the use of modern technology. By showing that they are actively involved in the lives of family members in the Philippines through participation in everyday life and family events, participants continued to perform identity work in their narratives, constructing themselves as virtuous family members.

#### **Choice and Obligation**

However, not all participants described modern communication technologies as beneficial, and spoke instead of frustrations created by the expectations of family members in the Philippines with who they maintained contact. In a similar vein, Wilding (2006) found that for British migrants living in Australia,

Some migrants regretted the ways in which new ICTs [information communication technologies] reduced their capacity to sustain a sense of distance. Some interviewees migrated precisely because their found their home country socially or culturally

stifling or their kin dominating and difficult. An increased capacity to connect with home enabled those feelings of suffocation and restriction to extend across time and space (135-6).

In her interview Gloria explained that despite coming to a 'wealthier' country, she ended up with less access to money than she had access to in the Philippines. On her arrival in New Zealand, family members remaining in the Philippines expected that her status as an ex-pat married to a New Zealander would result in her being able to send them more money, regardless of her unemployment:

They [think] everybody outside the Philippines are rich. They keep on texting, email, Facebook: money, money, money, money. [...] Sometimes you give in because sometimes they really need it. [...] When I came here, [...] I told everyone, all my relatives, "I don't have a job", because when I was there [living in the Philippines] that's what they do to me. That's why they love me [...], I always give, give, give. And then when I came here I said, "no money, [...] I don't work". It stopped... Nobody ask for money, [not] even my brother. [...] So now, when they learn that I'm working... Every time you put the *Facebook*, they call you 'Aunty' or 'Tita' – "oh, I need money for this, and money for that". I say "well too bad. I'm wiping bums. Too expensive."

Gloria narrated her kin connections, and subsequent obligations to those kin members, as demanding and overbearing. She negotiates these relationships by explaining to her family members that she was unemployed, which meant that even though she was living in New Zealand, she had no money to send back. This shows that demonstrations of financial 'care' were dynamic, and reflect shifting cycles of fortune and dependence within a wider kin network. Gloria's reluctance to send money home may also in part be due to her husband's notions of kinship. Despite the fact that Gloria was his wife, he did not share her obligations to her kin and was therefore unwilling to provide financial support. This demonstrates

that participants had to negotiate differing cultural ideals about what an ideal family was, and what obligations to family members should entail.

In contrast, Noel, Lisa's husband, also talks about remittances. He demonstrates that feelings of Gloria's husband were not shared by all New Zealand men. He explains that to him remittances are a form of taking care of family:

The thing about sending money home to look after your family? That's very much an Asian thing too. I had to get used to that as well. [...] A lot of Kiwi men won't. They'll put their foot down and say "no". [...] They say "I will allow you to go and get a job for yourself, and you can send money home that way." [...] Which is odd, because when I was brought up [I was taught that] you looked after your family.

To Noel the parents and siblings of his wife have become his own kin through his marriage to Lisa. This meant that he shared in Lisa's desire to care for her family through the sending of financial support.

Michael Peletz (2001) recognized the ambivalent nature of kinship as it had been discussed in anthropology:

In his first monograph on the Nuer, E. E. Evans-Pritchard... recognized that kinship as a moral system necessarily cuts both ways, and that the double edged nature of kinship stems partly from the fact that kinship is heavily freighted with moral entailments in the form of expectations and obligations that are often burdensome or impossible to fulfil (Peletz 2001: 415).

This 'double edged nature of kinship' played out in the lives of participants when they discussed not only obligations that other family members placed on them, but expectations of their own that they placed on kin. Gloria's ambivalence outlined in the section on care demonstrated that whilst kinship connections were often presented to me as examples of Filipinos being more family orientated than New

Zealanders, these relationships could also be fraught with frustrations and, at times, resistance. This serves as a further example of the dynamic nature of narratives and participants ideas of agency. Notions of agency shift depending on the intention of the participant. At times participants constructed narratives that demonstrated their agency within webs of obligation, and at other times agency involved negating or finding a means of operating outside these webs. Gloria utilised both forms in her narratives by first describing how she met her husband in terms of meeting obligations to her husband's kin and her children, and later when she sought to escape the obligation to send money to family in the Philippines.

Gloria further justified her reluctance to send money by expressing her frustration that her brother and his daughter do not want to move to New Zealand, despite her and her mother being willing to fund parts of the journey. Having financially assisted her niece through nursing school, she is upset when her niece announces that she is going to get married, rather than moving to New Zealand:

I have a brother. We're only two. He's automatic if he comes here. [...] If you are four in your family, and two of them in NZ, the other two are automatic if you come here. [...] But my brother's not interested! That's what the annoying part was. [...] We already had a passport, all he has to do is to file his leave... and then come here. [...] He has a daughter who finish nursing in the Philippines. [And we] Keep sending money for her to finish, and she finally finish, and then we went home 209 [2009], I gave them money for the passport, [...] my mum sent money again for her to have an English exam thing because I think that's [...] the requirements for nurses... From different country is to come here is to pass that English test thing. [...] And she did[n't] do that. And then the other day I had a text from her say 'I'm going to get married'. [...] You wanna kill her. [...] I said to her "look, well it's your choice. It means if you're not coming here, nobody's coming here."

Lisa and Noel likewise expressed frustration with the decisions of a close family member whom they had assisted financially. Lisa and Noel organised for Lisa's nursing qualifications to be transferred to New Zealand, with the intention that she would live nearby. But instead of moving to be close by Lisa as was hoped, she has moved to Christchurch with her Filipino boyfriend. They had originally planned to bring their parents over through the family quota immigration category as soon has she was settled, but her sister decided to bring her boyfriend over on the partnership immigration category instead. While this does not stop Lisa from being able to bring out her parents at a later date, she expressed frustration at her sister prioritising her boyfriend over her familial obligations. Tensions existed between families of origin and relationships of choice.

She's a nurse. She was a nurse in the Philippines when, before she came and [...] was nursing in Wellington hospital for a while. And, uh, the boyfriend [...] couldn't find a good job, his English is very poor, and he's got attitude problems as well, so he cannot stay in one job. [...] Of course my sister is... she's so mad, she's completely in love with this guy... [...] "Wherever he is I'll follow." So off she went.

Despite these frustrations, Noel outlined their intentions to bring more members of Lisa's family over to New Zealand.

The other thing we're thinking of doing is, I get my bonus next month, that'll be good, bringing her mum back over here, permanently. [...] That'll sort out the childcare issue. [...] So we'll leave the youngest daughter there, because she's independent, she's working in a childcare facility. [...] The youngest boy can come over here, because he has um, some learning difficulties. [...] Although when he gets over here, he'll be what 16, and he's got a keen interest in cooking. [...] so there might be a polytech course that'd be good for him.

Here it is apparent that he believes he knows what is best for them, and that they should come to New Zealand for the benefit of everyone in the family. His status

as someone with access to funds allows him the ability to give money to his wife's family so that they can come to New Zealand, and presumably also gain access to economic opportunities.

Noel's desire for his wife's family to migrate to New Zealand is based on his belief that family members should help one another. 'Bringing' them to New Zealand is also a strategic move on Noel's part in that not only does he believe that it will be of benefit for them to move to New Zealand to take advantage of the economic and education opportunities available, but it would also be an advantage to him and Lisa in that they would have Lisa's mother to rely on for childcare, but also for emotional support. This statement also demonstrates some of Noel's understandings about the economic disparities between New Zealand and the Philippines. By moving away from the at-times poverty stricken Philippines, and into New Zealand, it is assumed that Filipinos will have the opportunity to make more money, and therefore have a better life than what would have been possible in the Philippines. This narrative thus downplays the difficulties that many Filipinos face when coming into New Zealand with getting jobs, furthering education, and accessing social networks and community, particularly if there are language barriers. By describing a move to New Zealand as desirable for Lisa's family members he reinforces both his own narrative and that of Lisa's that her migration to New Zealand was a positive experience and can be linked to narratives of success mentioned earlier.

# **Concluding Remarks**

The narratives given by participants in interviews for this project have supported the assertion by David Schneider and Janet Carsten that kinship ties are created through *doing* rather than simply *being*. I argue that participants constructed the notion of the family as a key component of their identity as a Filipina migrant, kin member, woman, and mother.

In the Philippines the notion of the ideal family is exemplified through the use of the ideal 'nuclear family' as a basis upon which Filipino society is based (Parreñas 2008a). Participants perform the role of an ideal kin member through remitting goods and resources to the Philippines, and carrying out acts of sacrifice, argued in this chapter to be understood as a form of agency. I have used the narrative of Gloria and others to demonstrate the complexities of such notions. Gloria was simultaneously enacting a form of collective agency in which the needs of herself and her kin members were interlinked, and at the same time exercising agency as an individual as she was able to choose a husband she liked. Remittances and the use of modern technology also allowed participants to demonstrate care transnationally, enact kin relationships, and exhibit their identity as a virtuous kin member.

Some participants described feelings of ambivalence regarding experiences of transnational maintenance, and were frustrated by expectations to enact an identity as a caring, sacrificial kin member. These descriptions demonstrated complexities of these kinds of kin relationships, and further illustrate that kinship is a process whereby obligations can be negotiated and also change over time. The shifts in Gloria's narrative show how participants described acting within webs of obligation, and at other times sought to demonstrate outside agency. Participant discussions regarding kinship thus serve to demonstrate the complex and dynamic nature of narratives and shifting ideas of agency. Discussions regarding intergenerational respect were utilised in Filipina narratives as a means by which participants were able to demonstrate 'morally superior' elements of Filipino culture (Espiritu 2001). In contrast to the narratives given in the second chapter where participants distanced themselves from their construction of a 'typical' Filipina, participants in this chapter constructed the New Zealand family as Other. In this case they identified as Filipina, and thus present themselves as more family orientated, better parents, and with stronger ties to kin. Conversely the New Zealand family was portrayed in relation to broader stereotypes of individualism and egocentrism in the West (Giddens 1991). This can be understood as an example of the strategic manipulation of stereotypes by participants. By incorporating the stereotype of the family orientated Filipina,

participants narratively contrasted themselves with perceived New Zealand notions of family, through which they were able to demonstrate their identity as a virtuous and moral migrant.

# **Conclusion**

In this project I sought to understand the way Filipina migrants and their New Zealand partners expressed their lived experiences, and narratively controlled and manipulated stereotypes in order to present a successful and virtuous migrant identity. Interviews were conducted with eleven participants, seven of whom were Filipina migrants, and four were New Zealand men. The chapters of this thesis consisted of the analysis of participant narratives, which were theoretically explored in relation to the current literature on transnational migration, Filipina migration, and marriage migration. Their narratives were also explicated using anthropological theories of stereotypes, love, and kinship.

The first chapter focused on how participants strategically used narratives of love and romance to demonstrate the authenticity of their relationships, and thus position themselves as successful migrants. I also argued that participant usage of notions of care, commitment, trust, and fate act to collapse the dichotomy between economics and emotion found in earlier migration literature.

I have built on this discussion in chapter two by demonstrating how participants narratively distanced themselves from popular stereotypes of Filipinas as subservient wives, maids, and mail-order brides. Participants did this by constructing negative stereotypes as Other, thus reinforcing rather than denying their existence. They then created an alternative, not 'typical' Filipina identity to represent themselves as successful, modern migrants, whilst maintaining a continuous ethnic identity.

Furthermore, in the third chapter I described how participants created a Filipina identity that they strongly associated with stereotypes of Filipinas as good mothers and family members. Participants constructed Filipina family values as morally superior in contrast with what they had seen in New Zealand. By comparing values held in the two nations, they were able to present themselves as

more virtuous than the dominant New Zealand culture. This chapter also demonstrated how participants enacted complex notions of agency in their narratives, at times simultaneously portraying collective and individual agency in their actions. This highlighted the complex and often contradictory nature of narratives.

Overall, this thesis explored the narrative complexities presented by Filipina migrants and their partners. I have highlighted numerous ways participants undertook identity work and engaged with and reinforced popular notions of love, marriage, migration, and kinship in their interviews. In particular I have explored strategies employed by Filipina migrants in constructing narratives that position themselves as separate from negative stereotypes, while incorporating more positive typologies into their identities. These strategies demonstrated the ways participants sought to control and manipulate stereotypes in order to present themselves as successful and virtuous migrants.

While original in its exploration of the lived experiences of Filipina migrants who have married or entered into de-facto relationships with New Zealand men, this thesis does not exist in an intellectual vacuum. As I have demonstrated throughout this work, there is a large body of existing literature examining motivations behind migration, experiences of migrants, and what it means to be Filipina (for example Constable 2003a; Faier 2007; Faier 2009; McKay 2007a; Nakamatsu 2005; Patico 2009; 2010; Schaeffer-Grabiel 2005; Suzuki 2003). Current theory on stereotypes and identity work as a means to understand participant narratives has also been highlighted (Pickering 2001; Snow & Anderson 1987).

Through investigating the literature on marriage migration I was able to see a trend occurring over the last three decades. Scholars first attempted to explain motivations behind migration, often using problematic 'push-pull' theories that frequently understood female migrants as victims of social and economic structures (Glodava & Onizuka 1994; Kim 2011; Ramos 2001; So 2006). In reaction to what they saw as a misrepresentation of female marriage migration, in the following decade researchers sought to highlight demonstrations of agency by

women who engaged in correspondence relationships (Constable 2003a; Faier 2009; Suzuki 2004). More recent studies have since built on that groundwork and sought to privilege the perspective of participants in order to gain a greater understanding of their lived experiences (Bulloch & Fabinyi 2009; Faier 2007; McKay 2007a). Through the exploration of participant narratives, this research engages with and contributes to the later bodies of research by demonstrating participant agency in their ability to manipulate stereotypes in order to present themselves as ideal migrants. By focusing on participant identity construction I have thus moved beyond the understanding of female migrants as victims, and have highlighted the lived experiences of Filipina migrants living in contemporary New Zealand.

# Limitations, Contributions, and Suggestions for Future Research

As outlined in the introductory chapter, entering the field for this project was more difficult than anticipated. I had initially expected the majority of my participant population to reside in the local Wellington area, and despite attempts to dispel uncertainty by meeting up with and getting endorsements from Filipina women in the local community, only one couple came forward from the region. Due to comments made in the initial meetings with community members that local Filipinas were wary of being portrayed as mail-order brides, I believe that the difficulties I experienced were directly related to the popular stereotypes of Filipinas discussed in the second chapter of this thesis. The majority of participants resided in Nelson and were recruited through the networks of a well-connected participant. This was advantageous because the rapport I had developed with the initial participant meant that her friends were more willing to trust me as a researcher, however as their narratives built on one another's common experiences and shared social network, it limits the representativeness of the sample.

Future research that included a larger sample of participants over a wider geographical area would allow for the arguments presented in this thesis to be broadened and explored in more depth. A longer period of participant observation would allow for increased development of trust and rapport with participants. This would be advantageous as I found that in conducting interviews I had to develop a relationship with participants very quickly, which at times made asking personal questions difficult and participants responses less forthcoming.

A further limitation in my study, and indeed in much of the literature on marriage migration, is its exclusive focus on heterosexual couples. Future research exploring the experiences of same sex couples where one party is a migrant would add further depth to, and offer a critique of contemporary marriage migration scholarship.

Further exploration into the backgrounds of the partners would build on and add considerable depth to this area of scholarship. As research on marriage migration has tended to focus on the experience of the migrant, I argue that in the area of marriage migration the experience of those in the host nation, particularly of partners of migrants' remains unexplored.

By exploring the dialogue between participant self-perception, and the perception of outsiders, I have revealed some of the nuances and complexities contained in participant narratives. This thesis applies current scholarship on stereotypes and identity work through the demonstration of how participants used, rejected, and manipulated cultural typologies in their narratives to portray a positive migrant identity. Additionally, it contributes to contemporary scholarship on marriage migration by expanding a focus on participant agency to acknowledging how migrants utilise identity resources, in this case stereotypes, in their host society.

The argument put forward in this thesis is relevant to a broad audience. Firstly, and perhaps most importantly, popular stereotypes of Filipina migrants as victims are challenged – both through a review of the literature, but also through the expression of participant experiences in their narratives. As little research has been conducted in New Zealand looking specifically at Filipina-New Zealand couples, this thesis contributes to the larger body of scholarship on marriage

migration and inter-cultural relationships. The breaking down of the analytical divide between economics and emotions provides a challenge to scholarship that is created based on the notion that those who enter into correspondence relationships need protecting from each other. While I acknowledge that some of these relationships are problematic, I contend that the participant narratives in this study serve to challenge the assumption that foul play occurs in all cases. Furthermore, this project has policy implications in that by collapsing the divide between economics and emotions, the criteria required to determine the legitimacy of a relationship, particularly in reference to granting residence permits is rendered problematic.

In this thesis I have analysed narratives, demonstrating the ways participants constructed identities and performed identity work through their narratives. Through this analysis, I argue that participants are demonstrating individual agency by actively constructing their identities in relation to popular stereotypes and assumptions. This research builds on contemporary literature on transnational marriage migration by exploring not only the way in which women demonstrate agency but also by focusing on the lived experiences of my participants. As there is little other research on Filipina-New Zealand relationships there is a wide scope for future scholarship in this area, particularly in the exploration of the experiences of the New Zealand partners of transmigrants.

# **Appendices**

# Appendix A: Demographic Chart

	Jennifer	Michael	Noel	Lisa	Elizabeth	Dennis	Donna	Frank	Melissa	Gloria	Maria
Age	43	Unknown (declined response)	49	34	48	Unknown	38	53	40	48	38
Location	Nelson	Nelson	Wellington	Wellington	Nelson	Nelson	Hawera	Hawera	Nelson	Whangarei	Nelson
Occupation	'Home administrator'	Dental technician/co mpany director	Technical Analyst	Registered Nurse	Factory Worker	Unknown	Nursing home care-worker	Meat works worker	Community worker	Nursing home care worker	Self-employed
Year of Marriage	2007 (to Michael)	2007 (to Jennifer)	2003 (to Lisa)	2003 (to Noel)	2009 (to Dennis)	2009 (to Elizabeth)	N/A	N/A	2000	1996	2007 (currently separated)
Time in NZ	4 years, 9 months	Since birth	Since birth	7 years	1 year, 11 days	Since birth	3 years	Since birth	10 years	14 years	12
Education	Bachelor of Science and Commerce	Dental technology, diploma in horticulture and agriculture	Two bachelor's degrees. Linguistics and German	Bachelor's in teaching (Philippines) Bachelors in Nursing (NZ)	Bachelor of Science in Civil Engineering	High School Certificate, Certificate in Social Services	Trained as midwife	High School Certificate	Bachelor's degree in Mechanical Engineering	College graduate	Bachelor of Commerce, Management and Accounting

	Jennifer	Michael	Noel	Lisa	Elizabeth	Dennis	Donna	Frank	Melissa	Gloria	Maria
Previous Employment in Philippines	Media and communicatio	N/A	N/A	Teacher	Teacher and Nun	N/A	Midwife	N/A	Entertainer / musician	Legal secretary	Unknown
Marital Status	Married	Married	Married	Married	Married	Married	De-facto Relationship	De-Facto Relationship	Married	Married	Separated (in de-facto relationship with 'half' Filipino man)
Previous Marriage(s)	Previously married in Philippines	Unclear	First marriage annulled	None	None (ex Nun)	At least one previous marriage (Divorced)	None	At least one previous marriage (divorced)	First marriage Annulled	Previously married in Philippines	Previous marriage to New Zealand man
Partner occupation	Dental Technician/Co mpany Director	'Home administrator'	Nurse	Technical Analyst	Unknown	Factory Worker	Meat works worker	Nursing home care-worker	Engineer	Farmer / construction worker	Engineer (current partner)
Religious Affiliation	Catholic	Unknown	Catholic	Catholic	Catholic	Catholic	Catholic	Unknown	Catholic	Catholic	Catholic

# **Appendix B: Consent Form**



#### VICTORIA UNIVERSITY OF WELLINGTON

#### **CONSENT TO PARTICIPATION IN RESEARCH**

# **Experiences of Filipina Migrants Married to New Zealand Men**

I have been given and have understood an explanation of this research project. I have had an opportunity to ask questions and have them answered to my satisfaction. I understand that I may withdraw myself or any information I have provided from this project before data collection and analysis is complete without having to give reasons or without penalty of any sort.

I understand that any information I provide will be kept confidential to the researcher, and her supervisor, that the published results will not use my name, and that no opinions will be attributed to me in any way that will identify me.

I understand that information or opinions I have provided will be reported confidentially in any pieces of writing regarding this research.

I consent to this interview being recorded (optional).

I would like a copy of the recordings of my interview returned to me at the conclusion of the project.

I understand that I can pull out up to two months after the interview without explanation
I understand that the data I provide will not be used for any other purpose or released to
others

I would like to receive a summary of the results of this research when it is completed.

I agree to take part in this research

Signed:

Name of participant:

Date:

Phone number:

Email:

# **Appendix C: Interview Schedule**

# Where did you live before you moved to New Zealand?

- Have you lived in any other countries?

# Tell me about your journey to New Zealand

- What was it like when you first arrived?
- What was it like trying to adjust? What was different?

# What was the immigration process like?

- What processes did you have to go though?
- Did you have any problems?

# Have you been back to the Philippines?

- How often do you go back?

# Who do you live with?

# Are there any members of your family in NZ?

- Do they live near you?

# Who are your friends here?

- Do you belong to any community groups? (Churches etc?)

# Is your husband's family different to the one you grew up in?

- How so?
- Do they do different things?

# Do you go to community events that are not for Filipinos (like perhaps school galas)?

Do you help with the organisation?

# Do you know other NZ/Filipina couples?

# Do people ask you how you met your husband?

- What do you tell them?
- Why do they ask you?
- How does this make you feel?

Do you know of anyone who has experienced racism, or been made to feel uncomfortable about being from the Philippines?

- How did you/they deal with that?
- Have you experienced racism?

# Appendix D: Demographic Questionnaire



# Demographic Questionnaire

Please fill out this survey. If you do not wish to answer a question leave the space blank or state why, if a question does not apply to you please write 'N/A' (not applicable).

Name
Age
Where do you l <del>ive?</del>
How long have you been living in New Zealand?
What is your occupation?
What is the highest level of education that you have
completed?
What is the highest level of education that your
husband/wife has completed?
What were/are your parent's occupations?
What is your husband/wife's occupation?
What is your religious a <u>ffiliation?</u>
What is your current marital status?
118

When did you get married?
Is this your first marriage?
13 this your first marriage:
How many children do you have?
What are their ages?
Are they all from your current marriage/relationship?

# **Bibliography**

# Abu-Lughod, Lila

1986 Veiled Sentiments: Honor and Poetry in a Bedouin Society. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.

# Adams, Matthew

2004 Whatever Will Be, Will Be: Trust, Fate, and the Reflexive Self. Culture & Psychology 10:387-408.

# Aguilar Jr, Filomeno V.

2003 Global Migrations, Old Forms of Labor, and New Transnational Class Relations. Southeast Asian Studies 41(2):137-61.

# Agustín, Laura María

2007 Sex at the Margins: Migration, Labour Markets and the Rescue Industry. London: Zed Books Ltd.

#### Ahearn, Laura M.

2001 Language and Agency. Annual Review of Anthropology 30(1):109-37.

\_\_\_

2004 Literacy, Power, and Agency: Love Letters and Development in Nepal. Language and Education 18(4):305-16.

#### Alasuutari, Pertti

1995 Researching Culture: Qualitative Methods and Cultural Studies. London: Sage Publications.

# Amato, Paul R., and Danelle D. DeBoer

2001 The Transmission of Marital Instability Across Generations: Relationship Skills or Commitment to Marriage. Journal of Marriage and Family 63(4):1038-51.

# Amrith, Megha

2010 'They Think We are Just Caregivers': The Ambivalence of Care in the Lives of Filipino Medical Workers in Singapore. The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology 11(3):410-27.

# Andrade, Xavier

2002 "Culture" as Stereotype: Public Uses in Ecuador. *In* Anthropology Beyond Culture. R.G. Fox and B.J. King, eds. Pp. 235-257. Oxford, New York: Berg Publishers.

# Appadurai, Arjun

1990 Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy. Public Culture 2(2)1-23.

# Arguillas, Marie Joy B., and Lindy Williams

2010 The Impact of Parents' Overseas Employment on Educational Outcomes of Filipino Children. International Migration Review 44(2):300-319.

# Asis, Maruja Milagros B., Shirlena Huang, and Brenda S. A. Yeoh

2004 When the Light of the Home is Abroad: Unskilled Female Migration and the Filipino Family. Singapore Journal of Tropical Geography 25(2):198-215.

#### Askoy, Asu, and Kevin Robins

2008 Banal Transnationalism: The Difference That Television Makes. *In* The Media of Diaspora. Karim H. Karim ed. Pp. 89-104. London: Routledge.

#### Bahramitash, Roksana

2005 Liberation from Liberalization: Gender and Globalization in Southeast Asia. New York: Zed Books.

# Barlow, Georgia

2009 The Cosmopolitan Guide to Online Dating: A Practical Guide for Dating Divas. London: JR Books.

# Basch, Linda, Nina Glick Schiller, and Cristina Szanton Blanc

2003 [1994] Nations Unbound: Transnational Projects, Postcolonial Predicaments, and Deterritorialized Nation-States. New York: Routledge.

# Bauman, Richard

1975 Verbal Art as Performance. American Anthropologist 77(2):290-311.

#### Beck-Gernsheim, Elisabeth

2007 Transnational Lives, Transnational Marriages: A Review of the Evidence from Migrant Communities in Europe. Global Networks 7(3):271-88.

# Beck, Ulrich, and Elisabeth Beck-Gernsheim

1995 The Normal Chaos of Love. Translated by M. Ritter and J. Wiebel. Cambridge: Blackwell Publishers Ltd.

#### Bellah, Robert N., et al.

1996 Habits of the Heart: Individualism and Commitment in American Life. Second edition. Berkeley: University of California Press.

# Bernard, H. Russell

1994 Research Methods in Anthropology: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc. .

#### Blackburn, Mollie V.

2002 Disrupting the (Hetero)Normative: Exploring Literacy Performances and Identity Work with Queer Youth. Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy 46(4):312-24.

# Bönisch-Brednich, Brigitte

2002 Keeping a Low Profile: An Oral History of German Immigration to New Zealand. Wellington: Victoria University Press.

# Boyd, Monica

1989 Family and Personal Networks in International Migration: Recent Developments and New Agendas. International Migration Review 23(3):638-70.

# Braziel, Jana Evans

2008 Diaspora: An Introduction. Malden: Blackwell Publishing.

# Breger, Rosemary, and Rosanna Hill

1998 Introducing Mixed Marriages. *In* Cross-Cultural Marriage: Identity and Choice. R. Breger and R. Hill, eds. Pp. 1-32. Oxford and New York: Berg.

#### Britt Flemmen, Anne

2008 Transnational Marriages - Empirical Complexities and Theoretical Challenges. An Exploration of Intersectionality. Nordic Journal of Feminist and Gender Research 16(2):114-129.

# Bujra, Janet

2000 Risk and Trust: Unsafe Sex, Gender and Aids in Tanzania. *In* Risk Revisited. P. Caplan, ed. Pp. 59-84. London: Pluto Press.

#### Bulloch, Hannah

2009 In Pursuit of Progress: Narratives of Transformation on a Philippine Island, The Australian National University.

# Bulloch, Hannah, and Michael Fabinyi

2009 Transnational Relationships, Transforming Selves: Filipinas Seeking Husbands Abroad. The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology 10(2):129-42.

# Byrne, Bridget

2003 Reciting the Self: Narrative Representations of the Self in Qualitative Interviews. Feminist Theory 4(1):29-49.

# Cahill, Desmond

1990 Intermarriages in International Contexts: A Study of Filipina Women Married to Australian, Japanese, and Swiss Men. Quezo Phillipines: Scalabrini Migration Centre.

# Carsten, Janet

1995 The Substance of Kinship and the Head of the Hearth: Feeding, Personhood, and Relatedness among Malays in Pulau Langkawi. American Ethnologist 22(2):223-41.

\_\_\_

2000 Cultures of Relatedness: New Approaches to the Study of Kinship. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

# Carter, Ben

2003 The Chat Trap. The Guardian, 29 September.

# Charsey, Katherine, and Alison Shaw

2006 South Asian Transnational Marriages in Comparative Perspective. Global Networks 6(4):331-441.

# Cherlin, Andrew J.

2004 The Deinstitutionalization of American Marriage. Journal of Marriage and Family 66(4):848-61.

# Chia-Wen Lu, Melody

2005 Commercially Arranged Marriage Migration: Case Studies of Cross-Border Marriages in Taiwan. Indian Journal of Gender Studies 12(2&3):275-303

# Chock, Phyllis Pease

1987 The Irony of Stereotypes: Toward an Anthropology of Ethnicity. Cultural Anthropology 2(3):347-68.

# Chong, Dennis, and Anna-Maria Marshall

1999 When Morality and Economics Collide (Or Not) in a Texas Community. Political Behavior 21(2):91-121.

# Clements, Ron, and John Musker (directors).

1989 The Little Mermaid. 83 minutes. Walt Disney Pictures. USA.

# Cohen, Robin

1997 Global Diasporas: An Introduction. London: UCL Press.

# Constable, Nicole

1997 Maid to Order in Hong Kong: Stories of Filipina Workers. Ithica, New York: Cornell University.

2003a Romance on a Global Stage: Pen Pals, Virtual Ethnography, and "Mail Order" Marriages. Berkeley: University of California Press.

2003b A Transnational Perspective on Divorce and Marriage: Filipina Wives and Workers. Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power 10(2):163-180.

2005 Introduction: Cross-Border Marriages, Gendered Mobility, and Global Hypergamy. *In* Cross-Border Marriages: Gender and Mobility in Transnational Asia. N. Constable, ed. Pp. 1-16. Philadelphia: Pennsylvania Press.

2006 Brides, Maids, and Prostitutes: Reflections on the Study of 'Trafficked' Women. Portal 3(2):1-25.

-

2009 The Commodification of Intimacy: Marriage, Sex, and Reproductive Labor. Annual Review of Anthropology 38:49-64.

#### Coutin, Susan Bibler

2003 Cultural Logics of Belonging and Movement: Transnationalism, Naturalization, and US Immigration Politics. American Ethnologist 30(4):508-526.

# Curran, Melissa A., Ebony A. Utley, and Joel A. Muraco

2010 An Exploratory Study of the Meaning of Marriage for African Americans. Marriage & Family Review 46(5):346-365.

# De Munck, Victor C.

1996 Love and Marriage in a Sri Lankan Muslim Community: Towards a reevaluation of Dravidian Marriage Practices. American Ethnologist 23(4):698-716.

# del Rosario, Teresita C.

2005 Bridal Diaspora: Migration and Marriage among Filipino Women. Indian Journal of Gender Studies 12(2-3):253-274.

#### di Leonardo, Micaela

1986 The Female World of Cards and Holidays: Women, Families, and the Work of Kinship. Signs 12(3):440-453.

# Espiritu, Yen Le

2001 "We Don't Sleep around like White Girls Do": Family, Culture, and Gender in Filipina American Lives. Signs 26(2):415-440.

# Ezzy, Douglas

2000 Fate and Agency in Job Loss Narratives. Qualitative Sociology 23(1):121-134.

# Faier, Lieba

2007 Filipina Migrants in Rural Japan and Their Professions of Love. American Ethnologist 34(1):148-162.

2009 Intimate Encounters: Filipina Women and the Remaking of Rural Japan. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.

#### Farrer, James

2008 From "Passports" to "Joint Ventures": Intermarriage between Chinese Nationals and Western Expatriates Residing in Shanghai. Asian Studies Review 32(1):7-29.

# Florezak, Kristine L.

2004 An Exploration of the Concept of Sacrifice. Nursing Science Quarterly 17(3):195-200.

# Fortier, Anne-Marie

2000 Migrant Belongings: Memory, Space, Identity. Oxford, UK: Berg.

# Fresnoza-Flot, Asuncion

2009 Migration Status and Transnational Mothering: The Case of Filipino Migrants in France. Global Networks 9(2):252-270.

# Gambetta, D.

1988 Can We Trust? *In* Trust: Making and Breaking Cooperative Relations. D. Gambetta, ed. Pp. 213-238. New York: Blackwell.

# Geronimi, Clyde, Wilfred Jackson, and Hamilton Luske (directors).

1950 Cinderella. 74 minutes. Walt Disney Pictures. USA.

# Gibson, Katherine, Lisa Law, and Deirdre McKay

2001 Beyond Heroes and Victims: Filipina Contract Migrants, Economic Activism and Class Transformations. International Feminist Journal of Politics 3(4):365-386.

# Giddens, Anthony

1991 Modernity and Self-Identity: Self and Society in the Late Modern Age. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.

1992 The Transformation of Intimacy: Sexuality, Love and Eroticism in Modern Societies. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

# Glick Schiller, Nina, Linda Basch, and Nina Szanton Blanc

1995 From Immigrant to Transmigrant: Theorizing Transnational Migration. Anthropological Quarterly 68(1):48-63.

# Glodava, Mila, and Richard Onizuka

1994 Mail-Order Brides: Women For Sale. Fort Collins, Colorado: Alaken.

# Goode, William J.

1959 The Theoretical Importance of Love. American Sociological Review 24(1):38-47.

# Hatfield, Donald J.

2002 Fate in the Narrativity and Experience of Selfhood, a Case from Taiwanese *chhiam* Divination. American Ethnologist 29(4):857-887.

# Helin, Kaija, and Unni Å Lindström

2003 Sacrifice: An Ethical Dimension of Caring that Makes Suffering Meaningful. Nursing Ethics 10(4):414-27.

#### Hobsbawm, Eric

2003 [1983] Introduction: Inventing Traditions. *In* The Invention of Tradition. E. Hobsbawm and T. Ranger, eds. Pp. 1-15. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

# Hochschild, Arlie Russell

1983 The Managed Heart: Commercialization of Human Feeling. Berkeley: University of California Press.

2002 Love and Gold. *In* Global Woman: Nannies, Maids, and Sex Workers in the New Economy. B. Ehrenreich and A.R. Hochschild, eds. Pp. 15-30. New York: Metropolitan books.

# Holland, Dorothy C., et al.

1998 Identity and Agency in Cultural Worlds. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

#### Hsia, Hsia - Chuan

2007 Imaged and imagined threat to the nation: the media construction of the 'foreign brides' phenomenon' as social problems in Taiwan. Inter-Asia Cultural Studies 8(1):55-85.

# Immigration New Zealand

2005a Evidence of Partnership.

http://www.immigration.govt.nz/migrant/stream/live/partner/canimoveton z/whatisrequired/evidenceofpartnership.htm accessed 29 November, 2010.

\_\_\_

2005b New Zealand Partner.

http://www.immigration.govt.nz/migrant/stream/live/partner/canimoveton z/whatisrequired/nzpartner.htm accessed 29 November, 2010.

#### Inhorn, Marcia C.

2007 Loving Your Infertile Muslim Spouse: Notes on the Globalization of IVF and its Romantic Commitments in Sunni Egypt and Shia Lebanon. *In* Love and Globalization: Transformations of Intimacy in the Contemporary World. M.B. Padilla, J.S. Hirsch, M. Munoz-Laboy, R.E. Sember, and R.G. Parker, eds. Pp. 139-160. Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press.

# Jenkins, Richard

2002 Imagined But Not Imaginary: Ethnicity and Nationalism in the Modern World. *In* Exotic No More: Anthropology on the Front Lines. J. MacClancy, ed. Pp. 114-128. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

# Johnson-Hanks, Jennifer

2007 Women on the Market: Marriage, Consumption, and the Internet in Urban Cameroon. American Ethnologist 34(4):642-658.

# Kearney, Michael

1995 The Local and the Global: Anthropology of Globalization and Transnationalism. Annual Review of Anthropology 24:547-565.

# Keely, Charles B, and Bao Nga Tran

1989 Remittances From Labor Migration: Evaluations, Performance and Implications. International Migration Review 23(3):500-525.

# Kim, Jane

2011 Trafficked: Domestic Violence, Exploitation in Marriage, and The Foreign-Bride Industry. Virginia Journal of International Law 51(2):443-506.

#### Kunz, Rahel

2008 'Remittances are Beautiful'? Gender Implications of the New Global Remittances Trend. Third World Quarterly 29(7):1389-1409.

# Lauser, Andrea

2008 Philippine Women on the Move: Marriage Across Borders. International Migration Review 46(4):85-110.

# Leckie, Jacqueline

2002 The Complexities of Women's Agency in Fiji. *In* Women: Gender and Politics in the Asia-Pacific Region. B.S.A. Yeoh, P. Teo, and S. Huang, eds. Pp. 156-80. London: Routledge.

# Lewinson, Anne

2006 Love in the City: Navigating Multiple Relationships in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. City and Society 18(1):90-115.

# Lianos, Theodore P.

1997 Factors Determining Migrant Remittances: The Case of Greece. International Migration Review 31(1):72-87.

# Lipset, David

2004 Modernity Without Romance? Masculinity and Desire in Courtship Stories Told by Young Papua New Guinean Men. American Ethnologist 32(2):205-224.

# Lutz, Catherine, and Geoffrey M. White

1986 The Anthropology of Emotions. Annual Review of Anthropology 15:405-436.

# McAllister Groves, Juilan, and Kimberly A. Chang

1997 Romancing Resistance and Resisting Romance: Ethnography and the Construction of Power in the Filipina Domestic Worker Community in Hong Kong: Division of Social Science: The Hong Kong University of Science and Technology.

# McDonald, Maryon

1993 The Construction of Difference: An Anthropological Approach to Stereotypes. *In* Inside European Identities: Ethnography in Western Europe. S. MacDonald, ed. Pp. 219-237.Oxford: Berg Publishers.

# McKay, Deirdre

2007a Identities in a Culture of Circulation: Performing Selves in Filipina Migration. *In* Asian and Pacific Cosmopolitans: Self and Subject in Motion. K.M. Robinson, ed. Pp. 190-208. London: Palgrave Macmillan.

\_\_\_

2007b 'Sending Dollars Shows Feeling' - Emotions and Economies in Filipino Migration. Mobilities 2(2):175-194.

# Middelthon, Anne-Lise

2001 Interpretations of Condom Use and Nonuse Among Young Norwegian Gay Men: A Qualitative Study. Medical Anthropological Quarterly 15(1):58-83.

#### Nakamatsu, Tomoko

2005 Complex Power and Diverse Responses: Transnational Marriage Migration and Women's Agency. The Agency of Women in Asia.

\_\_\_

2003 International Marriage through Introduction Agencies: Social and Legal Realities of "Asian" Wives of Japanese Men. *In* Wife or Worker? Asian Women and Migration. N. Piper and M. Roces, eds. Pp. 181-203. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc.

# Nakonz, Jonas, and Angela Wai Yan Shik

2009 And all your problems are gone: religious coping strategies among Philippine migrant workers in Hong Kong. Mental Health, Religion & Culture 12(1)25-38.

# Narayan, Uma

1995 "Mail-Order" Brides: Immigrant Women, Domestic Violence and Immigration Law. Hypatia 10(1):104-119.

# Nonini, Donald M

2002 Introduction: Transnational Migrants, Globalization Processes, and Regimes of Power and Knowledge. Critical Asian Studies 34(1):3-17.

# Okely, Judith

1996 Own or Other Culture. London: Routledge.

# Ong, Aihwa

1996 Cultural Citizenship as Subject-Making: Immigrants Negotiate Racial and Cultural Boundaries. Current Anthropology 37(5):737-62.

#### Parkin, Robert

1997 Kinship: An Introduction to the Basic Concepts. Oxford, UK: Blackwell Publishers Ltd.

# Parkin, Robert, and Linda Stone.

2004 Kinship and Family: An Anthropological Reader. Malden, USA: Blackwell Publishing.

# Parreñas, Rhacel Salazar

2000 Migrant Filipina Domestic Workers and the International Division of Reproductive Labor. Gender and Society 14(4):560-581.

2005 Long Distance Intimacy: Class, Gender and Intergenerational Relations Between Mothers and Children in Transnational Families. Global Networks 5(4):317-336.

2008a Breaking the Code: Women, Labor Migration, and the 1987 Family Code of the Republic of the Philippines. *In* Gender and Globalization in Asia and the Pacific. K.E. Ferguson and M. Mironesco, eds. Pp. 176-194. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press.

2008b The Force of Domesticity: Filipina Migrants and Globalization. New York and London: New York University.

# Parreñas, Rhacel Salazar, and Lok C. D. Siu

2007 Introduction: Asian Diasporas - New Conceptions, New Frameworks. *In* Asian Diasporas: New Formations, New Conceptions. R.S.

Parreñas and L.C.D. Siu, eds. Pp. 1-29. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

# Patico, Jennifer

2009 For Love, Money, or Normalcy: Meanings of Strategy and Sentiment in the Russian-American Matchmaking Industry. Ethnos 74(3):307-330.

2010 From Modern Loves to Universal Passions: Ethnographies of Love, Marriage, and Globalization. Identities 17(4):372-386.

# Pe-Pua, Rogelia

2003 Wife, Mother, and Maid: The Triple Role of Filipino Domestic Workers in Spain and Italy. *In* Wife or Worker: Asian Women and Migration. N. Piper and M. Roces, eds. Pp. 157-180. Lanham, Maryland, US: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc.

# Peletz, Michael G.

2001 Ambivalence in Kinship Since the 1940s. *In* Relative Values: Reconfiguring Kinship Studies. S. Franklin and S. McKinnon, eds. Pp. 413-443. Durham & London: Duke University Press.

# Pessar, Patricia R., and Sarah J. Mahler

2003 Transnational Migration: Bringing Gender In. International Migration Review 37(3):812-846.

# Phizacklea, Annie

2000 Ruptures - Migration and Globalisation: Looking Back and Looking Forward. *In* Trans-nationalism and the Politics of Belonging. S. Westwood and A. Phizacklea, eds. Pp. 101-119. London and New York: Routledge.

# Pickering, Michael

2001 Stereotyping: The Politics of Representation. New York: Palgrave.

# Pinar, William F.

1997 Regimes of Reason and the Male Narrative Voice. *In* Representation and the Text: Re-Framing the Narrative Voice. W.G. Tierney and Y.S. Lincoln, eds. Pp. 81-115. Albany: State University of New York Press.

# Piper, Nicola, and Mina Roces

2003 Introduction: Marriage and Migration in an Age of Globalization. *In* Wife or Worker? Asian Women and Migration. N. Piper and M. Roces, eds. Pp. 1-12. Lanham, Maryland, US: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc.

# Pitcher, Linda M.

1998 "The Divine Impatience": Ritual, Narrative, and Symbolization in the Practice of Martyrdom in Palestine. Medical Anthropological Quarterly 12(1):8-30.

# Quah, Stella R.

2008 Families in Asia: Home and Kin. Second edition. Oxon: Routledge.

# Queen, Robin

2005 "How Many Lesbians Does it Take...": Jokes, Teasing, and the Negotiation of Stereotypes about Lesbians. Journal of Linguistic Anthropology 15(2):239-257.

# Quinn, Naomi

1982 "Commitment" in American Marriage: A Cultural Analysis. American Ethnologist 9(4):775-798.

# Ramirez, Marcela, Zlatko Skrbis, and Michael Emmison

2007 Transnational Family Reunions as Lived Experience: Narrating a Salvadoran Autoethnography. Identities 14(4):411-431.

# Ramos, Genoveva Evelyn

2001 The Phenomenon of Filpino Mail Order Brides, Sociology, University of Auckland.

#### Rebhun, L. A.

1999 For Love and For Money: Romance in Urbanizing Northeast Brazil. City & Society 11(2):145-164.

# Rodriguez Garcia, Dan

2006 Mixed Marriages and Transnational Families in the Intercultural Context: A Case Study of African-Spanish Couples in Catalonia. Journal of Ethnic and Migrant Studies 32(3)403-433.

# Rosenblatt, Paul C.

2003 Interviewing at the Border of Fact and Fiction. *In* Postmodern Interviewing. J.F. Gubrium and J.A. Holstein, eds. Pp. 893-909. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications Inc.

# Said, Edward

1978 Orientalism. New York: Random House, Inc.

# Sassen, Saskia

2006 Global Cities and Survival Circuits. *In* Global Dimensions of Gender and Carework. M.K. Zimmerman, J.S. Litt, and C.E. Bose, eds. Pp. 30-39. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

# Schaeffer-Grabiel, Felicity

2005 Planet-Love.com: Cyberbrides in the Americas and the Transnational Routes of U.S. Masculinity. Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society 31(2):332-356.

# Schneider, David

1984 A Critique of the Study of Kinship. Michigan, USA: University of Michigan.

#### Scuba Nurse

2011 Win a wife? WTF? *In* Well Behaved Women Rarely Make History. February 9, 2011. http://history-herstory-scubanurse.blogspot.com/2011/02/win-wife-wtf.html. Accessed 11 February, 2011.

# Shipper, Apichai

2010 Introduction: Politics of Citizenship and Transnational Gendered Migration in East and Southeast Asia. Pacific Affairs 83(1):11-29.

# Silvey, Rachel

2006 Consuming the Transnational Family: Indonesian Migrant Domestic Workers to Saudi Arabia. Global Networks 6(1):23-40.

# Snow, David A., and Leon Anderson

1987 Identity Work Among the Homeless: The Verbal Construction and Avowal of Personal Identities. American Journal of Sociology 92(6):1336-1371.

# So, Christine

2006 Asian Mail-Order Brides, the Threat of Global Capitalism, and the Rescue of the U.S. Nation State. Feminist Studies 32(2):395-453.

# Stark, Oded, and Robert E. B. Lucas

1988 Migration, Remittances, and the Family. Economic Development and Cultural Change 36(3):465-481.

# Stone, Linda

2004 The Demise and Revival of Kinship: Introduction. *In* Kinship and Family: An Anthropological Reader. R. Parkin and L. Stone, eds. Pp. 241-256. Malden, USA: Blackwell Publishing.

#### Suzuki, Nobue

2000 Between Two Shores: Transnational Projects and Filipina Wives in/from Japan. Women's Studies International Forum 23(4):431-444.

\_\_\_

2003 Transgressing "Victims": Reading Narratives of "Filipina Brides" in Japan. Critical Asian Studies 53(3):399-420.

\_\_\_

2004 Inside the Home: Power and Negotiation in Filipina-Japanese Marriages. Women's Studies 33(4):481-506.

2007 Marrying a Marilyn of the Tropics: Manhood and Nationhood in Filipina-Japanese Marriages. Anthropological Quarterly 80(2):427-454.

# Swensen, Clifford H., and Geir Trahaug

1985 Commitment and the Long-Term Marriage Relationship. Journal of Marriage and Family 47(4):939-945.

# Thai, Hung Cam

2002 Clashing Dreams: Highly Educated Overseas Brides and Low-Wage U.S. Husbands. *In* Global Woman: Nannies, Maids and Sex Workers in the New Economy. B. Ehrenreich and A.R. Hochschild, eds. Pp. 145-165. New York: Henry Holt and Company, LLC.

#### Trundle, Catherine

2010 Against the Gated Community: Contesting the 'Ugly American Dream' through Rural New Zealand Dreams. *In* Local Lives: Migration and the Politics of Place. B. Bönisch-Brednich and C. Trundle, eds. Pp. 31-48. Surrey: Ashgate Publishing Limited.

# Tseliou, Eleftheria, and Ivan Eisler

2007 "You" and "I", "Us" and "Them": A Systematic-Discursive Approach to the Study of Ethnic Stereotypes in the Context of British-Greek Heterosexual Couple Relations. Family Process 46(4):515-522.

# Tyner, James A.

2009 The Philippines: Mobilities, Identities, Globalization. New York: Routledge.

# Uslaner, Eric M.

2002 The Moral Foundations of Trust. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

# Venables, Emilie

2008 Senegalese Women and the Cyber Café: Online Dating and Aspirations of Transnational Migration in Ziguinchor. African and Asian Studies 7(4):471-490.

#### Vergara, Vanessa B. M.

2000 Abusive Mail-Order Bride Marriage and the Thirteenth Amendment. Northwestern University Law Review 94(4)1547-1550.

# Vertovec, Steven

2004 Migrant Transnationalism and Modes of Transformation. International Migration Review 38(3):970-1001.

# Weintraub, Jeff

1997 The Theory and Politics of the Public/Private Distinction. *In* Public and Private in Thought and in Practice: Perspectives on a Grand Dichotomy. J. Weintraub and K. Kumar, eds. Pp. 1-42. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

# Westwood, Sallie, and Annie Phizacklea

2000 Introduction: Trans-nationalism and the politics of belonging. *In* Trans-nationalism and the Politics of Belonging. S. Westwood and A. Phizacklea, eds. Pp. 1-16. London and New York: Routledge.

# Whitton, Sarah, Scott Stanley, and Howard Markman

2002 Sacrifice in Romantic Relationships: An Exploration of Relevant Research and Theory. *In* Stability and Change in Relationships. A.L. Vangelisti, H.T. Reis, and M.A. Fitzpatrick, eds. Pp. 156-181. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

#### Wilding, Raelene

2006 'Virtual' Intimacies? Families Communicating Across Transnational Contexts. Global Networks 6(2):125-142.

# Willis, Jerry W.

2007 Foundations of Qualitative Research: Interpretive and Critical Approaches. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.

# Wolf, Diane L.

1997 Family Secrets: Transnational Struggles Among Children of Filipino Immigrants. Sociological Perspectives 40(3):457-482.

# Worth, Heather, Alison Reid, and Karen McMillan

2002 Somewhere Over The Rainbow: Love, Trust and Monogamy in Gay Relationships. Journal of Sociology 38(3):237-253.

# Yanow, Dvora

2006 Thinking Interperatively: Philosophical Presuppositions and the Human Sciences. *In* Interpretation and Method: Empirical Research Methods and the Interpretive Turn. D. Yanow and P. Schwartz-Shea, eds. Pp. 5-26 New York: M.E. Sharpe, Inc.